Note from the Editor

Dystopian Furcations in Modern Literature
Kubilay Akman

Analysing and Mapping Urban Poverty of English Bazar Slum: An Approach of Micro Level Planning Perspective from a Developing Country (India)
Suman Paul

Assessing Women’s Autonomy in Santhal Community of Nepal’s Eastern Tarai
Krishna P Pandey

South Africa in Focus

Human Dignity as a Foundational Norm in the Understanding of Human Rights
Mashele Rapatsa

Good Government in Africa: What is the role of Bureaucratic Governance?
B.C. Basheka and M.P. Sebola

The South African Broadcasting Corporation in Championing Transparency and Accountability in Government: the Bigger they ARE the Harder they Fall
Ntwanano E Mathebula

Combating Climatic Risks and Vulnerability: Prospects and Challenges
Kola O. Odeku

Transforming the Mining Industry in South Africa: Issues, Challenges and Prospects
Kola O. Odeku and Olufunmilayo F. Odeku

Children’s Participation in School Sport at Tshwane, South Africa: Analysis of Psychosocial Influences, Eric Pule, Tonie Drotsky, Abel Toriola and Ntwanano Alliance Kubayi

Stock Theft Crime in a Rural Community in Limpopo, W. Maluleke, EE Obioha and JT Mofokeng

ISSN 1819-8465
The Official Journal of

Bangladesh Sociological Society
Committed to the advancement of sociological research and publication.
Note from the Editor

Let me begin with an apology for being late in uploading this issue. The reason, if it helps in absolving my failing, was simply the failure in time management. At the beginning of this year I got back to university teaching, leaving behind my short adventure as the “Director of Research and Knowledge Management” in a local research institute. The job title, particularly the “Knowledge Management” (wow!) bit, and the benefits should have kept me happy there but teaching is so intoxicating that no amount of power, being the “Director” and “managing” knowledge etc., could hold me there for long. But getting to a new university and having to organize a new department, the curricula and managing and editing another journal there were all eating into my personal time little by little. And soon I found that I was failing in my other and, perhaps, more rewarding ventures, like this journal and my personal forays into the world of fiction writing.

But late as I am, the July 2015 issue is finally ready with such an attractive set of papers that I decided give it a sub-title: “South Africa in Focus”. It is, thus, a very rich collection of articles on South Africa beginning with the concept of “human dignity” and “good governance” to as mundane a subject as “stock theft”, all centered on life in South Africa.

Mashele Rapatsa in the article on “Human Dignity as a Foundational Norm in the Understanding of Human Rights” begins with the assumption that the notion of human dignity is the yardstick from which the philosophy of human rights derives its strength. In South Africa, “there is a strong linkage between the justiciability of socio-economic rights and the notion of dignity”. This has been further strengthened by the necessity to redress “the imbalances of the past” and to “achieve fundamental freedoms and substantive equality”. This, the author feels, is yet to be realized “owing to notable triple challenges of poverty, unemployment and inequalities that make it impossible for the majority to meaningfully assert their dignity”.

B.C. Basheka and M.P. Sebola in their paper “Good Government in Africa: What is the role of Bureaucratic Governance?” raise the fundamental question of “good governance” and the role of bureaucracy in it. They feel that since good government and bureaucratic governance share the same ancestors it should not be difficult to achieve good governance through “democratic, honest and able” administrators. However, they argue that these must be placed on the “foundations” of African values.

Ntwanano Erasmus Mathebula goes a step further in “The South African Broadcasting Corporation in Championing Transparency and Accountability in Government: the Bigger they ARE the Harder they Fall” and puts the notion of “transparency” and “accountability” in the government to test in analyzing the role of South African Broadcasting Corporation as “a people centered, content driven, technology enabled, and a sustainable public broadcaster” particularly against the backdrop of “political interference”.

Climate change is the “buzz word” these days and no reputed journal can ignore the topic. BEJS has dealt with this topic earlier but here Professor Kola O. Odeku takes up the issue in relation to the rural settings of South Africa vis-à-vis the role played by the research activities taken up by the Department of Science and Technology through various rural universities. Odeku feels that the Department of Science and Technology is headed in the “right direction” in their effort to tackle climate change issues. Professor Odeku next teams up with Olufunmilayo F. Odeku to investigate the “issues, challenges and prospects” of the mining industry in South Africa. They look at the “legislative interventions that have been put in place, in time and space” as well as at the “various competing rights on mineral resources and the roles of all stakeholders and role players” in a challenging study of the industry.

Eric Pule, Tonie Drotsky, Abel Toriola and Ntwanano Alliance Kubayi a group of researchers from Tshwane University of Technology sought to analyze the “psychosocial influences” of Children’s Participation in School Sport. They found out from a study of 773 children that “primary school children were more actively involved in school sport than the secondary school children”. The overall results
showed that the children participate in school sports for “health improvement, enjoyment; socialisation and opportunity to bond with parents”.

The last of the studies on South Africa takes up the now notorious cases of “stock theft” that have plagued many African nations. This highly involving qualitative study done by W. Maluleke, EE Obioha, and JT Mofokeng of all the parties concerned identify that the contributory factors to stock theft as: “the slaughtering of stock to sell to butchery owners; the alleged involvement of SAPS [South African Police Service ] and Department of Justice: Gyiyan Magistrates Courts’ (DoJ: GMC) officials in stock theft crimes; the negligence of livestock owners; the unmarking of livestock; and, poor reporting when livestock gets stolen”. The researchers then offer a few recommendations and suggest some possible strategies to combat the problem.

The other three papers in this issue also cover new grounds. In the “Dystopian Furoctions in Modern Literature“ Kubilay Akman questions the very purpose of the “dystopian novels” like the 1984. He argues that these were primarily written to ward off communism and as such this variety literature ended with the demise of the socialist regimes in Russia and the Eastern Europe.

Suman Paul, a Professor of Geography, proposes a novel approach to study the slums and the spatial dimension of poverty through the use of maps. He uses a combination of municipality generated maps and high resolution satellite imaging to map out various aspects of poverty in the slums of an Indian city and recommends the approach for other such studies.

In the last of the papers, Krishna P Pandey offers a rare insight into the lives of the Santals, an indigenous community living in the eastern regions of Nepal. Defining women’s autonomy by three broad aspects such as “outside exposure, decision making and control over resources”, Pandey goes on to measure the level of Santal women’s autonomy and construct an index. Pandey notes remarkable results in terms of the first two factors and limited autonomy in terms of the third factor. However, he notes that “the reality of Santal women is the sum total of landlessness and ethnic backwardness resulting from extreme poverty and illiteracy as the major causes of constricted autonomy”.

This issue, thus, covers a very wide range of subjects and disciplines and I am sure will present an absorbing reading. I am particularly glad that I could present such a fascinating collection of materials on South Africa in one issue. In many of the previous issues articles from Nigeria used to so dominate the journal that, in my frustration at the lack of articles from Bangladesh, I once noted that instead of calling it the Bangladesh e-Journal, it may very well be called the Nigerian e-Journal of Sociology. South Africa then had a token presence in the journal. But I am extremely delighted that the contributions of South African scholars from so many universities have, indeed, provided the Bangladesh e-Journal of Sociology, with a truly international flavour. I welcome future articles from the large number of South African authors who have already contributed as much as from the new scholars who may find the e-Journal helpful.
Dystopian Furcations in Modern Literature*

KubilayAkman1

ABSTRACT: Modern Literature of 20th Century had provided several “dystopian furcations” in the History of Western Literature, namely represented by G. Orwell, A. Huxley, Y. Zamiatin and R. R. Bradbury most typically. What were the motivating factors behind these lines of Dystopia? In this paper, we are going to discuss the phenomenon of Dystopia in Modern Literature based on the critical heritage of modern social theory and philosophy (Frankfurt School, Walter Benjamin, Giorgio Agamben). Where does appear the differences between Utopia and Dystopia? Are the fictional Worlds of More, Campanella and Bacon entirely different than the dark illustrations by Orwell, Bradbury, Zamiatin and Huxley? Is there something common inside the imaginary “mechanisms” of utopian and dystopian fictions? These are the core questions we will discuss around this paper.

Keywords: dystopia, dystopian literature, science-fiction, Orwell Zamiatin, Huxley, Bradbury

Introduction

In this paper, the literary genre of dystopia will be discussed through a sociological approach. This discussion is not focused on literary theory or aesthetic dimensions of dystopian novels. This is actually much more focused on the political correspondences between dystopian texts and socio-political issues of their age. Dystopia is one of the concepts which have a discrepancy between its wide usage and reality in profound analysis. This paper may be considered as a modest attempt to fill this social scientific / theoretical void about dystopia.

---

* This paper was presented in the Cells / Going Against the Grain Conference, organized by the University of Banja Luka, June 2013. Special thanks to Prof. Michelle Gadpaille for her suggestions on this topic during the Conference.

1 Associate Professor at the Department of Sociology, University of Bingol, Turkey. Email: kubilayakman@gmail.com
Dystopian lines of 20th Century

Before discussing the sociological and political dimensions of dystopias we can decide to focus on three characteristic or typical samples of this genre. Based on the samples noted below, is it possible to analyze how this genre functions? What kind of “dark worlds” is described in these novels? What are the connections between these novels and reality? Also, what are the common points and differences between utopian and dystopian literature? Can we really talk about a furcation?

Let us first have a look at the important plot details of the Nineteen Eighty-Four (1949) by George Orwell, the English author who is famous for his dystopian/critical style:

*Winston Smith is the protagonist of 1984 and through his experience, the order of the year 1984 is explained as a dystopia. He is a member of “Outer Party” in this new order. Outer Party represents the middle class of 1984’s social stratification. Thought crime is a very dangerous issue in this dystopian social and political atmosphere and Thinkpol (Thought Police) from Miniluv (Ministry of Love) in Oceania seriously investigates the thought-criminals for the sake of social order. Inner Party (upper class) and Outer Party (middle class) members are under surveillance constantly by Telescreens, so there is no privacy at all in their lives. Big Brother is the leader of this totalitarian social/political order. The motto is: "Big Brother (BB) is watching you." Smith is working at Mintrue (Ministry of Truth) which produces and modifies the “truth”, continues, creates and changes the past, history, events. Etc. always, through some fake documents. When a “true” event has been changed, the original version of the document is sent to the “memory hole". In the social stratification of 1984, Proles (Proletariat) are the lowest class. One day, a love affair starts between Smith and Julia. Thought Police captures Winston and Julia. Winston is tortured during his interrogation. Winston is politically re-educated through tortures and finally accepted his obedience to Big Brother’s authority. 1*

*Brave New World* (1932) is an earlier dystopia by another English writer, Aldous Huxley, which describes a fantasy world much later than 1984, around 2540:

*This dystopia is based on the productivity values created by Ford. World State governs and organizes everything in this new world. There are some social castes with different abilities and skills created though some biological interventions, during the “production of children”. These castes are: Alpha, Beta, Gamma, Delta, Epsilon. In “Bokanovsky process” with some chemicals and medicines, the caste of the baby is arranged. So, the state can always foresee the percentage of population according to its official records. Parenthood and natural birth is highly blamed in this new social order. These are like dirty taboos for the society. The early education is based on hypnopedia (sleep-learning). The ideology of this dystopia is given to children and they are forced to accept their destiny in the conditioning process in their sleeps. People perform sex like a social activity and they widely consume soma, a drug keeps them away from melancholy, depression or any other negative psychological problem. The motto of society is: “Everyone belongs to everyone!”. In this social order, everybody is a part of the society, not belong to a family. There are neither families nor marriages. The dystopian order considers peoples and cultures outside it as “savages”. There is a reference to 20th Century with the names of characters: Henry Foster, Bernard Marx, LeninaCrowne, Herbert Bakunin, Polly Trotsky, Mustapha Mond, Etc. 2*

Russian author Yevgeny Zamyatin's *We* (1924) is a political dystopia that inspired *Brave New World* with its dark fiction:

---

People of We live in a state where all lives continue transparently. Human activities are watched easily by the authorities, there is no room for privacy. People are all named with some codes like D-503, R-13, O-90 and I-330. It is a widely digitalized and scientifically regulated dystopia. Bureau of Guardians watch everybody in order to prevent any rebellion against the State. Pleasures (especially) of people are very strictly arranged by authority and there is little un-organized free time in a day. The purpose is even to control and organize that free time some day. D-503 and I-330 meet in Ancient House, only non-transparent place in the State. I-330 confesses that she is a member of the secret organization against the One State. Their purpose is to destroy the wall that separates the State from the rest of world. D-503 goes out of the State through some tunnels starting from the Ancient House. D-503 has a “Great Operation”, which is a psychosurgical operation in order to prevent any possible negative psychological tendency against the order. D-503 spied I-330 and her organization to the Benefactor and they are sentenced to death by the authority.¹

What are common in these dystopia texts? Perhaps many things, but most importantly a dark environment based on collectivism, statism, totalitarianism, control, censorship, etc. Let us remember the publishing time periods of these samples: between 1924 and 1949. It is very clear and mentioned enough till today that this kind of dystopian literature has emerged as a critique of the then existing communist system in Russia and its periphery, which started from 1917 and continued until 1990s. So, this “nightmare” had nothing to do with any possible risk in the future. It was about something which already existed in the first half of 20th Century.

Dystopia or Literary Reflection of State Socialism?

Dystopia is defined as “an imagined place or state in which everything is unpleasant or bad, typically a totalitarian or environmentally degraded one. The opposite of Utopia” (Oxford Dictionary)². But are they really opposite of utopias? In order to understand the social basis for dystopias we should analyze the correlations between the realities of communist experience and their possible expressions in science fiction.

Karl Marx had talked about a temporary “dictatorship”. He said: “Between capitalist and communist society there lies the period of the revolutionary transformation of the one into the other. Corresponding to this is also a political transition period in which the state can be nothing but “the revolutionary dictatorship of the proletariat” (Marx, 1999: Chapter IV), Lenin following his teacher said: “The transition from capitalism to communism is certainly bound to yield a tremendous abundance and variety of political forms, but the essence will inevitably be the same: the dictatorship of the proletariat” (Lenin, 1999: Chapter II, 3).

Marx, Lenin and their followers were in line with the previous utopian tradition (More, Campanella, Bacon): a total organization of society and people, for the common good of everybody. Apparently

⁲ http://oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/dystopia
The word “utopia” was first used in the work by Thomas More, in 1516, as an ideal social project which is organized in an island. The term comes from “ou” (negative affix) and “topos” (place) in ancient Greek. So, literally it means “a place does not exist” (Omay, 2009). The problem is that there is an important difference between its existence and non-existence. When utopias come to exist and get blended with reality, then there is a problematic issue. As Adorno says, “The abstract utopia would be all too easily reconcilable with the most devious tendencies of society. That all human beings would resemble each other, is exactly what suits this latter. It regards factual or imagined differences as marks of shame, which reveal, that one has not brought things far enough; that something somewhere has been left free of the machine, is not totally determined by the totality” (Adorno, 2005: Chapter II, 66). So is the reality and “devious tendencies of society” captured in “utopias” in the 20th Century, especially in the case of Marxism. This is the main inspirational source for the majority of dystopian literature.

Peoples of the World have seen that this “dictatorship” does not disappear easily as said. There was a serious problem of basic human freedom in the communist bloc. In the first half of the 20th Century Orwell, Zamyatin, Huxley and others were criticizing the reality through a literary perspective. Minds of people were controlled through several ways in dystopian fictions. Governments were deciding everything without the willing contribution of individuals. For the common good of the state and its citizens the political authorities were deciding everything (Gerhard, 37). Individual thought or initiative lost its power in dystopian fiction, “we” took the place of “I” and the “collective” authority dominated over single individuals. According to Gerhard, “it is interesting that whenever a person in dystopia begins seeing oneself as an individual, he or she feels sick” (Gerhard, 39, 43). Sargent discussed that “many utopias are, from the perspective of individual freedom, dystopias. Some have this appearance because the author wants to emphasize a value seen to be in conflict with freedom. This value is usually equality, order, or security. It is possible to trace a pattern of the dominant values found in utopias. For example, there is virtually no concern with freedom in early utopias, except, sometimes, to deplore its growth. They are concerned with order, established hierarchy, and obedience. Nineteenth-century utopias were primarily concerned with equality, and while many of the authors clearly believed that an egalitarian social system would enhance personal freedom, this was a secondary concern. In the twentieth century most works have been written as dystopias (Sargent, 573). So, the lines between utopias and dystopias are not so concrete and sometimes blurry. If the loss of “individual freedom” is a measure to consider a text as dystopia, then it is not easy to find a non-dystopian work in the genre of utopia.

In dystopias there is a variation of “panopticon”. Panopticon “reverses the principle of the dungeon; or rather of its three functions, to enclose, to deprive of light and to hide-it, preserves only the first and eliminates the other two. Full lighting and the eye of a supervisor capture better than darkness, which
ultimately protected. Visibility is a trap” (Foucault, 1977: 200). In dystopian novels individuals are trapped in “visibility” by the State.

The dystopias are nightmare because there “the concept of individuality is vanishing—personal life merges with the social, human body and mind are appropriated according to the communal needs of the state” and “in a dystopian world, not only the state and its police apparatus fulfill the role of “disciplinary mechanisms,” regimenting the human body and permeating all layers of society, but ordinary people as well” (Gerhard, 101, 56). However, if there are a lot of common elements between utopias and dystopias, what makes one a dream and the other a nightmare?

**Dystopias: Conditional Nightmares**

The question is, rather, what makes a dystopia a nightmare? After Agamben we know that the sovereignty takes “camp” as a political model in modern societies. As he says: “The camp – as the pure, absolute, and impassable biopolitical space (insofar as it is founded solely on the state of exception) – will appear as the hidden paradigm of the political space of modernity, whose metamorphoses and disguises we will have to learn to recognize” (Agamben, 72, 73). However, today there are not dystopian critiques against this camp model, as there were classical dystopias against communist regimes.

I do not intend to rely on a “conspiracy theory” but it is clear enough that, single dystopian texts of the first half of 20th Century and their arguments overlapped with the political needs of the capitalist and democratic West. Otherwise, it is not possible to explain why this genre appeared in a particular period and disappeared with communism. On the other hand, it is also interesting that there are no dystopian representations of individualism, the so called Western democratic values and freedoms, since any political systems or values may be dream or nightmare to different kind of political identities and social subjects / actors. We cannot say that something is internationally and universally “good” or “bad”. Every social, cultural, political case is dependent on some conditions. There is no “nightmare” for everybody or “dream” for everybody.

When we look from this point of view, the Western audience is seriously affected by losing their individual freedoms. Being a part of a collective, a community, a totality? No way! However, “freedom” is one of the most romantic and ambiguous philosophical words in the world. If these suggestions are to be accepted, then the argument of dystopian literature is based on pure, liberal and individualistic ideological fears. This is why it is “conditional”. It only existed under the “dangers” against liberal concepts, when the danger (i.e. communism) disappeared; this genre has lost its meaning and basis.

**Conclusion**

After this short discussion we have seen that dystopian literature is not the critical view of general human tendencies. This was like a particular response against the challenges of communist state. The target of the critique of dystopian novels was totalitarian state socialism. When this social and political
model, communism disappeared, dystopia genre became weaker. Most interestingly, a serious
dystopia of individualism has not been written yet. Why? Maybe, because the dominant discourse has
no problem with individual rights and freedoms, at least on the surface. However, from another point of
view, another dystopian situation can be discussed as well. Perhaps individuality and freedom exist as
a different kind of nightmare which finds some popular expressions in the reality-shows rather than
sophisticated literary texts. So, the biggest furcation may be the shift of “dystopian” experiences from
literature towards TV screens, quite suitable to the current level of “spectacle society”.

References
Adorno, Thodor (2005), Minima Moralia, http://www.marxists.org/reference/archive/adorno/1951/mm
Agamben, Giorgio (1998), Home Sacer: Sovereign Power and Bare Life, Stanford University Press,
Stanford, California
University, Chico
Analysing and Mapping Urban Poverty of English Bazar Slum: An Approach of Micro Level Planning Perspective from a Developing Country (India)

Suman Paul1

Abstract: In this paper, an approach has been made for analyzing and mapping poverty. The main drive for developing such an approach is to address the neglected aspect of the spatial dimension of poverty since in most cases the indicators chosen for poverty rely on household data. Such data if spatially analyzed are usually aggregated to administrative units such as neighbourhoods or wards. Therefore the spatial heterogeneity within the administrative unit is hidden. For target interventions, detailed spatial information is needed on poverty as a multidimensional phenomenon at a disaggregated level. The study demonstrates an approach to address the neglected aspect of the spatial dimension of poverty, based on a case study of the Nicher Para Slum located in the Ward no.9 of English Bazar municipality in the Maldah district of West Bengal. It is integrating locally available datasets on poverty relevant issues from several municipal departments with information extracted from a recent high resolution satellite image. The indicators identified and mapped are dwelling size, building density, lack of proper road network, poor structural quality of buildings and access to water and sanitation. Analysis is done at both disaggregated and aggregated levels (using data from the census and primary survey) to demonstrate how data aggregation can hide spatial variation of poverty but also to examine the robustness of the selected spatial indicators. The results at the disaggregated level clearly define the nature of vulnerability to poverty. For some areas, the main issue is e.g. structural quality of buildings, while for others it is either access to proper sanitation and/or access to water supply. This approach has potential by using locally available datasets in combination with satellite image data to provide spatially detailed information usable for both planning and monitoring poverty intervention.

Keywords: poverty, resolution, disaggregated, monitoring.

1 Assistant Professor, Post Graduate Dept. of Geography, Acharya B. N. Seal College, West Bengal, India. Pin-736101. E-mail: suman.krish.2007@gmail.com
Introduction

Eradication of poverty is one of the Millennium Development Goals (MDG’s), the target is to halve the proportion of people whose income is less than $1.25 a day, by 2015 (UN/DESA, 2006). Presently, more than a billion people in the developing world live on less than $1.25 a day, with an increasing number and proportion of poor people living in urban areas. Even though efforts are made to localize urban poverty in many developing cities, the scarcity of relevant data, coupled with lack of both human and financial resource for data collection and analysis is a significant constraint to target interventions. Poverty is multidimensional, thus measuring it presents a number of challenges. Beyond low income, there is low human, social and financial capital. The most common approach to measuring poverty is quantitative, money-metric measures which use income or consumption to assess whether a household can afford to purchase a basic basket of goods at a given point in time. The basket ideally reflects local tastes, and adjusts for spatial price differentials across regions and urban or rural areas in a given country. Money-metric methods are widely used because they are objective, can be used as the basis for a range of socio-economic variables, and it is possible to adjust for differences between households, and intra-household inequalities.

Despite these advantages, money-metric poverty measures have some shortcomings. Survey designs vary significantly between countries and over time, making comparability difficult. Some use income based measures, other consumption. Decisions about how to value housing, homegrown food and how to account for household size and composition all affect poverty estimates. If not properly adjusted, monetary measures can underestimate urban poverty because they do not make allowance for the extra cost of urban living (housing, transport, and lack of opportunity to grow one’s own food).

Income or consumption measures also do not capture many of the dimensions of poverty. For example, in the urban context, the urban poor rely heavily on the cash economy thus making them more vulnerable to fluctuations in income, and there are severe environmental and health hazards due to crowded living conditions in urban slums, and no tenure security. Other aspects of poverty, both rural and urban, which are multidimensional relate to access to basic services such as water, sewage, health and education, and a safety net to mitigate hard times. Measuring urban poverty can be carried out using a number of approaches summarized below.

Regardless of the methodology chosen, the data should ideally be comparable across cities, and allow for disaggregation at the intra-city level. This will capture vast differences between the poor in small towns and mega cities, or between urban slum areas within a given city.

*Income or consumption measures* are based on data that assess whether an individual or household can afford a basic basket of goods (typically food, housing water, clothing, transport, etc.). Consumption is generally considered to be a better measure than income because incomes tend to fluctuate over time; there are problems of under-reporting (particularly income derived from the private
Money metric measures can be adjusted to account for the higher cost of living in urban areas when measuring poverty.

*Unsatisfied basic needs index* approach defines a minimum threshold for several dimensions of poverty classifying those households who do not have access to these basic needs. They include characteristics such as literacy, school attendance, piped water, sewage, adequate housing, overcrowding, and some kind of caloric and protein requirement. If a household is deficient in one of the categories, they are classified as having unsatisfied basic needs.

*Asset indicators* have been used increasingly with the Demographic and Health Surveys (DHS), a standardized survey now administered in approximately 50 countries. A range of variables on the ownership of household assets are used to construct an indicator of household’s socio-economic status. These assets include: a car, refrigerator, television, dwelling characteristics (type of roof, flooring, toilet), and access to basic services including clean water and electricity.

*Vulnerability* approach defines vulnerability as a dynamic concept referring to the risk that a household or individual will experience an episode of income or health poverty over time, and the probability of being exposed to a number of other risks (violence, crime, natural disasters, being pulled out of school). Vulnerability is measured by indicators that make it possible to assess a household’s risk exposure over time through panel data. These indicators include measures of: physical assets, human capital, income diversification, links to networks, participation in the formal safety net, and access to credit markets. This kind of analysis can be quite complex, requiring a specially designed survey.

**Study Area**

English Bazar municipality of West Bengal, India has been chosen for conducting this empirical study to analyse and mapping of urban poverty among the slum households within the city boundary. As per census of India, 2001, English Bazar with total population of 1, 61, 456 has been identified as one of the Class – I cities in India.

English Bazar is located at 88° 25’ East longitudes and 24° 52’ North latitudes in West Bengal state. The city covers nearly 13.63 sq. km. lies along the Mahananda River making its eastern boundary. North-Eastern Railway (headed to New Jalpaiguri) line about 30 km. away from Farakka and 135 km. away to Siliguri and being accessed to NH-34 and SH-10. The city is divided into 25 wards. English Bazar as district headquarters and an important township in North Bengal, thousands of people commute this place (as source of origin and destination both) everyday for different purposes.

Considering this fact, the city has achieved sufficiency in providing urban facilities in order to cope with varied demand and expectations of increasing slum population. But the number of slum population in this municipality is increasing at huge rate in every census date and the proportion of slum population
to total population is 36 per cent (Census of India, 2001). As, 11,992 households spacing over the 15 wards of English Bazar municipality, it is quite impossible

Figure 1: Location of English Bazar Municipality in India
to study the whole. For this Ward no. 9 of English Bazar municipality has been chosen which is located in the extreme eastern part of this municipality. The validations behind the choice of the study are:

- Ward No. 9 of English Bazar Municipality is very close (5 km.) to the international boundary (Bangladesh).
- Household Density is high and Family Size is 6.7 in Average.
- Migration Rate has been very high during last 15 Years and 85.2 per cent of the population are migrants from different places (41.5 per cent from Bangladesh).
- Most of the Settlement of this Slum are facing the problem of Water Logging (Urban Flooding) during 4 – 5 months of the year (34 Per cent).
- Old and Youth Dependency Ratio is also high (54.4 Per cent).
- Literacy Level is very poor (50.3 Per cent are illiterate).

The Study basically tried mapping the condition of Poverty Pocket located in Ward no. 9 of English Bazar Municipality and its access to basic services by the slum population. Based on research problem the following research objectives of the study were evaluated with the use of GIS and Remote Sensing for the following:

- To assess the composition (Age-sex composition, education level and nature of migration) of slum population of Ward No. 9 of English Bazar Municipality.
- To find out the nature of access to basic services (drinking water, sanitation and solid waste) by the slum population of Ward No. 9 of English Bazar Municipality and
- Finally, prepare a comprehensive poverty map of slum households of Ward No. 9 of English Bazar Municipality.

**Review of Literature**

Traditionally approaches of measuring poverty have been focusing on income and consumption (monetary dimension of poverty), while recently poverty is understood as a multidimensional phenomenon focusing on multiple sources of deprivation in poverty areas (Martinez-Martin, 2005). Those areas are characterized by overcrowding, insufficient water supply, sanitation and infrastructure, problems of health and nutrition, limited access to education, as well as insecurity, exposure to hazard, deficient social relations, etc. (Turkstra and Raithelhuber, 2004). As a multidimensional phenomenon urban poverty is also spatially heterogeneous since poor people tend to be clustered in specific places. Therefore it is important to capture the spatial heterogeneity and the substantial variation of poverty areas to know better where the poor are and how they are distributed throughout the city. Targeting of the poor depends significantly on how poverty is conceptualized, measured and analyzed within a specific local context. To be able to locate the urban poor and adequately profile them for target intervention requires defining, identifying and understanding areas of poverty not only on their commonalities but also on their diverse characteristics in terms of social, economic and physical conditions in a local context. In principle, there are three main approaches of analyzing poverty depending on the availability of data (Zeller et al., 2006), namely the construction of
a poverty line, rapid appraisal and participatory appraisal methods or construction of a weighted poverty index (combining qualitative and quantitative indicators).

One recent study presented by Baud et al. (2006), shows the relevance of mapping urban poverty on sub-city level in Delhi (India), comparing the different wards by conceptualizing poverty by an index of multiple deprivation. The potential of recent very-high resolution satellite images (providing spatial resolutions of less than one meter) to disaggregate poverty further than to administrative levels of neighbourhood or wards has been explored by Lemma et al. (2006). Very-high-resolution satellite images supported by local knowledge, field observations and available local data can provide information on the location of poverty areas. The integration of these datasets in a GIS can generate a wealth of information on urban poverty. The advantage of such an approach is that it is locally generated, and thus easier for institutional embedding. Further, the use of very-high resolution images as backdrop images for ‘putting the poor on the map’, is an important aspect for gaining political support and communicating results to non-technical audiences at the local level (Turkstra and Raithelhuber, 2004).

**Materials and Methods**

The study is based on the primary data collected through the intensive field survey among the slum households located in Ward No. 9 of English Bazar Municipality. The primary information is supplemented with secondary data whenever is needed. To estimate a quantitative weight of a
variable (i.e. area in sq. m., land ownership, settlement age etc.) has been assigned to make a comprehensive rank of slum households.

Sample Design and Data Collection
In order to access the nature of poverty leading to the variation in development among slum households 325 households have been taken for primary survey. The municipal ward has been selected from eastern part of the city (see figure 1 and 2b). 325 households out of thirty 929 households have been selected for purposive sampling. The information regarding age-sex composition, educational level, nature of migration, livelihood pattern and access to basic services has been collected non-partially which were ensured through field investigation. The entire field survey was conducted during June, 2012 and collected data have been analysed.

Adoption of Statistical Techniques
For the purpose of the present study both qualitative and quantitative methods have been adopted. However, in quantitative analysis both simple and standard statistical techniques have been used to infer the facts. For the assessment of vulnerability to poverty, qualitative analysis based on unequal weightage indexing has been taken into consideration.

Results
Composition of Slum Population
Among 929 Slum households, 325 households (35 per cent) has been surveyed to get the status of population living in this poverty pocket. Selection has been done on the basis of settlement age which has at least more than 5 years of residency.
Dependency Ratio

It has been observed that (Figure no.3a), 45.6 per cent slum population are under the working force out of which 39 per cent are working in different sectors. The youth dependency and old dependency among the surveyed population are 28.6 and 26.8 per cent respectively. The study reveals that the area has a lesser amount of working force which can increase the purchasing power of the population. As a result, per capita incomes as well as per capita expenditure of the population are also very low. It is a concern for the working force that the amount of income is mostly utilized for education (youth dependency) and medical (old dependency) expenses.

Level of Education

Scenario of education is not good among the surveyed population of Ward No. 9 of English Bazar Municipality. The percentage of illiterate population is 49.7 out of which female are dominating (26.3 per cent). Only 14.7 per cent of populations are educated up to Madhyamik (secondary level) and above. The majority of the population is educated up to primary level (up to class IV) while 15.2 per cent population is educated up to class VIII.

This picture clearly shows the importance of education among the slum population. Most heads of household explain their apathy towards education of girl child as their destiny is marriage. On the other hand, for the male child they are very much engaged as child labour and associated with different unorganized and hazardous activities.

Nature of Migration

From the figure 3c, it has been seen that out of total surveyed population 84.2 per cent are migrants. The majority of the migrants come from Bangladesh (figure 3d). Since the majority of them have already migrated they are planning to stay here permanently. The respondents have cited the
following reasons for migration:

- Acute poverty in Bangladesh,
- Better job opportunities in India,
- For better education of children,
- People belonging to the Hindu community find it unsafe to stay there and
- House rent is cheaper in Kolkata compar to Bangladesh.

Livelihood Pattern

The majority of the working children fall in the category of unskilled labourer (38 per cent) followed by 13-15 years, while 14% children are aged about 10-12 years. Though a person above 14 years is not regarded as a child according to the Child Labour Prohibition Act, Factory’s Act 1964, it inevitably denies their rights as per the Fundamental Rights ensured by the Convention of Rights of Child. These children are not entitled to any kind of leave. They work on the basis of “no work, no pay”. Though the percentage of children working for 9-12 hours is not high (figure 3f), it should be taken into consideration.

![Nature of Livelihood](image1.png)

**Figure 3e – Nature of Livelihood**

![Age of Joining at Work](image2.png)

**Figure 3f – Age of Joining at Work**

It is obvious that whatever little that they earn, there is no scope for them to save for themselves as they contribute to their family expenditure. It is evident from the above facts that there is a strong prevalence of child labour. It is alarming to note that, 83% of parents do not think their surrounding environment safe for their children. Because of their vulnerable age group and low levels of education and illiteracy these children are pushed into the world of exploitation. Among the adolescent boys and girls, addiction to *ganja* is increasing.

Availability of Basic Services

Access to Sanitation

There is no underground sewerage system in the English Bazar at present. The need is felt to construct a sewerage network. For this, planning and designing work will be taken up on urgent basis.
At present cleaning of septic tank or borehole latrines is done by the municipality on the basis of payment received from the citizen. Available drains (pucca and kancha) is 4.30 km. Existing main channel drains and all other connecting drains (kancha / pucca) to be renovated and upgraded for disposal of drainage water into existing outfall – drains / canal. The key issues are mentioned below:

- Promptness of service to be improved.
- Covered sewerage network must be developed to avoid water borne diseases.

**Access to Sanitation**

- Covered sewerage network must be developed to avoid water borne diseases.

**Access to Safe Drinking Water**

- Available hour of water supply is 5 per day which needs to be increased.
- Per capita water supplied to be improved to 135 lpcd gradually.
- Drinking water quality is good but iron content is high.
- Provision for surface water supply.

**Access to Solid Waste Disposal**

Existing solid waste disposal system to be scientifically upgraded providing collection of garbage from every household regularly, segregation of municipal solid waste and proper disposal of municipal waste. At present solid waste generated in the area are around 300 gms./ capita / day. Solid wastes are primarily collected by tri-cycle vans and transported through vehicles to land fill site located.
between Maldah and English Bazar. Street sweeping has not yet been started in the Municipality. The key issues are as follows:

- Daily door to door collection.
- Segregation at source in separate bins.
- Shortage of infrastructure.
- Sweeping of streets.
- After segregation transporting to either vermi composed plant or to sanitary landfill sites.

**Analysis and Mapping of Urban Poverty**

For implementing the set of indicators, easterly located urban slum has been selected (see figure 1). Based on the interpretation guidelines suspected area of poverty has been delineated. But, visual image interpretation could not determine ultimately whether this area is occupied by poor households. Further evidence was needed to verify this classification, using locally available data sources. The location points of Nicher Para slum is in flood prone areas greatly facilitated data extraction of the pocket of poverty. Figure 2b illustrates the clustering of the locations of the slum households in the flood prone areas and locations identified from the image interpretation using the morphological indicators.
The selected data (figure 3a – 3f) represent characteristics of the poverty pockets in terms of their dependency ratio, educational level, migration and livelihood pattern. The data was then filtered to select only those areas equal or greater than 100m². As a consequence some areas on the map (see figure 5) where there are no poverty pockets, but there are some clustering of data, are those polygons of less than 100m². The total number of poverty pockets is 84 and accounted for 52.5 ha (12%) of the total land area of the Nicher Para slum under focus. The smallest area is 0.08 ha while the largest is 3.3 ha. For further analysis at a disaggregated level, the data were integrated with households and is able to provide both spatial and non-spatial information on households’ characteristics. The major limitation of using the spatial and non-spatial data was the time difference and incompleteness of the dataset. In analysing the issue of water and sanitation the spatial and non-spatial data was extracted according to households.

This distinction had to be made to give a better overview of the living conditions in the identified poverty pockets, using the important aspect of water, sanitation and waste disposal. Analysing the first category, the percentage of households without piped water located within the poverty pockets is 16%. The poverty pockets with the most households without piped water were found in the Nicher Para slum with 88% and 38% respectively.

The moderate correlation of the data can be explained by several reasons, from the census data only dwelling of less than 20m² were derived while using for the visual interpretation 25 m². Another reason can be attributed to the time difference of 5 years (between the census and the satellite image). For the barangays of San Nicholas Proper and Pahina San Nicholas no poverty pockets have been delineated, while the indicators derived from the census point to poverty which is not spatially clustered. Poverty is most pronounced in Ermita, having 27% of the area delineated as pockets of poverty as well 53% of substandard housing size and 15% substandard housing quality. The census data provide a general indication which barangays are on average more effected by poverty relevant issues, while spatial variation within them is hidden. Using the employed set of indicators pockets of poverty could be detected leaving out poverty which is not spatially clustered.

**Conclusion**

The main thrust of this study was to develop an approach for mapping spatial indicators of poverty at a disaggregated level to make spatial heterogeneity within administrative unit visible. To support such an analysis, detailed spatial information is needed on poverty. A set of indicators was developed with the assistance of local experts and stakeholders reflecting poverty aspects of morphology, location and living conditions. Indicators related to morphology and locations were used to find pockets of poverty while indicators on living conditions gave insights into the diversity of these areas. The analysis of morphology was operationalised by indicators on size of dwellings, density characterised by the extreme clustering of roof coverage, lack of proper road network characterised by irregular layout of settlements and non-visibility of access roads, poor structural quality of buildings regarding roof material.
These indicators were analysed using a very-high resolution satellite image. The criteria used on the image were based on the interpretation elements of colour, texture, pattern, shape and size. The other relevant datasets to assist in the identification were the point locations. The integrated datasets could provide detailed spatial data for identifying poverty pockets. The results of data analysis at such a disaggregated level have shown where the critical poverty areas are located and identified critical issues of sanitation and access to water supply affecting these areas. The critical issues identified showed clearly that poverty is multidimensional in nature.

Analysis based on the data integration and correlation of the results at the disaggregated and aggregated levels gave credence to the fact that spatial variation can be hidden when data is aggregated. The results of the data analysis at the aggregated level have proven the robustness of the selected indicators in analysing poverty at the disaggregated level. However, from the analysis it was apparent how aggregation can mask variation of poverty within the selected slum since, poverty can be not localized and is averaged within one area. The specific areas (pockets of poverty) and their spatial extent were clearly visible at the disaggregated level. The combination of both, analysing poverty relevant indicators on administrative sub-city units in combination with localizing the specific pockets of poverty has good potential to assist in better targeting interventions.

References


Assessing Women's Autonomy in Santhal Community of Nepal’s Eastern Tarai

Krishna P Pandey¹

Abstract: Women’s autonomy is one of the highly debated areas of study in social sciences. The researchers in this area have developed varieties of indicators to measure women’s autonomy. This research focuses on the diverse aspects of Santhal women living in eastern plains of Nepal. Three broad aspects of Santhal women for autonomy – outside exposure, decision making and control over resources – have been identified. The remarkable finding of the study clearly states that Santhal women exercise reasonable level autonomy with respect to first two aspects - outside exposure and decision making – and limited autonomy with respect to control over resources. Ultimately, the reality of Santhal women is the sum total of landlessness and ethnic backwardness resulting from extreme poverty and illiteracy as the major causes of constricted autonomy.

Keywords: autonomy, freedom of movement, decision making, autonomy index

Background
In its simplest form, autonomy implies the freedom or ability to make decisions on a given matter, or the right to exercise of choice. Autonomy is the capacity to manipulate one’s personal environment and the ability – technical, social and psychological – to obtain information and to use it as the basis for making decisions about one’s private concerns and those of one’s intimates (Dyson and Moore, 1983). Autonomy differences can exist at several levels – by region, by income, and by caste/ethnicity etc. Visaria (1996)

¹ PhD research scholar in Sociology at South Asian University, New Delhi. Email: Krishnapandey40@yahoo.com
focuses on three aspects of autonomy, that are – decision making, freedom of movement, and domestic autonomy. Jejeebhoy (1995) also proposes control over material and social resources; Women’s position within the home and knowledge, opportunities and alternatives available to women as three critical components of autonomy with Leela Visaria. But, Vlassoff (1996) uses four items in her autonomy scale: level of exposure to the outside world, choice of marriage partner, dowry and domestic decision-making. Basu (1996) identifies five determinants of the level of female autonomy in south Asian context especially with reference to the degree of freedom, ability and gender equality in decision making and capacity to impose the decisions on other acknowledged decision makers. It is evident that there is not a single autonomy scale, which is universal to measure it. The concept is contextual and should be thought in the ground of broad socio-cultural setting of the concerned community.

Nepal’s Census of 1991 enumerated Santhal and Santhal language speaking people separately but Censuses of 2001 and of 2011 have treated them as a single ethnic group (see respective census reports). Santhals themselves now agree that these two titles are not different but different names for a same group and they have their own language called Santhali. Government of Nepal enlisted Santhals under both indigenous/nationalities and Dalit categories without their interest to join in Dalit category. Their disinterest to be called as Dalit is because they do not fall under hierarchical Hindu caste framework and are not also treated as "untouchable" by others except few Madeshi groups.

The total of Santhal and Santhal speaking population was 33,332 in Nepal whereas 94.5% of their total population was found only in Jhapa and Morang for the year 1991. In census 2001, a total of 42,698 (0.19% of total population) of Santhal population were enumerated. Out of total Santhal population, almost 98% are in Eastern Development Region and almost 93% are in Jhapa and Morang district. This shows that Santhal population is almost clustered in two districts of eastern Terai of Nepal. Their literacy rate is 25.84%. Majority of them are cited as Hindu (83%) and a significant proportion (5.8%) as Christians. But Janajatis, by definition, requires religious background other than Hindu in Nepalese context. The religious practices and rituals of Santhals do not match with Hindu norms and values. This type of population composition best supports the fact that Santhal is an indigenous/nationality and a minority group of Nepal's eastern Terai.

**Problem envisaged**

Women’s autonomy in its broadest sense includes the major principles of empowerment. Women’s capacity of decision making in private and public life is related to their control over resources. Women of developing countries like Nepal have different experiences than their counterparts in developed countries in terms of making informed decisions and implementing their decisions in their surrounding environment. The primary problem is the women’s access to decision making in different domains of their lives. Their access to decision making with regard to reproductive issues does or does not have same significance as compared to other household errands and economic activities. The second
problem is the number of domains women can exercise their right to make decisions. This is related to the complexity of triple roles of women and public-private dichotomy.

*Morgan and Niroula (1996)* find autonomy differentials in two different settings of Nepal. Cultural background of a woman can influence her status in the society. Kinship structure and marriage pattern are major among other factors that can contribute to women’s autonomy. Santhal community of Nepal practices patriarchal family structure and patrilineal decent system (*Bista, 1967*). This dominance of patriarchal ideology among Santhals provides more authority to the male members. Problem of autonomy is thus constricted by male members of the community in spite of the assumption that indigenous women have greater chance of freedom of choice as compared to the non-indigenous women in Nepal.

Women’s autonomy and status are not the same as commonly understood. Autonomy implies capacity to impose one's own interest over others while decision making, whereas status refers more to respect and recognition rather than power. So, increased autonomy may lead to higher status but higher status may no necessarily lead to higher level of autonomy. For example, Morgan and Niroula cite that for Muslim women, *Purdah* (veil) may provide higher respect and pride but constricts freedom of choice in life chances. So, studying women’s autonomy, especially of women from marginalised indigenous Santhal community can provide a complex picture of women’s social position on the backdrop of right to choose and not to choose particular opportunities. The proposed study tries to understand women’s autonomy in Santhal community in context of their own socio-cultural setting.

**Conceptual Framework**

Conceptually, analysis of autonomy has been carried out into three tiers. The first is autonomy dimension. Autonomy dimension is the broadest framework of analysis based on socio-economic lives of women characterised by eight most common variables. Here, four autonomy dimensions have been

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Socio-economic setting</th>
<th>Dimensions of autonomy</th>
<th>Autonomy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Current age</td>
<td>Freedom of movement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Sex of children</td>
<td>Freedom in DM within Household</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Household headship</td>
<td>Control over family resources</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Literacy</td>
<td>Freedom in DM in RB</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Type of Family</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Control over land</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Figure 1: Conceptual framework*
identified. These include:

a) Freedom of movement (outside exposure) b) Freedom in decision making within household
c) Control over family resources and d) Freedom in decision making in reproductive
behaviour.

These dimensions are not measurable in themselves. For this, few measurable indicators for each
dimension have been proposed. These indicators are measured using standard statistical methods
with the help of structured questionnaire.

Total ten indicators have been identified for four autonomy dimensions. Visit to natal home (kin) and
Mela\(^1\) (public cultural ceremonies) for at least one night by self-decision are two indicators used to
measure freedom of movement. Similarly, decision of buying food items for household consumption
and clothes for household use, and selling domestic productions have been considered as three major
indicators for freedom in decision making within household. The third dimension of autonomy is control
over family resources, which is measured by ownership over animals/poultry and ever taken
institutional credit or involved in savings. Lastly, freedom in decision making in reproductive behaviour
is measured by using two indicators: decision to use or not to use contraception and decision to
choose number of children. Ultimately, autonomy differentials is analysed on the basis of literacy, age,
number of children, headship and labour force participation or economic activity of respondents.
Finally, the overall autonomy level has been measured in an ordinal scale consisting of three levels.

**Measuring women's autonomy**

This article is one of the efforts to construct a composite index to measure Santhal women's
autonomy. The questions were designed to measure using ordinal scale. Women's Autonomy Index
(WAI) is the cumulative scale of ten already identified indicators for four dimensions. All indicators
comprise their own variables to measure the autonomy but these variables only explain the ranking
relation.

**Freedom of movement**

Freedom of movement is studied with the help of two indicators: freedom of visiting natal home and
freedom of visiting *Mela*. The indicators for freedom of movement have been classified into five ordinal
categories. They are:

a) Never visited due to lack of permission b) Never visited but not due to lack of permission c) Ever
visited but with permission in most of the cases d) Ever visited with permission or without permission
equally and, e) Ever visited without permission in most of the cases.

In this context the first and last categories are defined lowest and highest levels with regard to freedom
of movement. The three categories between the first and the last refer that women who fall under
these categories are able to enjoy limited freedom of movement.

\(^1\) *Mela* refers to the cultural gatherings mainly organised by a community.
Table 1: Freedom of movement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Levels of freedom of movement</th>
<th>Freedom of movement index (in %)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>35.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>47.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>17.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100 (312)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: Freedom of movement for Santhal women

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Background characteristics</th>
<th>Freedom of movement index (in %)</th>
<th>Total (100%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By respondent's current age</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15-24</td>
<td>22.6</td>
<td>56.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-29</td>
<td>25.8</td>
<td>54.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-34</td>
<td>31.9</td>
<td>44.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35-39</td>
<td>51.6</td>
<td>35.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40-49</td>
<td>45.2</td>
<td>43.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chi-Square Value=19.464</td>
<td>p=0.013</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

By literacy of respondent

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Low</th>
<th>Medium</th>
<th>High</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Illiterate</td>
<td>38.5</td>
<td>44.2</td>
<td>17.3</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literate</td>
<td>30.8</td>
<td>52.9</td>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chi-Square Value=2.283</td>
<td>p=0.319</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

By head of household

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Low</th>
<th>Medium</th>
<th>High</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Respondent</td>
<td>41.0</td>
<td>44.3</td>
<td>14.8</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>34.7</td>
<td>47.8</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chi-Square Value=0.900</td>
<td>p=0.638</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

By household type

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Low</th>
<th>Medium</th>
<th>High</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nuclear</td>
<td>40.4</td>
<td>44.3</td>
<td>15.4</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joint</td>
<td>23.8</td>
<td>54.8</td>
<td>21.4</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chi-Square Value=7.440</td>
<td>p=0.024</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

By children composition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Low</th>
<th>Medium</th>
<th>High</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No Son</td>
<td>22.0</td>
<td>59.3</td>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At Least One Son</td>
<td>39.1</td>
<td>44.3</td>
<td>16.6</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chi-Square Value</td>
<td>6.314</td>
<td>p=0.043</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

By control over land

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Low</th>
<th>Medium</th>
<th>High</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No Land</td>
<td>37.0</td>
<td>48.1</td>
<td>14.8</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some Land</td>
<td>35.0</td>
<td>46.3</td>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chi-Square Value=0.801</td>
<td>p=0.670</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total 35.9 47.1 17.0 312

Source: Field Survey, 2011
The research also supports that Santhal women are still facing challenges to come out from their daily household errands because only almost 10-15% women were found in the two extreme categories. From the table is clear that as age increases, the freedom of movement generally decreases. This is because younger women have fewer burdens of household chores as compared to older women. Thus illiterate women are relatively enjoying low freedom of movement than literate women. 41 percent of the respondents who are head of the household practice low freedom of movement but this figure is only 35 percent where household head are others. This leads to the reverse pattern of high freedom of movement.

Its effect is that the relatively large proportion of the women, having no son, are practicing medium or high freedom of movement than those having son/s. This is because the respondents having no children or having son are more prone to move outside family. Large proportion of the women, who have no land, is practicing low freedom of movement than those having land. The reverse relationship is observed among women who have high freedom of movement. This shows that freedom of movement is relatively higher among the respondents who have some land than among those who have no land.

*Freedom of decision making within household*

Second dimension identified to construct WAI for Santhal community is freedom in decision making in household. Freedom of decision making within household was measured by using three indicators. Excluding others, three crucial aspects those frequently occur in Santhal household have been identified as indicators for this dimension. The first indicator was decision on buying food items for household consumption. Three ordinal classes were constructed in this indicator as:

'Never bought food items', 'Partially involved in buying food items' and 'Fully involved in buying food items'.

The second indicator was related with buying clothes for the respondent. Three ordinal classes for this indicator were:

'Others bought clothes for her', 'She and her husband together bought clothes for her' and 'She bought clothes for her'.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 3: Decision making in household</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Levels for decision making in household</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 4: Decision making by women in Santhal household

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Background Characteristics</th>
<th>DM in household index (in %)</th>
<th>Total (100%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By Respondent's current age</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15-24</td>
<td>39.6</td>
<td>43.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-29</td>
<td>25.0</td>
<td>57.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-34</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>57.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35-39</td>
<td>17.6</td>
<td>60.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40-49</td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>70.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chi-Square Value=16.791   p=0.032</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By literacy of respondent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illiterate</td>
<td>17.1</td>
<td>59.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literate</td>
<td>29.4</td>
<td>57.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chi-Square Value=7.310   p=0.026</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By household headship</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respondent</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>46.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>25.4</td>
<td>62.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chi-Square Value=33.603   p=0.000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By type of family</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nuclear</td>
<td>14.0</td>
<td>63.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joint</td>
<td>40.0</td>
<td>47.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chi-Square Value=20.746   p=0.000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By children composition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Son</td>
<td>31.7</td>
<td>58.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At Least One Son</td>
<td>19.2</td>
<td>58.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chi-Square Value =5.110   p=0.078</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By control over land</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Land</td>
<td>15.6</td>
<td>69.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some Land</td>
<td>24.8</td>
<td>51.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chi-Square Value=8.019   p=0.018</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>21.3</td>
<td>58.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Survey, 2011

As age increases, the level of decision making also increases. About 24 percent of the illiterate respondents have high decision making in household, whereas 13 percent literate respondents enjoy high decision making in household. This is because women in younger ages are more likely to be literate but the decision-making is low. Some 46 percent respondents where respondents are head of household enjoy high decision making in household. But only some 12 percent respondents where others are head of the household exercise low decision making in household. Thus this is one of the important determinants of women's decision making in household. This indicates that the decision
making in household is relatively better in nuclear family than that in joint family. This shows that respondents having son/s practice relatively high decision making than those having no son. This indicates that land ownership doesn't truly measure respondents’ decision-making in household.

Control over family resources

This research has identified control over family resources as third dimension for WAI. Three indicators are used to measure autonomy level with respect to control over family resources. The first indicator is related to ownership of the respondents over Livestock and poultry. Question was asked whether the respondent owned Livestock (cow, buffalo, pig, and goat) or poultry (chicken, hen, cock, duck, and pigeon) or both or neither, as their own property. Responses were classified into three ordinal categories: Own neither, Own livestock or poultry but not both and Own both; in the order the lowest to the highest. The number of livestock or poultry owned by the women has been ignored here to minimise the influence of class status. The women in the first category neither own single livestock nor poultry which indicates the lowest level of ownership. The third category is the highest level ownership because the women in this category own at least single livestock and poultry.

Second indicator was management of family income. Question was asked to the respondents that who managed their family income. Control over family resources has been ranked from highest to lowest level according as the respondent herself managed family income, the respondent and her husband together manage family income and other members managed family income respectively.

The third indicator measures either a Santhal woman borrowed institutional credit or/and deposited her savings within the period of last one year. Borrowing institutional credit itself does not correlate with the level of women's autonomy rather it is one of the example of economic participation. Indicator to this dimension of autonomy was developed on the basis of information on ever participation of respondents in saving programmes in any cooperative groups and ever taken institutional credit. Involvement in both has been regarded as highest level, involvement in only one of these two has been considered the medium level and involvement in neither has been regarded as the lowest level in control over family resources.

Finally, a new scale is constructed by using various combinations of levels of these three indicators. Low, Medium and High levels in control over family resources were defined in the same way as in the dimension freedom of movement in decision making within household.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Levels of control over resources</th>
<th>Control over resources index</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>36.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>46.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>17.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100 (321)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
This indicator clearly poses the picture that Santhal women possess either at least one livestock or poultry. With regard to ownership over Livestock and poultry 45.5% Santhal women neither own single livestock nor poultry whereas only 27% women own both and almost same percentage of women own either of both. 43% Santhal women were found not involved in institutional credit and savings whereas 35% women have involvement in both activities and almost 22% women were reported to have involved in one of the activities.

**Table 6: Control over family resources of Santhal women**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Background Characteristics</th>
<th>Control over family resources index</th>
<th>Total (100%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age of Respondent</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15-24</td>
<td>47.6</td>
<td>38.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-29</td>
<td>37.9</td>
<td>40.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-34</td>
<td>27.1</td>
<td>52.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35-39</td>
<td>37.3</td>
<td>50.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40-49</td>
<td>29.9</td>
<td>50.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chi-Square Value=9.136  p=0.331

| Literacy of Respondent     |      |        |      |                      |
|----------------------------|      |        |      |                      |
| Illiterate                 | 39.1 | 46.5   | 14.4 | 215                  |
| Literate                   | 30.2 | 46.2   | 23.6 | 106                  |

Chi-Square Value=4.970  p=0.083

| Head of Household          |      |        |      |                      |
|----------------------------|      |        |      |                      |
| Respondent                 | 10.8 | 49.2   | 40.0 | 65                    |
| Others                     | 42.6 | 45.7   | 11.7 | 256                  |

Chi-Square Value=38.42  p=0.000

| Household Type             |      |        |      |                      |
|----------------------------|      |        |      |                      |
| Nuclear                    | 33.1 | 49.6   | 17.4 | 236                  |
| Joint                      | 44.7 | 37.6   | 17.6 | 85                   |

Chi-Square Value=4.268  p=0.118

| Children Composition       |      |        |      |                      |
|----------------------------|      |        |      |                      |
| No Son                     | 46.7 | 36.7   | 16.7 | 60                   |
| At Least One Son           | 33.7 | 48.7   | 17.6 | 261                  |

Chi-Square Value=3.801  p=0.149

| Own Land                   |      |        |      |                      |
|----------------------------|      |        |      |                      |
| No Land                    | 40.0 | 43.6   | 16.4 | 140                  |
| Some Land                  | 33.1 | 48.6   | 18.2 | 181                  |

Chi-Square Value=1.060  p=0.448

| Total                      | 36.1 | 46.4   | 17.4 | 321                  |
The control over family resources by age does not vary much, but it in general increases as age increases. But the scenario is not evenly distributed in all age groups. This shows that the control over family resources is higher among literate women than that among illiterate women.

This shows that head of the household is one of the strongest factors for explaining the control over family resources. Thus majority of the women in nuclear family enjoy medium control over family resources whereas the majority of the women having no son exercise low control over family resources than those having son/s. This is also added due to the increasing age of the respondents. The control over family resources is slightly higher among the respondents who have son than among those who have no son.

**Freedom of decision making in reproductive behaviour**

Freedom of decision making in reproductive behaviour has been measured using two indicators: decision to use or not to use contraception and decision to child birth. Based on the information on ever use status of family planning methods, restriction if any in not using the methods and decision on using family planning methods, respondents were classified into five distinct ordinal categories:

1. those never used family planning methods and someone restricted to do so,
2. those never used family planning methods but no one restricted to do so,
3. ever used family planning methods but others told to do so (Other, here, means other family members than husband),
4. ever used family planning methods as couples decision and
5. ever used family planning methods with her own decision.

The frequency distribution of this indicator appeared to be bimodal and hence it became difficult to merge these classes into three ordinal levels. Therefore, to develop the indicator of freedom of decision making in reproductive behaviour, only two categories: ever used family planning methods and never used family planning methods were considered.

The last indicator is related to decision making on child birth. Question asked was concerned with the decision on last birth or current pregnancy whichever was later. Respondents stating the last birth or current pregnancy on their own decision were classified in the highest level, couple's decision in medium level and others' decision or without any plan or unwanted in the lowest level in freedom of decision making in reproductive behaviour.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Levels in DM</th>
<th>% of Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>16.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>46.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>37.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100 (306)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 8: Decision making in reproductive behaviour of Santhal women

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Background Characteristics</th>
<th>DM in RB index</th>
<th>Total (100%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age of Respondent</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15-24</td>
<td>14.5</td>
<td>63.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-29</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>50.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-34</td>
<td>14.9</td>
<td>40.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35-39</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>39.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40-49</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>38.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chi-Square Value</strong></td>
<td>12.171</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Literacy of Respondent</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illiterate</td>
<td>19.5</td>
<td>44.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literate</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>48.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chi-Square Value</strong></td>
<td>4.662</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Head of Household</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respondent</td>
<td>23.4</td>
<td>46.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>14.5</td>
<td>45.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chi-Square Value</strong></td>
<td>3.848</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Household Type</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nuclear</td>
<td>15.9</td>
<td>44.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joint</td>
<td>17.7</td>
<td>50.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chi-Square Value</strong></td>
<td>1.602</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Children Composition</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Son</td>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>66.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At Least One Son</td>
<td>17.2</td>
<td>42.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chi-Square Value</strong></td>
<td>9.048</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Own Land</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Land</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>49.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some Land</td>
<td>16.1</td>
<td>43.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chi-Square Value</strong></td>
<td>1.272</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>46.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Field Survey, 2011

The decision making in reproductive behaviour doesn't show any significant relationship with age of respondents. Thus it can be said that decision making in reproductive behaviour is slightly higher in older women. The effect of this is that high proportion of literate respondents with medium and high decision making in reproductive behaviour is experienced than those of illiterate respondents. Considering head of the household, about 23 percent respondents where respondents are head of the household practice low decision making in reproductive behaviour while only 15 percent respondents
where others are the head of the household exercise low decision making in reproductive behaviour. On the other hand, about 30 percent respondents where respondents are head of the household have high decision making in reproductive behaviour but 40 percent respondents where others are head of the household have high decision making in reproductive behaviour.

In terms of household type, no specific pattern is observed with decision making in reproductive behaviour. About 16 percent respondents in nuclear family have low decision making in reproductive behaviour, similarly 45 percent enjoy medium decision making in reproductive behaviour and rest 40 percent enjoy high decision making in reproductive behaviour. Almost 18 percent respondents in nuclear family have low decision making in reproductive behaviour, about 51 percent respondents in those family enjoy medium decision making in reproductive behaviour and 32 percent have high decision making in reproductive behaviour. Thus it can be concluded that more respondents in joint family enjoy low and medium decision making in reproductive behaviour and more respondents in nuclear family enjoy high decision making in reproductive behaviour.

Thus more proportion of the women with son practice low and high decision making in reproductive behaviour while more respondents with no son enjoy medium decision making in reproductive behaviour. The decision making in reproductive behaviour is relatively better among the respondents who have some land than those who have no land. Thus women with some land have relatively better position in terms of decision making in reproductive behaviour.

**Measurement of WAI**

Based on the ordinal measurements in four dimensions, an indicator of overall autonomy has been constructed. Autonomy of Santhal women has been described in three ordinal classes: Low, Medium and High. Only those respondents who were present in the analysis of all four dimensions of autonomy (72.9% of the total respondents) have been used in analysis. Those respondents who belonged to High level in majority of the dimensions or High level in any two dimensions and Medium in other two dimensions are defined to be in High category. Similarly, respondents belonging to Low level in majority of the dimensions or Low in any two dimensions and Medium in other two dimensions are considered to be in Low autonomy level. All remaining combinations are considered to be in Medium level of autonomy.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Levels of WAI</th>
<th>% of Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>17.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>71.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>11.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>100 (234)</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

*Table 9: Santhal women's autonomy index*
The level of overall autonomy is distinct by place of residence of the respondents. In Jhapa district, more proportion of the respondents belongs to medium and high autonomy than in Morang district. The level of low autonomy is more among respondents in Morang than in Jhapa. As far as age group wise analysis is concerned, the more proportion of younger women practice low autonomy than older women. But, the medium autonomy is higher among older women than the younger women. High autonomy is observed more among the middle aged women than among younger or older women.
In terms of literacy status of the respondents, more literate women belong to high autonomy than illiterate women. In medium autonomy, greater proportion of illiterate women are observed than literate women. But in low autonomy, there is no difference in figure among illiterate or literate women. In terms of head of the household, low autonomy prevails more in those respondents where others are the head of the household. But medium and high autonomy prevails more in those families where respondents are head of the household. This indicates that those women where they are head of the household practice more autonomy. In terms of household type, low autonomy exists more among respondents of joint family than among those of nuclear family whereas medium and high autonomy prevails more among respondents of nuclear family than among those of joint family.

Composition of children is also considered one of the background variables for studying autonomy level of the respondents. High autonomy is enjoyed more relatively by those women who have son/s than those having no son. But in contrary, medium and low autonomy is observed more in those women who have no son/s than those who have son. It can therefore be said that those women who have son/s are relatively in better position in terms of autonomy than those who have only daughter or have no children. Considering land ownership, low autonomy is observed higher in the women of the family with no land than those with some land. The reverse pattern is observed in medium autonomy of the respondents. High autonomy is more or less same among the respondents in both families. Thus the different background characteristics can explain the change in autonomy of the respondents as mentioned above.

Conclusions
This research specially concentrates on one of the highly marginalised communities living in plains of eastern Nepal. Because of limited researches on gender concerns on Santhal, women's autonomy in the Santhal community was considered one of the burning issues for social researchers. Women's autonomy itself is less debated topic in Nepal. Morgan and Niroula made an effort but their effort was too specific, as only two common indicators had been used. Although this research is not based on comparative study, it is broader than Morgan and Niroula's because of its wide range of indicators. On the one hand this research tries to classify the women's autonomy based on different socio-cultural variables into autonomy index and measure the overall level of autonomy of Santhal women on the other. The following is the conclusion of the research findings.

Santhal females, irrespective of massive economic hurdles, live in nuclear families and enjoy comparatively satisfactory level of autonomy. With respect to the aforementioned indicators only limited number of women experience restriction in their daily lives either in the case of freedom of movement or in the case of household decision-making. The control over resources is of little significance with regard to their autonomy because the Santhal families themselves are out of the access and control over resources.

The Santhals living in the western plains of Nepal, being one of the highly marginalized ethnic groups, are still facing severe poverty. To look back to the history of Santhals, they were hunter-gatherers as
well as agriculturalists having sufficient access to and control over agricultural land. But as the process of assimilation with caste based Hindus and other ethnic groups began, mainly after the Nepal's unification, the process of marginalization and landlessness of Santhals began. Most of the Santhal families in the research area were found living in nuclear family. The main reason behind this type of family structure is the landlessness among Santhals. This feature of Santhals makes the comfortable to breakdown the joint families into nuclear one because no administrative hurdles have to be faced while allocating parental property. Consequently, majority of Santhals living in nuclear families are enjoying autonomy in medium level. The following is the recommendation to increase the respective levels of autonomy, which the Santhal women are enjoying.

- Access to and control over agricultural land should be established.
- Free and compulsory education with incentives for the children of Santhals should be provided.
- Indigenous cultural identity of Santhals should be promoted because their ethic practices are more women friendly as compared to the other caste groups of Nepal.
- Positive discrimination for Santhals in development planning is compulsory.
- Special agricultural and labour packages should be designed for both male and female Santhals to make full use of their skills.
- Increasing caste based assimilation should be systematically addressed otherwise caste based inequality would override their indigenous identity.

References


Human Dignity as a Foundational Norm in the Understanding of Human Rights*

Mashele Rapatsa1

Abstract: This article discusses the notion of human dignity as the yardstick on which the philosophy of human rights derives its strength. Whilst lacking a universally accepted definition, human dignity is widely accepted to be premised on respecting, protecting and preserving human worth. It is an inviolable property upon which the established normative value system has been founded, which is integral in the study of contemporary human rights. In South Africa, it is observed that there is a strong linkage between the justiciability of socio-economic rights and the notion of dignity. This has been given added impetus by the agenda of transformative constitutionalism which espouses redressing the imbalances of the past, to achieve fundamental freedoms and substantive equality among others, all in efforts of restoring the inherent nature of dignity to the majority of the people. This is yet to be realized though, owing to notable triple challenges of poverty, unemployment and inequalities that make it impossible for the majority to meaningfully assert their dignity. Thus, it is asserted that trading human dignity as the hallmark of human rights is essential as it augments efforts of advancing humanitarianism, which is geared towards safeguarding social-welfare of the people.

Keywords: human dignity, human rights, humanity and humanitarianism, democracy, transformation.

Introduction
The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996 (hereinafter, the Constitution, 1996), has entrenched a progressive normative value system premised on the constitutional supremacy. This system has established South Africa as a human rights state fundamentally affirming a human-centred

* I acknowledge academic, financial and logistical support received from the University of Groningen and University of Limpopo. My immense gratitude to Prof. J. Herman, Prof. A. Zwitter, Prof. M. Doortmont, Prof. M. Mokgalong and Prof. M. Sibara.
1 PhD student, University of Groningen, Globalisation Studies and Humanitarian Action, Netherlands. Lecturer, Faculty of Management and Law, University of Limpopo (Turffloop Campus), South Africa. Email: m.j.rapatsa@rug.nl
protection of the right to dignity (Mandela, 1996; Buchanan, 2001; Kende, 2003; Reddy and Sokomani, 2008; Liebenberg, 2010; Human Rights Watch, 2014).

In *Carmichele v Minister of Safety & Security* 2001 (4) SA 938 (CC): 45, it was held that the right to dignity is entrenched at the core of this normative value system. Human dignity is also integral in the notable International Bill of Rights (that is, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights - *UDHR*, the International Covenant of Civil and Political Rights - *ICCPR*, and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights - *ICESCR*). Hence, it ought to be recognized for its credence as a universally accepted foundational principle that propels successes behind human rights, its norms and teachings. Indeed, the profound origin of the universality of human rights theory is grounded in the quest for securing human dignity of all persons (Deng, 2004). This philosophy of human rights continues to thrive, featuring very prominently in various discourses cutting across numerous academic disciplines and societal orientations. It has prominently endured as a multidisciplinary phenomenon that has undoubtedly been and remains a subject of immense global attention, while also being recognized as a subject of scrutiny in other scholarly perspectives. Most importantly, it is essential to ask a question; can the world scholars, philosophers and humanitarians have deliberations on the study of human rights without regard to human dignity? Invariably, responses to this and other questions assist in illuminating on what should be considered as a fundamental objective of human rights theory.

Such questions are crucial as they prompt a continuous reverberation of the spirit and purport of the *UDHR*, 1948. This is necessarily because since the adoption of the UDHR world over, human rights have extensively been accepted as a reputed theory (Risse and Sikkink, 1999; Gauri and Gloppen, 2012; Bayefsky, 2013) in safeguarding and preserving human worth. Thus, human rights philosophy plays a fundamental role in the moulding of social values that are instrumental in the shaping of human kind. Having said that, to sustain the thriving agenda of human rights, some common understanding ought to prevail. This entails founding corresponding central yardsticks in modelling human rights experiences. That is, the world community ought to subscribe to a universalised culture of respecting and protecting human rights of all people in accordance with revered norms. This has to be premised on propagating the understanding and application of human dignity as the yardstick in the interpretation and understanding of human rights. This is indispensable in the quest for global peace, greater social welfare for the people, unity and prevention of wars and conflicts. More so because the notion of human dignity is invariably invoked in various areas of political and social dispensations (Bayefsky, 2013) that mould human rights studies.

In this article, I reflect on the notion of human dignity and its significance in the study of human rights. Although this article is written from a South African perspective, it also draws attention on international conceptualization of the theory of human rights and human dignity. In so doing, this work unpacks and illuminates on the essence of human dignity as the touchstone for our understanding and interpretation of modern human rights discourses. This article also reflects on intrinsic relationship
between law and its attitude towards human dignity, a task which is to be achieved through wider express or tacit constitutional provisions and other legislative initiatives. Thus, the role of legal framework and policy initiative in the shaping of human rights is considered essential.

Most importantly, the article argues that human dignity has established itself as a soul in the teachings of human rights, particularly the second generation of rights, widely recognised as socio-economic rights. The article employs a qualitative method of research and utilizes content analysis approach relying on data from written texts, including laws, policies and scholarly works. Content analysis is the appropriate method as it assists in determining the legislative and policy positions with regards to societal reflection on the notion of human dignity. The study is both descriptive and exploratory in nature. Both primary and secondary sources were used as source material.

Understanding human dignity

Owing to the fact that human dignity is touted as the guiding instrument in the understanding of human rights, it is crucial to establish its primary meaning. The meaning has to be found, notwithstanding the notable absence of universalised definition of what constitute ‘human dignity’. Some linguists such as Shultziner (2003) went as far as contending that human dignity is an eclectic and ambiguous concept without a precise definition. Others such as Etienne recognise dignity as a complex concept with different dimensions that need to be taken into account if we are to do justice to it (De Villiers, 2010). I concur with Etienne. However, this accordingly presents further risks of having multiple regional definitions that may lead to contradictions and eventual widespread misunderstandings. In the main however, it is amenable that the notion of human dignity is an expansive concept which can best be understood within the context of its prime social value towards human kind. Thus, its broader conceptualisation is premised on framing a philosophically sound imperative of respecting and protecting the dignity of personhood. The dignity of human person underlies a certain exceptional position of man in nature’s creation and is referred to as synonymous for the human worth, the inherent excellence of the human person as distinguished from any other living being (Cohn, 1983). In defining human dignity, reference is appropriately made to the concept of ‘person’, which is regarded as the substance of dignity. Therefore, dignity points to the person’s inviolability as derived from his or her natural image.

It is asserted that to appropriately formulate a working definition of ‘human dignity’, it is essential to appreciate the core features constituting this notion. That is, it is fundamentally premised on the preservation of humans and their dignity. It therefore presupposes that humans occupy a distinct position than the rest other creatures in the society. Notably, it is a position of ‘self-worth and consciousness’ thereto. This finds proponents in the preamble of UDHR and Article 1, where it is rightfully proclaimed that the recognition of human dignity and of the equal and inalienable rights of members of the human family is the foundational value of freedom, justice and peace in the world.
Thus, a coherent meaning of human dignity should be centred on the embodiment of familiar benchmarks that each individual is capable of embracing. This should ideally entail the necessity to recognizing that every person is worthy of respect and protection as a human. The founding guideline in this regard should be premised on conforming to tangible characteristics that all humans hold. In a nutshell, human dignity can be accepted to refer to worthiness or excellence attributed to humans by virtue of being humans. Indeed, this is considered to be a profound humanist imperative that has flourished globally, despite it being distorted every so often, and continues to reinvent itself similarly in South Africa (De Grunchy, 2011). Thus, a common meaning to human dignity should be premised on a whole embodiment of humanism, which is arguably the gist of human rights.

Origin and the context of human dignity: theoretical framework

Human dignity can be articulated to prevail in accordance with three perspectives of arguments. Firstly, the sociological perspective, secondly, the legalistic and political approach and thirdly, the economic viewpoint to the origin of human dignity. From a social viewpoint, it is argued that human dignity profoundly stems from the worth of humans which accrues to a person upon birth and becomes inalienable. This entails that human beings are born free and equal in dignity and rights. This requires that all human beings should be afforded their dignity, and should not unduly be deprived of social amenities that enable them to assert their worth. It prevails to such an extent of obligating the state to ensure swift realisation of such amenities within reasonable constitutional tenets.

On the other hand, the legal, political and economic perspectives are premised on the express provisions of the UNDR which resulted in international promulgation of statutory framework protecting human dignity. This is particularly discernible in Article 22 which provides that ‘everyone is entitled to the realisation of economic, social and cultural rights indispensable for his dignity and free development of personality’. Article 23 further entrenched the economic sense of protecting human dignity by requiring that those who work be afforded a just and favourable remuneration with the aim of ensuring an existence worthy of dignity. The legal, political and economic perspectives on the right to human dignity also coincide with the objectives of the Declaration on the Right to Development of 1989. UNGA Resolution 34/46 explicitly recognised the right to development as a human right with the effect of making third generation of rights another pre-condition for asserting human dignity. Therefore, human dignity encompasses social rights, legal and political rights and economic rights and thus, these tenets constitute its founding imperatives.

The conceptualisation of human right to dignity is better traded as the hallmark in the comprehension and the interpretation of contemporary human rights. Human dignity in its own nature is inviolable and all state power must respect and protect it (Starck, 2002). Human dignity is fundamentally key to modern constitutional thought since it determines the relationship between individuals and state, the guarantee a human dignity allows to draw inferences regarding the very basis of the state itself.
The story behind studies on protecting the right to dignity has largely been framed in accordance with the philosophical writings of Immanuel Kant. According to Kant, dignity is an inviolable property of all human beings, which gives the possessor the right never to be treated simply as a means, but always at the same time as an end (Schroeder, 2010). He argued that humans occupy a special place in creation, and that humans possess an intrinsic worth of dignity which cannot be comparable to that of other creatures (Rachels, 1986). Kant reasoned that humanity and dignity are such designated values which lack any equivalent (Shell, 2008). It is asserted that Kant’s theory has galvanized the world community to comprehend and accept the universality and inalienability of fundamental human rights.

The concept of human dignity is also central to political thought of Samuel Pufendorf (1958) who contended that it derives its strengths from the social character of human nature, which he believed was divinely determined. According to Pufendorf, human dignity provides the basis for morally anchored Freedom and Equality. It is used to recognise four senses in which human beings may be said to have dignity, first and perhaps least common in contemporary discussions that a person may have dignity simply by virtue of occupying a position of high rank in an established social hierarchy. It is noteworthy to indicate that everyone has dignity regardless of not only hereditary social position but also race, gender, nationality, ethnicity or other markets of social hierarchy. Further that this egalitarian account of ‘human dignity’ is arguably a moral high water rank mark of modern ethical and political thought (Meyer, 2002).

Michael Meyer (2002) maintains that having dignity can also be understood as just a ‘sense of dignity’ and further that a person with proper sense of his own dignity will most likely resist humiliation and dehumanisation by others. He further argues that it is also important to recognise that a person who does not have a sense of own dignity does not lack dignity altogether. That such an individual lacking proper appreciation of his human dignity still retain his dignity in the sense that he retains his state of deserving basic moral respect. This view maintains that for a person to assert dignity, one need not occupy any position of authority nor public status because the phenomenon of dignity is inherent in the nature of humans. Thus, Meyer’s position accords to Ronald Dworkin’s conceptualisation of dignity, that it is inherently linked with the capacity for self-respect, self-worth and consciousness (Dworkin, 1993). However, this view does not deprive of any person his/her dignity, it simply requires that every individual ought to first be conscious of his/her dignity, protect and respect it, before attempting to assert it over others.

Arthur Chaskalson (Chief Justice as he then was), asserted that in general and broader sense, respect for dignity represent a prerequisite for respect of the autonomy of every individual, and the right of everyone not to be devalued as a human being or treated in a degrading or humiliating manner (Chaskalson, 2002: 137). For Chaskalson, the basis of dignity is to safeguard human respect, because it is the source and essential content of all other rights. Further that committing ourselves to a society founded on recognition of human rights requires us to value right dignity and life above all others. This stance was also supported by Justice Kate O’Regan in S v Makwanyane 1995 (6) BCLR 655 (CC):
According to O'Regan J, recognising right to dignity is an acknowledgement of the intrinsic worth of human beings, and dignity is therefore the foundation of many other rights that are also specifically articulated in the Bill of Rights.

According to Shadrack Gutto (2002), while primarily accepting and acknowledging that the human dignity reigns central to all fundamental rights in a democratic state like South Africa, he contended that respect for human dignity and human rights can provide possible solutions to conflicts. He propagates protection of human dignity as an integral part of contemporary human rights protection, as espoused in the United Nations Charter, International Bill of Rights and African Charter on Human and Peoples’ Rights, among others. He also argued that understanding human dignity as a core constitutional and democratic value enables us to link it with other basic principles and values of modern democracy including popular participation, good governance and the rule of law. He is convinced that the vigorous pursuit of human dignity and human rights in all spheres of human activity can lead to minimizing or resolving conflict in a sustainable manner. He noted that while conflict cannot be “resolved” without substantive justice and honour, the conditions that create conflict in the first place must be addressed and substantially changed. Categorizing the violation and denial of substantive human dignity and human rights in peacetime or wartime as tyranny and oppression, Gutto believes that it is in the interest of humanity as a whole to civilize itself by securing substantive human dignity and human rights through the rule of law and solidarity. In a nutshell, Gutto’s reasoning resonate the ambitions of transformative constitutionalism which embraces the view of addressing the multiple challenges inherited from the past, which if not substantively altered will encumber efforts geared towards achieving peace and stability. His perspective contains narratives that advocate for the creation of an environment where the realisation of socio-economic rights enables persons to assert their dignity.

**Human dignity and South Africa’s transformative constitutionalism**

Upon attainment of democracy in 1994, South Africa went through a process of notable paradigm shift as far as extensive approaches to human rights theory were concerned. This culminated in the birth of a liberal legal system systematically epitomized on preserving human worth. It was this view that grounded human dignity at the centre of human rights advocacy. Thus, the notion of human dignity cannot escape its intrinsic interconnectedness with the agenda of transformative constitutionalism. This agenda has been founded on fundamental epitomes that espouse social justice and substantive justice in social, economic and political realities, and building a nation grounded on protecting democratic values and fundamental human rights (Rapatsa, 2014a).

Karl Klare conceived transformative constitutionalism as a ‘long-term project of constitutional enactment, interpretation and enforcement committed to transforming a country’s political, legal and social institutions, and power relations in a democratic, participatory and egalitarian direction’ (Klare, 1998). It has since set up a profound resonance in various academic discourses, judicial jurisprudence and civil society campaigns for social justice. This project enables perfect interpretations that augment
comprehensive transformative ambitions of the Constitution geared towards reaching various disciplines from philosophy, law to various social sciences areas (Van Marle, 2009) as a contrivance for safeguarding human right to dignity. The significance function of transformative constitutionalism has been and remains that of redressing past injustices and guiding the nation to a better future (Langa, 2006; Bohler-Muller, 2007), ensuring substantive equality and protection of human dignity (Mosesneke, 2007), and giving a true meaning to democracy, which enriches human rights discourse as a means to greater social ends. It committed the government to implement positive measures aimed at redressing both the legacy of the past and also deal with new or emerging forms of subordination that deny human dignity to certain groups in the society (Liebenberg, 2010). This is the essence of human dignity which is essential for determining successes of post 1994 democratic dispensation.

How does transformative constitutionalism safeguard human right to dignity? First and foremost, this is a project which prioritizes a comprehensive societal transformation. This is considerate of South Africa’s known history of unjust legal system under which indiscriminate protection of human rights could never develop (Sarkin, 1998). It also takes into account the extensive human rights violations which were a common phenomenon during apartheid (Ndangwa, 2004), effectively rendering the realization of human right to dignity difficult and impossible to assert. The institutionalised racially driven unjust legal system had perpetuated class-based segregation that has resulted in pervasive disadvantage, poverty and inequalities. The system regarded a human rights theory as an inessential theory. Within this context, President Thabo Mbeki (as he then was) emphasised that the struggle against minority domination was simply propelled by the importance of the restoration of dignity to every person and elevating the African people to their rightful place in humanity (Mbeki, 2007).

Thus, transformative constitutionalism carries with it, the hopes of ensuring that all citizens have access to an improved quality of life and are capable of re-asserting their dignity (Liebenberg, 2010). The project inculcated this culture by necessitating the entrenchment of the Bill of Rights which is recognized as the cornerstone of democracy (The Constitution, s7(1), (2) & (3)). It has also indicted the government to promote and faithfully observe international human rights norms and standards (Mandela, 1996).

But how did transformative constitutionalism get entrenched as a normative value system? South Africa’s transformation has seen wider human rights jurisprudence filled with successes owing to greater efforts of domesticating universal norms and standards. As part of reinforcing the transformation agenda, South Africa has had to promptly facilitate its re-integration into international communities that respect and protects human rights. This was because the international conventions that the government ratified embedded norms that have been widely accepted world over, and do possess credence of transcending domestic human rights initiatives in many instances. To aspire for meaningful change, the Constitution adapted to both monism and dualism theories. In terms of section 231(2) & (4), it adopts dualist approach when it states that international agreements only become law
in the country upon enactment into law through national legislation, while reasserting the Supremacy of the Constitution in section 2. Similarly, monism finds proponents in sections 231, 232 & 233. These provisions recognise that certain customary international laws transcend national laws without approval of the National Assembly. Section 39(a) & (b) also indict courts, tribunals or any other state functionaries to consider international when interpreting the Bill of Rights. This has arguably constituted a milestone of framework which safeguards the protection of human right to dignity at all times. This is because it has empowered judiciary to serve as custodians of democracy in view of holding public and private functionaries to have regard for human rights when exercising their functions. Thus, transformative constitutionalism has assured compatibility with international laws, especially the customary international Bill of Rights to safeguard right to dignity.

Therefore, the essence of transformative constitutionalism has been and remains that of restoring human worth indiscriminately. This entails redressing the material disadvantages that the majority of the people have suffered. It is also a contrivance to address the multiple and intersecting socio-economic challenges that if left unattended, would impede efforts towards meaningful transformation. In the main, this project has had to augment the vision of ensuring a progressive realisation of socio-economic rights.

Human dignity and socio-economic rights
South Africa’s human rights jurisprudence is premised on the Bill of Rights which has been described as a revolutionary text that has created vertical and horizontal obligation based relationships between the state, individuals and private entities (De Vos, 2002: 243). Within this context, section 7(2) of the Constitution begins by obligating the state to respect, protect, promote and fulfil all rights, and in this case, reference is made to socio-economic rights. This is founded on the need to protect the dignity of persons, equality and freedom. This Bill of Rights has entrenched socio-economic rights which are protected as constitutional rights. This entails that claims on socio-economic rights can be enforced through substantive judicial processes with probable resultant thereto being to hold the state accountable in terms of honouring and protecting them lest it is found justiciable before the law. Thus, human dignity is considered as a fundamental tenet or value which embodies critical dimensions on socio-economic rights. This includes the right to housing, health, education, food and/or social security, water,

Because adequate shelter is essentially an enabling precept in asserting dignity, this right was broadly canvassed in The Government of the Republic of South Africa v Grootboom 2000 (11) BCLR 1169 (CC): 14, 15 & 23. This case effectively set a precedent in accordance with reasonableness test that the state is required to address and provide for people who desperately need such help as adequate housing. It has been held that this augment the process of giving meaning and substance to the foundational values essential for advancing transformative trajectory of socio-economic rights jurisprudence (Liebenberg, 2010). Yacoob J reasoned that to report progress on socio-economic right
of access to housing, imperatives on the right to dignity and equality ought be given due regard. Thus, the argument here is that without adequate housing, a person’s dignity falls out of place.

Entrenching socio-economic rights as justiciable rights has also aided efforts of guaranteeing widespread access to basic education. In Section 27 and Others v Minister of Education and Another (24565/2012) [2012] ZAGPHC 114: 3, Kollapen J articulated that ‘education is critical in both freeing and unlocking the potential of every individual, the impact of which effectively play the role of securing children’s better future. This resonates with the transformative ideals of the Constitution. Because education is a human need (Dieter-Beiter, 2006), it is essential for the enjoyment of other rights (Heyns, 2005) as it reinforces life of sustainable development aimed at securing enjoyment of dignity.

In Soobramoney v Minister of Health (Kwazulu-Natal) 1998 (1) SA 765 (CC); 1997 (12) BCLR 1696, the right to health care also befitted attention as a human rights issue. The right to health care notably became a contentious issue which could best be resolved through the transformative ideals of the Constitution. In this case, the Constitutional Court dealt with the right to life, the right to receive emergency medical services and the right to access health care services. Although the court considered the aforesaid rights as foundational, it invoked the reasonableness test and also found that the state’s failure to provide a kidney transplant/dialysis to Mr Soobramoney was justified as it required the patient to be free of other critical ailments such as vascular or cardiac diseases. This was also considerate of the scarcity of resources (dialysis machines) at the public hospital. Also important on the right to health was Treatment Action Campaign v Minister of Health 2002 (4) BCLR 356 (T), where the Constitutional Court ordered the state to administer niverapine at all public hospitals, to HIV positive mothers as an effective stratagem to prevent mother-to-child-transmission. State was obligated to uphold section 27(1) and (2).

The contextual approach on issues of dignity has further elevated it as an animating value. This has resulted in an express constitutional inclusion of the right to social security. This goes as afar as obligating the state to provide social assistance to the indigent members of the society. This was canvassed in Khosa v Minister of Social Development 2004 (6) SA 505 (CC): 111, where it was held that the social welfare system which the state has put in place ought to benefit everyone, as an imperative of enabling indigent people to reassert their dignity.

The right to dignity has also been invoked in claims pertaining to discrimination, on matters that adversely affect the person’s social status in the society. This is premised on the need to remedy the social-ills associated with group-disadvantage or harm. Very often than not, discrimination result in reduced opportunities and effectively, deplorable socio-economic conditions. The case of National Coalition for Gay and Lesbian Equality v Minister of Justice 1999 (1) SA 6 (CC): 29, laid bare the acute exposure that gays and lesbians face, thereby proffering an intervention to emphasise that dignity remains an inherent integrity of humans irrespective of gender or sex. In this case, the Constitutional Court upheld that human dignity is a creation of Kantian moral philosophy, and that we
should acknowledge every person’s value and worth as members of society. This emphasised the view in *Harksen v Lane NO & Others 1998 (1) SA 300 (CC)* that, guaranteeing the right to equality is essential in the preservation of dignity. Hence, it is discernible that first generation of rights is a precursor for the growing attention of both second and third generation rights.

**Challenges and prospects**

This section presents critical observations that are found to be hindering a comprehensive realisation of human right to dignity. These are largely social circumstances which have also been accepted as partly inherited from the legacy of apartheid. It is only unfortunate because the spiralling progress points in the negative direction. Notwithstanding the notable judicial activism that has been fundamental in reinforcing the enforceability and realisation of socio-economic rights, a wider experience in general public remain that filled with stark contrast.

In the recent past, it has been revealed that South Africa continues to experience threats particularly towards the Constitution’s transformative agenda. There are numerous factors that have notably been considered as pervasive threats towards achieving comprehensive dignity in meaningful terms. This is inclusive of high levels of poverty, spiralling levels of inequalities and soaring unemployment problems, with the youth being the hardest hit. These challenges are so intrinsic that they extensively determine the extent to which a person is capable of asserting his/her dignity as they affect access to education, health care, justice and other common social amenities. The official unemployment rate presently sits at 24.1% while the expanded unemployment rate is at 34.9% (Statistics SA, 2014). Subsequently, this has compounded and heightened poverty crisis (Frye, 2013), further spiralling the widening gap between the rich and the poor or worsening inequalities in simple terms (Kings, 2014; Mattes, 2012; Appolis and McKinley, 2009). The critical aspect of these phenomena is that approximately 16 million people are dependent on the state funded social assistance in the form of social grants (Statistics SA, 2014). Whereas it is amenable that social grants have mitigating effects over poverty, the grants do not eradicate it nor promise a permanent alternative relief (Rapatsa, 2014b). Thus, the sustainability of providing social grants as a means of safeguarding dignity remains a critical matter, because these are largely funded from tax contributions of the registered tax payers and other forms of public revenue, while employment levels remain stagnant or on a declining terrain. Another problem which compounds problems further, is the issue of *public-private* service. Public service is widely associated with poor service and is mostly utilized by ordinary members of the populace while private facilities are considered of high standard but accessible mainly to the rich. This amounts to what I term ‘silent-injustices’, where access to quality socio-economic services is determined by wealth (Liebenberg, 2010).

President Kgalema Motlanthe (as he then was), rightfully put it that we cannot boast to be espousing the principles of human dignity and equality when many people are still living in appalling conditions of poverty and underdevelopment (Motlanthe, 2009). It is indisputable that change in socio-economic conditions of the majority of the people would largely result in the fulfilment of preservation of human
worth, the crux of dignity. Thus, the fundamental question boils down on how to calibrate interventions underpinning values of human dignity in regard to socio-economic rights? In formulating social and economic policies, the government has to consider not only the rights of individuals to live with dignity but also, the general interests of community in pursuit of wider humanitarian goals. This shall reinforce efforts towards sustainable development and preservation of human dignity.

Conclusion

Indubitably, the notable universal successes associated with human rights philosophy can be attributed to human dignity as a foundational norm which enabled human rights to flourish. South Africa’s embracing of human right to dignity has meaningfully fostered widespread acceptance of human rights theory as a panacea to multiple societal challenges, and this has largely aided the Constitution’s transformative agenda. Thus, it is discernible that utilizing the right to dignity as the yardstick of human rights effectively made way for recognition, protection and justiciability of socio-economic rights, without which the project of transformative constitutionalism would crumble. Therefore, the notion of human dignity is the touchstone of all fundamental rights entrenched in the Bill of Rights. In the main, it is observed that South Africa has effectively succeeded in entrenching a progressive normative and institutional framework necessary to augment the realisation of human dignity. However, in practical terms, the impact of the normative framework has been encumbered owing to constant overwhelming problems associated with poor or non-existent political will to wholly advance a meaningful transformation and uphold the Constitution. This is worsened by the ever spiralling inequalities between the rich and the poor. Under these circumstances, it becomes impossible for the majority of the people to assert their right to dignity because of horrendous socio-economic conditions they experience on a daily basis.

References


Langa, P. 2006. The challenges facing transformative constitutionalism in South Africa. Prestige Lecture delivered at Stellenbosch University on 9 October 2006.


Abstract: Contradictory premises on the relationship between good government and bureaucratic governance have continued to emerge in public administration scholarship. Bureaucracy is probably one of the concepts that have received heavy attack although it has shown unmatched resilience. It was the centre of attack by New Public Management (NPM) and Governance paradigms yet, it remains alive in most administrative jurisdictions. This has created a paradox whose genesis emanates from whether society needs government or not. Our view is that good government and bureaucratic governance share the same ancestors. Since government remains part of society hostility against bureaucratic governance is likely to be a wasteful effort as bureaucracy has historically been part of the government machinery. Bureaucratic systems have snaked through the government architecture throughout civilization. The only challenge is how to have a good bureaucracy that facilitates good government. Good government must be democratic, honest and able. Administrators in any country comprise the bulk of society compared to politicians. While bureaucratic governance still faces challenges of politics, complexity, postmodernism and the NPM doctrinal accusations, it appears to be the ‘solution’ to the current problems bewildering African administrative systems. Africa needs a re-launched public service with its foundations in African values.

Keywords: good government, democracy, governance and bureaucracy

Introduction
Where is Africa’s biggest problem of politics or administration? Bad administrators are appointed by politicians and bad politicians are put into office by the administrators! The two knowingly or
unknowingly have historically worked together to destroy the African society. While bad politics breeds bad administration, bad administration incubates bad politics. More interesting is that politics and administration have lived side by side by side of each other since time immemorial. In this paper, we interrogate broadly how good government can be promoted through building a good bureaucracy (run by administrators). If the human race was to be left on their own without any rules to regulate their behaviour and activities, there is a probability that society would have been in chaos. Life would not only be boring but disorganized. One would imagine what a society would look like where everybody would be doing what he or she wishes.

Government creates order in society and regulates (or deregulates) the activities of human beings. While most commentators would heap accusations against government for doing bad things, we must from inception be generous to government as well for the good it does, governments throughout the world do many good things. Governments create jobs, provide security for the life and property of the citizens, work on roads, protect the sovereignty of their states and provide other services. Governments, however, also are known for bad things! Those individuals behind doing good or bad things in society are either bureaucrats or politicians singly, or complimentarily. From the pre-colonial era through the colonial and post-colonial epochs, government has maintained a monopoly of responsibility to organize society. Government particularly in a democratic state has performed this task on behalf of the citizens. Government represents the invisible ‘state’. A state has people, physical boundaries, government and sovereignty. The question whether government has diligently performed its work to the satisfaction of majority citizens is fiercely debatable. But government remains a central feature of society.

To compete for individual survival on this earth, authority to regulate the behaviour of individuals in public space was the basis upon which philosophers such as Thomas Hobbes and John Locke recommended governments to us. Governments were to have social contracts with the citizens. Such governments were to be good governments which must be able, incorruptible and competent. The role of bureaucracy in this endeavor is unquestionable. Why then has bureaucracy received all the attacks within the family of public administration yet good government and bureaucracy share the same ancestors? What would happen to African countries if a number of administrators involved in the protection of our borders as countries did a poor job? What would be the cost of terrorism to a country where bureaucrats do a poor job?

Excellence in public service delivery is undoubtedly a key variable for measuring good governance. The acute crisis in most contemporary African administrative systems is a result of poor administration. Dimeski (2011:188) demonstrates that New Public Management (NPM) as a global reform package has tools for enhancing efficient, effective and productivity suitable to the public sector as compared to bureaucratic governance. However, the current problems that intercede citizen expectations and government functions through the private sector marketization seem to strongly suggest that the market will not be the primary solution. In fact, governments that have made strides in
economic developments have done so through a strong interventionist strategy. In our view, we subscribe to the philosophical refocus of our public administration systems. Our unit of analysis when discussing problems of Africa need to be redirected to bureaucratic governance.

When Aristotle observed that for one man to superintend on many things required him to appoint a number of subordinates, it justified the necessity of administration as a central pillar in any social life (Dimock et al., 1953:3). In all administrative jurisdictions bureaucrats run the administration and implement public policies passed by politicians. Even then, politicians cannot do policy making without input and technical guidance from the administrators/bureaucrats. For this reason, bureaucratic governance has survived in democracies as well as in autocratic regimes. Societal activities have to be accomplished within a framework of acceptable rules implemented by the bureaucracy. Hughes (2003:18) maintains that public administration has a long history, long enough that it parallels the very notion of government. Indeed, public administrators have continued, and will possibly continue, to comprise the bulk of government employment and activities (Peters and Pierre, 2007:1).

The historical fact that civilization and administration have moved side by side since time immemorial is incontestable. During the ancient and medieval periods, there existed sound administrative principles to justify the governance of the times (Shafritz et al., 2011:214). However, early systems of administration were personal - based on loyalty to a particular individual such as a king or minister, instead of being impersonal, based on legality as conceived by an organization or the state (Hughes, 2003:18). Their practices often resulted in corruption and misuse of office for personal gain. Practices that may seem alien in our times were commonplace in earliest administrative systems. For example, patronage employment in state functions was a very common occurrence. People were employed on the basis of nepotism, reliance on friends or relatives or by paying to be recruited. There were certainly other good practices as well.

Bureaucratic organization has been affected by New Public Management (NPM) doctrines. However, some scholars have advocated the “rediscovery” of bureaucracy (Olsen 2006; Pollitt and Bouckaert, 2004). The crisis in African administrative systems seems immune from the NPM prescription. Some ancient administrations built on bureaucratic principles did some commendable job. The building of the Egyptian pyramids with good technology and bureaucratic management styles considering the time periods affords us testimony of the managerial and organizational abilities of ancient Egypt (Inyang, 2008:123).

Inyang (2008) reports that while their system of organization may appear unwieldy, cumbersome, and even wasteful, they point to how bureaucratic governance if well nurtured could contribute to economic development of African countries. The ancient Egyptians appreciated managerial authority and responsibility and they recognized the importance of pooling out job descriptions in detail. It is interesting to note that with this administrative system, one pyramid required 100,000 men, working for
20 years, covering 13 acres, using 2.3 million blocks each weighting an average of 2.5 tons. Beyer (1959:243) in a classic article gives us more insights on ancient bureaucracy. He reports that

...the old Egyptian empire was a unitary state which had local governments as administrative units. At the head of the central government was a king or pharaoh as he came to be known later. Theoretically, he was a god as well as a political ruler. Under the king was the Vizier or prime minister who not only presided over the entire administrative hierarchy but also was the chief justice of the country, with both original and appellate jurisdiction, had charge of the state’s central records office and served as the king’s chief architect. Under the general administration of the Vizier were a large number of administrative departments, among them the treasury, the granaries, agriculture, public works, the armory, and the army. In addition there were the temples of the gods and the mortuary temples of the kings.

In a related development ancient Egypt had local governments which carried out their responsibilities under provinces or norms as they were called by the Greeks. The governors of the norms were appointed by the king. There were also rulers of any large towns in their districts. Each norm was to some degree a copy of the central government and had such counterparts of the latter as treasury, the granaries, and the army. These officials performed central as well as local functions. These ancient examples in Egypt were only part of what bureaucratic arrangements existed in African kingdoms and empires. The Songhai Empire in West Africa and Buganda Kingdom in present Republic of Uganda were known for their strong administrative systems; the weakness therein not withstanding. Waldo (1981:25) reminds us that “public administration has a role in every important field of endeavor: - agriculture, mining and metallurgy, commerce and manufacturing, medicine, transportation, engineering and education.” He reports that, the control of rivers, production of crops, constructing public works, creating and sustaining the military all need the tools, measurements and predictions of public administration.

In a democracy the citizens should have a clear voice and all activities of government should be driven by the desire to satisfy citizen aspirations. No government worth the salt can meet citizen aspirations without a sound and efficient bureaucracy. The problems in Africa-political, economic, and social would owe their genesis from a weak bureaucracy. The bureaucracy that can promote social transformation must be incorruptible, able, effective, accountable, transparent and efficient.We strongly posit that effective government does not just happen, even when there are well-designed constitutions. Good government also must be democratic, able and incorruptible. A democracy (direct or representative) is different from governments which are an absolute monarchy, dictatorship, or an oligarchy.

This paper interrogates an uncalled for paradox that bureaucratic governance is a necessary evil in contemporary administration. Yet our view is that it remains critical pillar for establishing a good government in Africa. While one would question why African countries have not established good government, we submit that the advent of colonialism disorganized a number of societal values upon which the African bureaucracy was anchored. We argue that good government needs a bureaucracy based on African core values. The rest of the paper is arranged as follows: Part two deals with theoretical framework for the paper. Principal–agent theory and democratic theory are the theoretical lenses adopted in the paper. Part three interrogates the linkage between good government and
bureaucratic government. In part four, the paper discusses the challenges and implications of bureaucracy in contemporary African public administration and then makes concluding remarks.

**Theoretical framework**

Most African governments claim to be democratic. By this, they would put citizens at the centre of all government activities. A democracy is a system of government in which the people are active participants of their own government. The ancient Greeks used the word to mean government by the many in contrast to government by the few. In a direct democracy, the people govern themselves by voting on issues individually as citizens. Citizens under participatory democracy engage in affairs that affect them. In indirect or representative democracy, the people elect representatives and give them the responsibility and authority to make laws and to run the government on their behalf. Under a representative democracy, citizens elect their representatives who in turn delegate some powers to those in bureaucracy to work. The citizens are thus the first principals and the elected representatives become the second principals as bureaucrats become agents. The logic of the principal-agent theory and democratic theory become critical theoretical frameworks for analyzing the relationships between principals and agents.

Agency theory is premised on relationships between strategic principals and strategic agents. Every democracy in the world is dependent on an efficient bureaucracy to function legitimately. The principal-agent relationship is constitutive of state institutions, in particular public policy-making institutions. Lane (1993) suggests that public policy making in the public sector involves the problems of typical principal-agent relationships within the private sector. The social contract has been one of the most influential theories of government in the past two hundred years, on which modern democracy and most forms of socialism are established. The social contract theory holds that governments are created by the people in order to provide communal needs that cannot be appropriately fulfilled using purely individual means. Governments exist for the purpose of serving the needs and desires of the people, and the government relationship with the people is clearly stipulated in a social contract (a constitution and a set of laws). Both the government and the people must abide by this contract. Agency theory deals with the design of these contracts.

In particular, agency theory focuses on the relationship between principals and agents who exercise authority on their behalf. However, whenever human interaction involves considerable transaction costs due to the inter-temporal nature of the interaction as well as the complexity of the agreement involved, principal-agent problems arise (Stiglitz, 1987). To address these problems, the principal-agent theory argues that principals must solve two basic tasks in choosing their agents, namely selecting the best agents and create inducements for them to behave as desired and monitoring the behaviors of their agents to ensure that they are performing their tasks well. This is why there are various forms of accountability relationships. Elected representatives are made to account for their actions through elections where those that did not meet the citizen social contract are removed. Bureaucrats also account to the elected representatives through the public accounts committee, local
government committee and other committees of parliament. Special constitutional offices like the auditor general and Ombudsman are also created specifically and report to the legislatures. Commercialization’s of politics and corruption that characterize most elected representatives in Africa have however caused serious assault on these doctrines.

There are two problems that face the principal in choosing the agent. First, the principal can never know everything about an agent. A supervisor can examine a potential employee’s education, skills and personality, and background, but he or she can never be sure of selecting the best person for the job. Potential employees will know more about their own qualifications than potential employers can ever learn. As a result, employers tend to hire lower quality applicants than desired. This is called “adverse selection” problem. Second, the principal can never be sure of knowing the full details of the agent’s performance (Arrow, 1985). Mukoro (2007) contends that leaders (politicians) and bureaucrats occupy a position of trust and service. They are voted into power and appointed into positions of authority, because the institutions in which they perform have statutorily designated it as such. Rules are made which becomes the binding force in the social contract. These rules and legal provisions must be obeyed and applied in all facets of engagement whether elective or appointive. The bureaucracy has a critical role in ensuring that systems work. We turn to this question in the next section.

**Does good government depend on bureaucratic governance?**

The good governance debate and the predecessor NPM doctrines root for a limited government. Governance measures the limited role of government in terms of legal checks (rule of law) as well as constraints on government scope and fiscal size. Governance is mostly used to explore the diminishing capacity of the state to direct policymaking and implementation hence “hollowing out of the state” (Rhodes, 1997). Skelcher (2005) submits that government has become fragmented because of a congested state. Government; or the state (though often wrongly used in this context) is only regarded as one of the actors in managing societal activities. Other players like the civil society organizations, the media, religious institutions, citizens, and the private sector become other important players.

While traditional public administration received serious assault during the 1970s with scholarship shifting to NPM and governance, our view is that the declaration of the death of bureaucracy is likely to remain a myth. Despite the heavy criticism against bureaucracy, it has remained around. There are good advocates of bureaucracy. Lynn, (1987:77) contends that bureaucracy is so often used as a derogatory term, that one forgets that it “was coined by a distinguished sociologist”. Bureaucrats are criticized as “simultaneously timid and ineffectual, and power-seeking and dangerous” (Waldo, 1982). New Public Governance (NPG) examines inter-organizational relationships and their effectiveness in public services delivery, subject to the efficacy of the governance processes that manage these relationships. However, traditional public administration had core values—public interest; service; honesty; integrity, fairness and equity while NPM approaches emphasize professional values
(corporate culture) like Innovation; creativity and continuous improvement (Kernaghan, 2000). Africa’s public administration lacks clear value frameworks at the moment.

Drawing on the Canadian experience, Kernaghan (2000) distills public services values as (1) Ethical values—Integrity; fairness, (2) Democratic values- Impartiality; rule of law and (3) Professional values- Effectiveness; service. Several countries in Africa have a robust history of traditional institutions and the roles which these institutions have played in the course of governance and administration (Mukoro, 2010: 259). The role these institutions in the ‘mis-governance and mis-administration’ of Africa is also paradoxically well documented. Public leadership must guide decisions and actions for sustainable quality services from public institutions, despite significant challenges arising from the global crisis (Alam et al., 2010). While Africa has been mired in a developmental crisis - the generalized incapacity of an economy to generate the conditions necessary for a sustained improvement in the standard of living (Stein, 2000), administrators have surely played their part in causing this crisis.

With the apparent patronage systems in most African administrative systems, the possibility of a good government will remain a dream unless concrete steps are taken. A good bureaucracy is a critical independent variable for establishing a capable government. This bureaucracy must be built on core African values as opposed to imported values that continue to be ‘board roomed’ by public service bureaucrats. Africa is a diverse continent but this diversity is rich in innumerable values that must be exploited to build a robust bureaucracy. The infusion of African values at all levels of government will help create strong and sustainable institutions upon which good bureaucracy and good government will depend. While Africa has to be mindful of the globalised nature of the world necessitating the importation of certain western values in our bureaucracies, such a practice should be so rigid and inflexible that only those that promote the African cause should be accepted.

African systems were historically governed by strict rules and regulations based on prescribed communal values. There could have been some exceptions to the communal ownership of these values. However, it is a known fact that in pre-colonial Africa individuals who violated the agreed societal principles faced the wrath of not only the administrators and politicians of the time but also the entire community members. Decisions were often arrived at through intense consultations and discussions. Society was organized on commonly agreed upon rules and regulations with appellant procedures. This arrangement created order in the management of public affairs. However, in contemporary systems politicians typically seem not to know which policies are best for citizen aspirations and often meander around what affects society. They often rely on bureaucrats and outside advisors pre-occupied with expanding the patronage systems in their own organizations. Bureaucrats are better informed and knowledgeable but have a core competence in manipulating policies to suit their interests.

When are governments said to be good? At a general level, it is when they are more effective in delivering on their mandates. The debate however goes deeper into democratic values. In a
democracy, citizens fund the activities of government through paying taxes. The citizens must receive ‘something’ from government in return. They generally want better public services (delivered efficiently, effectively, reliably, transparently and in accountable ways). These objectives are possible when governments are honest, attend to due process, and all institutions are working within the democratic principles of their establishment. Parliament must do its constitutional work uninterrupted, the executive must be thoroughly committed and competent and the judiciary must be truly independent. All other institutions at whatever levels that has been delegated any responsibility must do the same. When government officials lose their monopoly over force, or prove incapable of extracting needed resources to produce collective goods, non-compliance, resistance, and even state failure are far more likely.

Can governments exist without a bureaucracy? Is it conceivable to have good government without a good bureaucracy? What features should this bureaucracy have? The traditional or the Weberian type? The bureaucracy must be an efficient bureaucracy that takes the democratic values and doctrines seriously. It should be a bureaucracy that strives to promote fundamental public values from all fronts as opposed to the private sector styles of approach to public management which encourages even using public offices for rent seeking. Bureaucratic undertakings have to be within the contexts of the changing world of work. This creates problems for bureaucracy but which can be addressed through committed political and administrative actors. The behaviors and attitudes of all those who run government at whatever level must be tuned to serve the public interests diligently.

Olsen (2005), in an article titled ‘Maybe it is Time to Rediscover Bureaucracy’ posed the following questions which provide an appropriate template for our theoretical analysis:

Is “bureaucracy” an organizational dinosaur helplessly involved in its death struggle? Is it an undesirable and nonviable form of administration developed in a legalistic and authoritarian society and now inevitably withering away because it is incompatible with complex, individualistic, and dynamic societies? Are, therefore, the term bureaucracy and the theoretical ideas and empirical observations associated with it, irrelevant or deceptive when it comes to making sense of public administration and government in contemporary democracies?

Our strong view is in support of the need of a bureaucracy. This bureaucracy must be anchored on the task to modify the behavior and attitudes of public officers. Weber’s theory of bureaucracy highlights six dimensions that constitute parameters of efficiency that African administrative systems badly need: fixed offices; hierarchy; documentation; credentialism and training; hardening of tasks into occupations; and universal standards applicable to all. These principles when fully implemented allow for the efficient and predictable coordination and execution of human action. This is what African democracies lack in the contemporary times. Most African Administrative systems have massive corruption, nepotism, irrationality, and inefficiency which have increased in scope during the NPM paradigms.

Budd (2007) strongly believes that the need for bureaucratic safeguards from the legacy of NPM and the need for standardization in public services and the regularity of their production is urgently needed.
While there is no consensus on the criteria for measuring ‘good governance’, the term commonly includes aspects like political stability, combating corruption, nepotism and mismanagement and promoting transparency, accountability and proper procedures (Panda, 2006:271). Within the politics-administration divide, who is in better position to address the current problems in Africa – politicians or administrators? Vein du Gay (2000) castigates in his book ‘In Praise of Bureaucracy’ advocates of contemporary administrative reforms for claiming that economy, efficiency and effectiveness are fundamentally the same yet in any organizational context, the relationship between the three is complex. He described real purpose of the advocates of reform as follows:

Undermining the bureaucratic ethos is an avowed intention of contemporary reformers, but their understanding of “bureaucracy” like their concept of “efficiency” leaves a lot to be desired. Rather than referring to a form of organization exhibiting many of the characteristics of classic “bureau” contemporary reformers use “bureaucracy” as a composite term for the defects of large organizations.

Reading through the new and old variants of public administration and management, one would see some convergence, a fact that seriously undermines claims for a new and discrete ideal-type of public governance (Budd, 2007). New scholars have posed more fundamental challenges which call for a revisit of the debates posed by traditional public administration and NPM. Osborne (2010) for example has posed seven questions. First is the fundamental question which touches on the what should be the exact unit of analysis in exploring public policy implementation and public service delivery and their implication to theory and practice?. Second, is the architecture question which concerns the organizational architecture best suited for delivering public services in a pluralist state? Third is the sustainability question relating to how can sustainability of public service delivery be ensured? Fourth is the values question that concerns what kind of values underpins public policy implementation and public service delivery? The fifth question is the relational skills question which is about what key skills are required for relational performance? The sixth question is the accountability question – what is the nature of accountability in a fragmented and pluralist state? The final question is how do we evaluate sustainability, accountability and relational performance within open natural public service systems – the evaluation question?

An assembled response to each of the questions would in our view support the bureaucratic system. The unit of analysis in bureaucratic modes is the institutions together with the components. The organizational architecture is one based on clear rules and procedures which survive in a hierarchical arrangement. The sustainability of bureaucracy today despite the hostility has been tested. Traditional bureaucratic models were based on known values of public services and demanded accountability by all that were called to serve. It advocated for continuous training as a basis for enhancing relational skills performance. Certainly, public service has appropriate tools for measuring the sustainability, accountability and relational performance. However, bureaucracy needs to be supported by the behavioral models.

An organizational structure as a normative structure composed of rules and roles specifying more or less clearly, who is expected to do what and how (Scott, 1981) is central to government organization.
However, apart from the positive features that improve the efficient and effective functioning of an organization, bureaucracy is also associated with negative features such as ‘red tape’, non-accountability, unresponsiveness, delay, inflexibility, ineptitude, centralized elitism and undemocratic tendencies. These need to be addressed. Scott alludes to a wide range of theories for establishing governments: greed and oppression, order and tradition, natural rights, and social contract.

Democratic theory is associated with only three of the above reasons. The utility of the governance concept in describing the changing institutional nature of the government (state) is unquestionable although critics point to its conceptual and analytical relevance (Newman, 2001). Public governance which is the mechanism of dispersing powers and resources by public bodies to other players including the private and quasi-private agencies to manage and provide governmental functions and underlying services (Budd, 2007) has been a common concept in Public Administration scholarship. Trust and governance are central to any effective organization. How do governments ensure trust? Traditional bureaucratic public organizations were often determined by democratic imperatives.

Although the term ‘bureaucracy’, in many parts of the world has been associated with pejorative expression, and used to decry the inefficiency, rigidity and lapses that characterize public services, its relevance in improving African society needs to be highly supported. Some scholars have labeled bureaucracy to be “contrived, ambiguous, and troublesome” (Okotoni, 2001). We, however, posit that it is relevant for 21st century administration and will possibly remain so. While “new public management” represents an attempt to translate managerial ideas from the private sector to public organizations, such as contracting out, client orientation and the introductions of market mechanisms, and network management focuses more on mediating and co-coordinating inter-organizational policy making (Klijn and Koppenjan, 2000:136), bureaucracy provides a regulatory regime upon which even the management practices are to be implemented. This in our view implies that even in a pure market-driven model of governance, bureaucracy is still essential.

Governance paradigm advocates for the transfer of government responsibility in delivering public services to other players like the private sector, civil society organization and the media among others. Such an arrangement equally demands an efficient bureaucracy to provide a strong oversight role. Unfortunately, most African countries seem to have transferred the responsibilities of public service to other players without stringent monitoring and regulatory role of the bureaucracy. This has created accountability problems as well as serious service delivery deficits. Budd (2007) concedes that once one starts to explore the realities behind the discourse of post-bureaucratic/transferred public governance change, one often finds little fundamental difference between mainstream public administration and new governance paradigms.

Scholars in Economics and Sociology argue that a strong and well-organized bureaucracy contributed to the economic growth in the Asian miracle economies of the 1990s as well as to the economic growth more generally in semi-industrial countries (Amsden 1989; Evans and Rauch 1999). Its
contribution to Africa in creating good governance cannot be underestimated if only it can be well nurtured to the expected levels. The way the state bureaucracy is organized strengthens poverty reduction in developing countries (Henderson et al 2007). We find that the centralized pre-colonial political institutions of African ethnic groups reduced corruption and fostered the rule of law in colonial and postcolonial Africa based on bureaucratic model of administration. Gennaioli and Rainer (2005) for example argue that pre-colonial centralization improved public goods provision in colonial and postcolonial Africa.

**Challenges of bureaucracy**

Bureaucracy is often defended from the charges of being a narrowly hierarchical, standardized and inflexible organizational form (du Gay, 2000). However, its major challenge is how it stands up to the challenges of networked, virtual and partnership organizational forms which contain flexible working patterns and inclusiveness leading to the permeation of work into personal spheres and vice versa. Proponents of post-bureaucracy suggest that changes in economy and society sound the death knell for the bureaucratic organizational form (Hecksher and Donnellan, 1998). The failure of bureaucratic organizations is very much connected with issues of development since the bureaucracy is central to government's policy formulation and implementation process.

Fred Riggs (1964) in his prismatic theory revealed that administrative malfunctioning in the developing countries was as a result of the overlap of the administrative system with non-administrative or cultural values of the society. Most scholars by application misinterpret this ecological influence to mean that African cultural values were incongruent to ideal bureaucratic features, hence the prominence of bureaucratic malfunctioning in Africa.

Good government is democratic, honest and competent (Nicholas, 2010:2). Public administrators are essential to attaining objectives of each of these pillars. Well managed government enhances the daily lives of citizens. The prices government pay for inefficiency in public services is always heavy. The good and bad things we see in society are from public administrators. What has bewildered African democracies is a dynamic theory that demonstrates how to go from ineffective to effective government. Snaking through the evolution of public administration paradigms from the politics-administration dichotomy to the current New Public Governance Paradigm provides useful ideas on what has gone wrong, where, when and what needs to be done better. Society needs good public services and these are only possible through an efficient administration.

The apparent paradox between bureaucracy and governance debates and the struggle for a superior approach to promoting efficiency has occupied scholars for a while but citizens do not see a difference as they continue to suffer due to poor services. We contend that good government will not be possible in Africa unless there is a re-launched bureaucratic governance. That bureaucratic governance must be based on African values and this raises important questions. How do we generate governments that promote economic growth, relative equality, and political equity? How do we end corruption and
institute impartial but compassionate bureaucrats? How can we transform governments that have failed their citizens abysmally into governments that protect their citizens, provide them with health, education, infrastructure and other public goods? How do we ensure that the agents account to the principals on terms agreed upon? What mechanisms are open to citizens in the African context to demand accountability from the agents within the current environment of corruption and dishonesty?

Concluding remarks
This paper argued that good governance and government is possible in Africa through an acceptable bureaucracy conforming to African value system. A variety of literature and other writings about critiques of most African administration put African leadership in the open space of criticism as custodians of corrupt and poor government administrations. A good government should be democratic, honest and able - but these are characteristics which were found to be lacking in some African administration. The lack or presence of these aspects in African political leadership is associated with the incompatibility between the African value systems and the western values that results in poor governance. In this paper we therefore conclude that Africa needs a re-launched public service with its foundations in African values.

References


The South African Broadcasting Corporation in Championing Transparency and Accountability in Government: the Bigger they ARE the Harder they Fall

Ntwanano Erasmus Mathebula

Abstract: While transparency can be viewed as functioning in a way that is easy for others to see what actions are performed, accountability refers to answerability, blameworthiness, liability, and the expectation of account-giving. The South African Broadcasting Corporation (SABC), as a public broadcaster in a democratic state, must strive to promote transparency and accountability in the activities of government. The SABC is a people centered, content driven, technology enabled, and a sustainable public broadcaster. The mandate of the Corporation is to supply broadcasting and information services to the general public in the Republic of South Africa and beyond its borders. The SABC as a public broadcasting service, ensures the maintenance of South Africa’s identity, equality, unity and development of society, nation building, enrich and strengthen the cultural, political, social and economic fabric of South Africa; ensure plurality of news, views and information and provide a wide range of entertainment and education programmes. The SABC will in pursuit of the above mentioned objectives and in exercising its powers, enjoys freedom of expression and journalistic, creative and programming independence as enshrined in the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996. This paper seeks to put forward a theoretical crossing-point between the SABC as a public broadcasting service, and its roles in promoting transparency and accountability in government activities. The paper further seeks to determine the capacity of the SABC in promoting transparency and accountability against political interference in South Africa by collecting data through peer-reviewed literature, policies and pieces of legislation.

Keywords: SABC, public service, transparency, accountability, government

1Department of Public Administration, University of Limpopo, South Africa. Email: Hongonyi@gmail.com / Ntwanano.Mathebula@ul.ac.za
Introduction

The purpose of this paper is to put forward a theoretical argument on how the SABC as a public broadcaster can against political influence play its role in a democracy by promoting transparency and accountability in government. Broadcasting policies and codes of conduct of the SABC are appealing on paper yet dismally fail in portraying practicality. The vision and mission of the corporation as clearly defined as they are; display ambitious prospects particularly in a democratic dispensation like that of South Africa. The fact that the SABC aims to be people-centered and an information service provider to the general public, presupposes that the general citizens of the Republic will be a central focal of its operations. However, in pursuit of values and broadcasting code, the SABC is proving to be immensely influenced politically especially by the African National Congress (ANC), the ruling party. It is in this regard that the corporation is unable to enjoy the freedom of expression as enshrined in the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996, and thus fails to encourage and promote transparency and accountability in government affairs.

Contextualizing transparency and accountability

Often times accountability is read together with responsibility whereby officials vested with powers are able to give account in conducting their personal dealing, transparency can be viewed as functioning in a way that is easy for others to see what actions are performed, accountability refers to answerability, blameworthiness, liability, and the expectation of account-giving (Ebrahim 2003).

Transparency

Baur and Grimes (2012) traces the history of the concept of transparency and identifies the "broadest doctrine of openness" as the dogma that the general conduct of executive government should be predictable and operate within the strict confines of published codes and standards rather than arbitrarily (O'Hara, 2010). Codes of conduct and set standards are inadequate for the purposes of enforcing transparency in government since there is failure to provide a working definition of what transparency is, or how officials ought to conduct their duties in exercising public affairs. Moreover, transparency comprises the access and the comprehension of information by the public than mere active disclosure. Transparency may be defined not only as the disclosure of government information but also as the access, conception, and its use by the general public (Parigi Geeta and Kailasam 2004; Ginsberg Maeve Halchin and Keegan 2012). According to Sturges (2004), social scientists and practitioners have presented different explanations for transparency; among them is “active disclosure”. To this end, transparency requires a public that can acquire, comprehend, and manipulate information that it receives from government and all its agencies. Transparency International, a global civil society organization that seeks to fight corruption in government, defines transparency as a principle that allows those affected by administrative decisions, business transactions or charitable work to know not only the basic facts and figures but also the mechanisms and processes government engages on (Ginsberg et al. 2012). Baur and Grimes (2012) states that international organizations and NGOs advocate transparency as a precondition for better government quality (Bhatnagar 2003), greater accountability (OECD 2006) and a more limited scope for corruption and impunity.
The concept of publicity, which requires government to publish its information, goes somewhat outside the narrowest definition of transparency, as it factors in the willingness and capacity of media actors to address and draw attention to abuses of power by government officials once detected. Transparency advocates maintain that greater access to government information is a *sine qua non* for greater accountability and better quality of government in the long term (Pasquier and Villeneuve 2007; Maiani Villeneuve and Pasquier 2010). To this end, competition and press freedom as opposed to public broadcasting as a public service would necessitate the SABC to be more rigorous in finding and exposing malpractices in government affairs. However, it should be acknowledged that a public broadcaster enjoying freedom of expression will not necessarily guarantee the detection and the exposure of abuses of power and corruption but somehow plays a role in strengthening the democratic objectives in any government through transparency.

**Accountability**

Ebrahim (2003: 813), delineates accountability as the means by which individuals and organizations report to a recognized authority/ies and are held responsible and accountable for their actions. Accountability is intricate, nonconcrete, a subtle concept, and is also viewed over time as bewildering, becoming a contested issue rather than one which can be resolved with ease (Ndou 2013; Onzima 2013). It is for this contention that Ijeoma and Sambumbu (2013) argue that accountability is increasingly becoming a barometer for effective government performance. Effective accountability results into improving among others; practice of good corporate governance, management of public finances, and service delivery. Ndou (2013) articulates that accountability emerges in various forms ranging from political, legal, public, managerial, professional, bureaucratic and personal, a propensity which is currently not part of the discourse presented by this paper. It should, however, be noted that accountability can extend into other forms not mentioned by Ndou (2013). Ijeomaand Sambumbu (2013) posited that in a liberal democracy, accountability arises the moment one is assigned the authority to determine the utilization of public resources. Furthermore, accountability is imperative because it checks and balances the abuse of powers and authorities by public officials (Mulgan 2003). It is for this rationale that accountability can be a very reminiscent word that is easily used in political dialogues and policy documents because it expresses an image of responsibility, transparency and trustworthiness to those entrusted with official responsibilities. The SABC as a public broadcaster in a democratic dispensation have a role through its media tools and mechanisms in ensuring that public servants entrusted with the role of fulfilling public duties are brought to account in public and be actively engaged. Such can be done through debates open to the public or through radio and television platforms, whereby the general community can actively interact with their own elected government on contemporary government versus community challenges and prospects. By so doing, the SABC will be upholding the democratic principles and perpetuating its role as a public broadcaster.
Public broadcasting in South Africa

Public broadcasting according to Berger and Jjuuko (2007) can be viewed in terms of ‘editorial independence, public accountability, universal service and access, programme diversity and pluralism’ for the purposes of serving the public interest while it remains free from interference. According to McKinsey (1999), public broadcasting plays an indispensable role in the citizens’ perception of their society (Juneau 2000) and the world around them. Because of the special status that broadcasting has, governments, and societies more broadly, have a special interest in the range and quality of their local broadcasting realm. According to Nyman-Metcalf Hills, Honeyman Mbaine, Nyamnjoh Kariithi and Kupe (2003), public broadcasting is critically imperative in African societies as the majority of citizens acquire information, education and entertainment from primarily radio and television. However, television has low permeation than radio because of the high rates of sets, lack of electricity and feeble coverage among many South African residents. In the overwhelming majority of African countries, South Africa included, broadcasting has been the most controlled medium for both technical and political reasons (Mohammed 1994; D’Arma 2009; Benson 2011).

Fourie (2003: 152) posits that the South African public broadcasting service finds itself in the same position as public broadcasting services in the rest of the world and most Africa countries with the same economic, political, cultural and social problems facing all developing countries. According to Duncan (2009) radio remains the most accessible medium in South Africa, reaching 94% of the population by 2008 while free-to-air television has grown steadily to 84% of the population. Radio and television are among the core functions of public broadcasting mandates of the SABC. However the SABC is criticized for mismanagement, corruption, nepotism, and a drop in the quality of news and documentaries, and too few local productions (Fourie 2003: 153; Harber 2014). Furthermore there is mounting disgruntlement that little has happened of the vision for public service broadcasting as formulated during the years of the struggle against apartheid.

There are principles that relate to the structure and autonomy of public service broadcasting in ensuring the credibility of the SABC so that it remains relevant in the democratic dispensation (Juneau 2000; Fourie 2003);

**Universality:** Public broadcasting must be reachable to every citizen of South Africa throughout the Republic, thus ensuring that every citizen understands and follows the programming, and contemporary affairs of government.

**Independence:** If public service broadcasting is to play a role in democracy, it should provide a public sphere where citizens can express ideas freely and in which information, opinions and criticisms can be circulated independently from political influence.

**Distinctiveness:** In the changed media environment where the public broadcaster exists side by side with commercial broadcasters, the issue of uniqueness is increasingly important. Distinctiveness requires that the service offered by SABC distinguishes itself from that of other broadcasting services. In public broadcasting, the public must be able to identify what distinguishes this service from other
services (i.e. commercial broadcasting) concerning the quality and particular ‘charm’ of its programmes.

South African Broadcasting Corporation (SABC): A public service

Burger (2002) postulates that in 1934 General James Barry Munnik Hertzog, Prime Minister of South Africa, ordered an investigation into all facets of broadcasting in South Africa. The investigation eventually resulted in the formation of the SABC, under (Act 22 of 1936). In the beginning the SABC only broadcasted in English. The Act, however stipulated the inauguration of an analogous Afrikaans service while comprehensive transmissions in both official languages became a reality in 1937 and the A and B Programmes, as the services were called, came into being. In terms of section 7 of the Broadcasting Act, 1999 (No. 4 of 1999), on the transfer date the minister responsible must apply for the establishment by incorporation of the SABC to a limited liability company with a share capital as contemplated in the Companies Act, 2008 (No. 71 of 2008 as amended) in which the ‘Corporation’ is the successor of the old Corporation. Upon incorporation, government holds one hundred percent of the shares of the Corporation. It is within this context that the SABC became a public service that consequently distinguishes it from commercial broadcasting. The SABC is listed as one of the major public entities in Schedule 4 of the Public Finance Management Act, 1999 (Act 1 of 1999). The SABC is licensed by the Independent Communications Authority of South Africa (ICASA) to provide public service content in two categories of services: public services and public commercial services.

The SABC’s public service television stations, SABC 1 and 2 are the most watched stations (Duncan, 2009). SABC 3 is licensed as the broadcaster’s public commercial service TV channel. All three existing TV channels are required to carry some of public service programming, including news and current affairs. The SABC’s five national and 13 regional radio stations cover the spectrum of South African languages, and are broadcast on an analogue free-to-air basis (Duncan 2009). There has been some discussion inside the SABC about transforming Radio 2000 into a 24-hour news and current affairs station, using content generated by other stations. It is through this history and undertakings that the SABC came in to being and currently broadcast as a public service in South Africa. In conducting its affairs the SABC must conduct its affairs in conjunction with the provisions of media freedom and freedom of the press as enshrined in the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa of 1996.

Media freedom and freedom of the press

In 1994, a democratic political system was established, thereby culminating South Africa’s long history of persecution and censorship. It was in 1996 that South Africa had a constitution that is comprehensive and aims at remedying the inequalities and legacies of the apartheid government. Freedom of the press is provided for by section 16 (Freedom of Expression) of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa of 1996. According to van Leeuwen (2012), the country’s long scuffle for press freedom is a fundamental element of a democratic society (Serfontein 2013), and should be upheld and respected as it has finally been realized. Since the promulgation of the Protection of the
Information Bill in 2008 and the 2010 proposed Media Appeals Tribunal, it is contended that these developments may disturb the country’s press freedom awkwardly. When the ANC government proposed the Media Appeals Tribunal, several protests and campaigns were mounted by organisations such as the Avaaz and the Right2Know Campaign (Leeuw 2012). Both the Media Appeals Tribunal of 2010 and the Protection of Information Bill have been condemned for being unconstitutional and aiming to disrespect the freedom afforded to the media and other broadcasting mechanisms. Rivals often refer to section 32 of the Constitution of 1996, which states that "every person has the right of access to all information held by the state or any of its organs in any sphere of government in so far as that information is required for the exercise or protection of any of their rights".

Freedom of expression sits at the heart of a democracy. According to section 6 (2) of the Broadcasting Act, 1999, the Corporation (SABC) will in pursuit of its objectives and in application of its powers, enjoy freedom of expression and journalistic, creative and programming independence. In the absence of freedom of expression for the media, good governance cannot exist unless there is a free and independent media out there carrying out a watchdog role and ensuring transparency and accountability in government affairs (Somolekae 1998; Ayee 1998; Sebola 2012). Media that is tied to its government such as the media in Zimbabwe and Swaziland cannot carry out a watchdog role of the public officials administrative and government functions (Louw 2008). Such media will also be unable not criticize the government or show up its shortcomings and those of the incumbents in office. Such result in a slide into totalitarianism and corruption. Only a free and sovereign media independent from government controls and free to raise government-ills can be a public watchdog. One country where there is independent media in Africa, even though with variable results, is South Africa.

SABC as an agent for transparency and accountability

In a democracy as that of South Africa where there are principles, rules, codes of conduct and pieces of legislation, a public broadcaster (i.e. SABC), promoting transparency and accountability should not be an issue of contention. However, with the political squabbles within the corporation and political influence (Fourie 2003; Vavi 2014; NevondweOdekuand Raligilia 2014) injected by the government of the day (i.e. ANC), the SABC finds itself in a realm which prevents the proper exercising of its mandate. This consequently bears an adverse effect on the ability to expose corruption (NevondweOdekuand Raligilia2014) and malpractices among public officials. In a verge of ensuring that the SABC as a public service promotes transparency and accountability in government, it is expected that there is editorial independence in the corporation (Berger and Jjuuko 2007). Furthermore, Berger and Jjuuko (2007) alludes that using the similar principles like those applied in commercial broadcasting, the SABC could achieve its mandate in a democratic society. Promoting transparency and accountability consequently means that the SABC will be acting in the best interests of the general public. However, this position is far-fetched whereby the SABC fails to champion transparency and accountability in government. This is so because public broadcasting in South Africa is troubled with political interference (Fourie 2003; Sebola 2012; Harber 2014) and poor management.
Conclusion
As a result of political influence and interference in the affairs of the SABC, the corporation is under immense pressure and therefore fails to champion transparency and accountability in government. This paper attempted to put forward a theoretical perspective on public broadcasting and how the SABC, as a public broadcaster can be used as an agent for promoting transparency and accountability in government. To this end, South Africa has numerous policies and pieces of legislation governing public broadcasting but however fails to thrive in fulfilling its mandate, twenty years in to democracy. This paper therefore argues that there is a need to review and revise public broadcasting laws, if the SABC is to remain relevant in a democracy. This is critically important particularly with South Africa possessing a constitution that provides for freedom of expression as a pillar in ensuring transparency and accountability in government through public broadcasting and the media in general.

References


Combating Climatic Risks and Vulnerability: Prospects and Challenges

Kola O. Odeku

Abstract: In developing countries, rural areas where the poor live and work are usually neglected by the government. The rural poor are denied socio-economic amenities and basic services such as water, modern energy and food that make life worth living. They are also more vulnerable to the impacts of global climate changes affecting the environment and agriculture which are their major sources of livelihood. Most of the rural people are chronically perpetually poor and majority are peasant farmers. In South Africa, as part of sustainable solutions to assist the rural poor, the Department of Science and Technology is funding research activities to tackle the challenges of climate change through the rural universities. This paper examines the intrinsic roles of these initiatives and points out that it was a step taken in the right direction because they are established to combat global climate changes. It also looks at the challenges and avenues for improvements.

Keywords: global change, information, decision-makers, research centre, rural poor

Introduction

Hardly a day will pass without news on climate calamities (Hansen 2009). The recent floods that swept away both living and non-living things in Bangladesh, Pakistan and India are typical examples of the devastating effect of global climate change. Scientific reports have shown that these calamities will not abate anytime soon unless collective action is taken to tackle global warming and climate change (Suranovic 2013). The bizarre weather events are creating novel risks and environmental challenges. This will continue unless there is a concerted effort by the international community to cut down

1 Kola O. Odeku, Faculty of Management and Law, School of Law, University of Limpopo, South Africa, E-mail: kooacademics@gmail
greenhouse gas emissions responsible and causing climate change (Holmgren 2012). Developing countries are the most affected and hardest hit with the impacts of climate change (Beck 2009). Against this backdrop, Ahmed et al. (2009) observe thus “extreme climate events could influence poverty by affecting agricultural productivity and raising prices of staple foods that are important to poor households in developing countries.”

Agricultural sector remains the main source of livelihood for rural communities in Africa, providing employment to more than 60 percent of the population and contributing to about 30% of the gross domestic product (Diao et al. 2007). Agriculture is inherently sensitive to climate conditions and is one of the most vulnerable sectors to the risks and impact of climate change (Kelly and Adger 2000). Consequently, an adverse effect on agriculture due to climate change would affect the livelihood of rural people (McGuigan et al. 2002). Most of the Southern African Development Community (SADC) regions are becoming warmer and drier due to the impact of climate change (Nhemachena and Hassan 2007). The intense heat is having unbearable impact on food production as the regions are over-reliant on rain-fed agriculture (Adetula 2011).

With the frequency and intensity of extreme climate events predicted to change in the future, informed policy design and analysis are required for an understanding of which countries and groups are going to be most vulnerable to increasing poverty (Ahmed et al. 2009). Undoubtedly, most of the developing countries and in particular, African continent are experiencing climate-induced poverty (Adano and Daudi 2012).

Apart from climate-related stressors being experienced by the developing countries, they are also experiencing multiple development stresses; notably poor service delivery, low quality of life, poverty, poor and fragile infrastructure (Huhn et al. 2005), inadequate supply of basic socio-amenities, infrastructure, water and modern energy, complex disease burden and food crises (Black et al. 2008). Global environmental change, drought and land degradation are exacerbating their vulnerability (Turner et al. 2007).

Climatic predictions are becoming a reality, as most of the developing countries are experiencing unprecedented hardships and sufferings as a result of the impact of global climate change (Gordon, 2007). Since we have knowledge of the major causes of these climatic calamities, there is need to take appropriate mitigating and adaptive steps to tackle, contain and curb them (Gelbspan 2005). Research and demonstrations have proven to solve many natural calamities problems and challenges; global climate change can be effectively tackled and addressed through engagement in proactive robust research activities (Rodríguez et al. 2009). Higher Educational Institutions are well equipped with human resources and technologies that could be used to conduct research and find solutions to the global climate change challenges and the risks and vulnerability they pose to humanity and the planet (Muff et al. 2013). Pursuant to this, there is an ongoing innovative robust collaboration initiated by the Department of Science and Technology (DST) under the auspices of South African Risk &
Vulnerability Atlas (SARVA) to propel and drive South Africa towards a knowledge economy in the areas of mitigation and adaptation to global climate change. In South Africa, three Universities were selected for this collaboration and what is remarkable about the collaboration is that virtually all the prominent Historically Black Universities such as, University of Fort Hare, Alice, Eastern Cape, Walter Zisulu University, Mthatha Eastern Cape and University of Limpopo, are involved in the Risk and Vulnerability Assessment. Each University hosts Risk and Vulnerability Assessment Centre for the purposes of intensive research activities on the issues surrounding risks, vulnerability, and climate change and so on. These centres are currently funded by DST, South Africa through the National Research Foundation (NRF). The duration of the project is for 10-years and the focus is to achieve the development of innovations to propel South Africa towards a knowledge economy in the area of climate change and development. Pursuant to this, the center is tasked to “conduct research, train students, collate information relating to global change and subsequently relay the information to the South African Risk and Vulnerability Atlas (SARVA) through collaboration with the Council for Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR).”

SARVA “provides easily understood global change sensitivity and vulnerability information at regional, national, provincial and municipal levels. It also supports national initiatives such as the National Disaster Management Framework. The Atlas provides an electronic geographical information system and involves South African researchers from various disciplines to continuously update the content with new research. It captures data related to aspects such as groundwater, surface water, forests, biodiversity, human health, crops, demographics, economics and social dimensions”(SARVA, 2014). Information fed into SARVA becomes useful tool for decision makers to formulate policy and also to assist in the flow of information from researchers to the society.

In a nutshell, SARVA performs the following roles namely “feeds information into SARVA through CSIR, assist decision makers in identifying risk, to enable planning and mapping a future which will be more resilient to global change for the country, improve flow of information from the researchers to society which will bridge the gap between global change science and policy.”

These centers also have international collaborator. The Southern African-Nordic Centre (SANORD) is collaborating with them in the areas of research, data sharing and exchange programmes on climate change. SANORD has been collaborating with universities in Southern Regions and the centers have tapped into their well-resourced equipment and funding opportunities. According to SANROD, “the Southern African-Nordic Centre (SANORD) is a partnership of higher education institutions from all the Nordic countries and southern Africa. Its primary aim is to promote multilateral research cooperation on matters of importance on the development of both regions. SANORD is committed to advancing strategic, multilateral academic collaboration between institutions in the two regions, seeking to address new local and global challenges of innovation and development” (SANROD 2013).
All these initiatives have a common goal to address and curb global climate surge. One of the methods to achieve this is through scientific sharing of information and using them to take useful decisions that will curb global climate change.

**Literature review**

The world is becoming more vulnerable due to the impact of climate changes (Adger 2010). Hans-Martin (2007) defines vulnerability to climate change thus "the degree to which a system is susceptible to, and unable to cope with, adverse effects of climate change, including climate variability and extremes...Vulnerability is a function of the character, magnitude, and rate of climate change and variation to which a system is exposed, its sensitivity, and its adaptive capacity."

Adger (2006) describes vulnerability as "the state of susceptibility to harm from exposure to stresses associated with environmental and social change and from the absence of capacity to adapt. Antecedent traditions include theories of vulnerability as entitlement failure and theories of hazard." This state of vulnerability of the planet is caused by "the uptake of anthropogenic carbon since 1750 has led to the ocean becoming more acidic, with... increasing body of observations that gave a collective picture of a warming world" (Parry 2007).

Climate change is manifesting in different dimensions and exposing the environment to high risk levels that are very novel (Hans-Martin 2007). They are having devastating negative impacts on the environment (Barnett and Adger, 2003) by causing health hazards, destroying agricultural products, flooding and so on (Blaikie et al. 2004).

The impacts of climate changes are creating real threats to human existence and the ecosystems. Barnett and Adger (2003) pointed out that "climate change-induced sea-level rise, sea-surface warming, and increased frequency and intensity of extreme weather events puts the long-term ability of humans to inhabit atolls at risk... this risk constitutes a dangerous level of climatic change to atoll countries by potentially undermining their national sovereignty."

These climatic risks are presenting great challenges to both climate change research and policy. As part of sustainable solutions, they should be confronted through intensive research activities in the core areas of risks and vulnerability. Data collected from these research activities will be useful for scientists and the policy makers in order to make decisions that will degrade and curb the risks and vulnerability. It is pertinent to point out that, the assessment of vulnerability includes a measure of exposure to risk factors and sensitivity to risk factors (Hans-Martin and Klein 2006). Together, these constitute potential impact of such risks, (Haines et al 2006) and the capacity to manage and respond to those risks (Davies et al. 2010).
South Africa has taken a very bold step to launch SARVA with the aim of “assisting decision-makers in identifying risk, planning and mapping a future, which would be more resilient to the changing climatic conditions in the country” (Van Der Merwe 2010).

SARVA is a catalyst that drives research in the areas of climate risks and vulnerability reduction strategies through contemporary information derived from the data. The data will serve many climate changes solution purposes especially in the areas of mitigation and adaptation interventions. The scope includes but not limited to human health, coastal zones, commercial forestry, water and agriculture. To do this, there is need to develop capacity that will undertake all the research activities and postgraduate students perfectly fit into these feats.

In developing country like South Africa, the poor in the rural areas are experiencing the negative impacts of climate changes the most (Ahmed and Diffenbaugh 2009). This is making them to be intensively vulnerable and the intervention of the DST to establish RVSC at the Universities in these areas is considered a proactive sustainable solution. The establishment of the centres have upgraded the capacities of the rural Universities and their researchers and the overall benefits is that research works being conducted are benefitting the rural poor and satisfying local adaptation, particularly for ease of use in solving local risks and vulnerability facing the rural poor (O'Keeffe et al. 2009).

Establishing Risk and Vulnerability Science Centres

RVSCs are established consequent of the initiative of the DST essentially under the Human and Social Dynamics Grand Challenges in relation to global change where South Africa seeks to “enhance its research and modelling capabilities to anticipate the complex consequences of change and its impact on the dynamics of individual and social behaviour (decision-making, risk-taking and adaptation) at all levels; have better understanding of the cognitive and social structures which create and define change; and help people and organisations better manage profound or rapid change.”

DST has come up with a Ten-Year Innovation Plan (2008-2018). The focus will be to use contemporary science and technology to address major challenges of global climate change and the attendant risks and vulnerability. The beneficiaries of these initiatives are the rural poor. The roll out of the initiatives and the impacts on the rural communities will definitely have some positive socio-economic benefits in the sense that there will be stability in the agricultural sector which is the main economic livelihood of the rural poor. It will provide sustainable jobs to the people and will discourage the drift from the rural to urban centres. Presently, one of the Universities where RVSC is located has started recording tremendous outcomes and successes. The centre has started engaging with the community by providing assistance in the areas of crops and soil and related agricultural issues. The assistance is in the form of partnership where the centre is working with the community through its experts. The data collected from the venture is being processed and also made available to decision makers. The initiatives are making robust and sustainable inroads as the plights of the rural poor are being alleviated and at the same time, useful platforms are being
provided for sustainable climate change solutions. To this end, climate change problems are being addressed as part of three Grand Challenges Programmes namely; Space Science and Technology, Global Change, and Human and Social Dynamics (Kaplan 2008). While the focus of this paper is on global change challenge, the space science and technology grand challenge is also relevant and useful as part of the solution to the global change challenge because it “aims to improve space observation technology (such as satellite and telescopic technologies) which will permit better monitoring of climate change and its impact on terrestrial systems (example, ecological systems and biodiversity, water, disasters, settlement patterns and development, etc.) with a view to use such data to better manage natural resources and respond to climate change and disasters” (Beer and McCracken 2012). Monitoring and evaluation are essential for purposes of establishing whether the initiatives are working. And if they are not working to identify possible areas where interventions are needed.

As part of the solution to global change challenge, the third grand challenge, social dynamics is also significant because it seeks to “mitigate against climate change by providing energy security through the development of clean coal technologies and alternative environmentally friendly renewable and sustainable energy” (Kaygusuz 2009). This presupposes that South Africa will have to reduce carbon emissions drastically and substitute fossil fuels that emit carbon dioxide with sustainable renewable energy. In the recently released assessment report, the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC 2013) indicated that “natural and anthropogenic substances and processes that alter the Earth’s energy budget are drivers of climate change. Radiative forcing (RF) quantifies the change in energy fluxes caused by changes in these drivers for 2011 relative to 1750, unless otherwise indicated. Positive RF leads to surface warming, negative RF leads to surface cooling. RF is estimated based on in-situ and remote observations, properties of greenhouse gases and aerosols, and calculations using numerical models representing observed processes. Some emitted compounds affect the atmospheric concentration of other substances. The RF can be reported based on the concentration changes of each substance. Alternatively, the emission-based RF of a compound can be reported, which provides a more direct link to human activities. It includes contributions from all substances affected by that emission. The total anthropogenic RF of the two approaches are identical when considering all drivers. Though both approaches are used in this Summary for Policymakers, emission-based RFs are emphasized.”

Under its Global Change Grand Challenge, South Africa seeks the following outcomes to “establish an internationally recognised science centre of excellence with climate change research and modelling capabilities benefiting the entire continent; establish an internationally recognised centre of excellence focused on the Southern Oceans and its contribution to global change processes; strengthen research and global monitoring capabilities on Marion Island, Antarctica and the Southern Oceans in partnership with other nations; generate robust regional scenarios for the rate and impact of climate change and extreme weather conditions for South Africa and the continent; and initiate climate change mitigate and adaptation actions.”
The international community had considered innovative research activities as a powerful tool to tackle and curb the surge of global change (Ekins 2005). In South Africa, Human and Social Dynamics Grand Challenges, especially in relation to global change are being used to “enhance its research and modelling capabilities to anticipate the complex consequences of change and its impact on the dynamics of individual and social behaviour (decision-making, risk-taking and adaptation) at all levels; have better understanding of the cognitive and social structures which create and define change; and help people and organisations better manage profound or rapid change.”

South Africa is employing holistic approach to the fight against climate change (Stringer et al. 2009). The three grand challenges form part of the efforts of the government to curb global climate change. The country is employing and deploying a whole range of interventions in virtually all disciplines to address and tackle global climate change.

**The intrinsic role of RVSC**

These centres engage in a wide range of research activities and issues relating to mitigation and adaptation to climate change under the stewardship of local University experts in identifying risks and vulnerability. Data collected is used for the purpose of finding useful and meaningful solutions to climate change challenges. Undoubtedly, these research activities, evaluations and assessments of the data collected and findings are having positive impact on the social economic livelihoods of the rural people and more importantly, providing holistic assistance to the local and rural communities. Scientifically, the centre is developing “appropriate technologies and assessment tools for better monitoring of change, risks and vulnerability, develop models to address issues associated with Global Change at provincial and national levels as well as for the SADC region in particular and the African continent in general. They will also map identify environmental and other risk factors through the use of satellite imagery and Geographic Information System (GIS), develop sustainability assessment methodologies relevant for the rural context, develop technological innovations for mitigation and adaptation to climate change” (DST 2010).

The DST initiatives are in line with what the Conference of the parties (COP 17) meeting of 2011 enjoined member states to do, (Chevallier 2011) which is to develop comprehensive responses to the problems of climate change (Vogel et al. 2010). This entails the establishment of capacity and systems for monitoring, predicting and identifying vulnerability hotspots and developing and implementing effective mitigation and adaptation measures (Roberts 2008). South Africa is particularly proactive in this regard and it is, through the DST, continually funding several initiatives at rural Universities in South Africa.

Above initiatives and roles being played by the centres become imperative considering that climate change is impacting on common natural resources that are useful to human livelihood and survival (Rust and Rust, 2013) such as “water resources; ecological and biodiversity systems; the polar ice; available land for food production, human settlement and commercial forestry; human, animal and
plant diseases and pests; oceans systems and marine life” (Spellerberg 2005). There is therefore the need to activate all interventions that will assist to prevent extinction of all these useful natural resources. Otherwise, if nothing is done, this might make the affected people migrate to other areas thereby causing distortion in settlement patterns (Eldredge 2000). The consequences will have huge impact hence, the need for intervention in order to tackle and curb the predicted catastrophic calamities (Cuff 2001).

Activities of the RVSC at the University of Limpopo

There are many research activities centered on the issues of global climate change at the University of Limpopo. The mounting of the RVSC is complementary to the existing activities. Establishing and sustaining a centre requires having the right skills and expertise. The RVAC at the University is benefitting from a whole range of existing research capacities in all disciplines and some of them have become part and parcel of the centre for purposes of conducting Trans and Cross-disciplinary research works. Research at this level needs students who will be able to work with minimum supervision at the postgraduate level. A significant number of students have enrolled to the masters and doctoral studies. Their research focuses are derived from the niche areas of the centre considering that the outcomes should contribute to knowledge on how to solve community problems and at the same time contribute to the pool of data which will form the basis for decision making by the decision makers.

Ayisi (2012) has given an insight into the outcomes and successful products of the centre thus “the South African Risk and Vulnerability Assessment Centre primarily is an information technology platform, designed to facilitate the uptake of information for use in policy formulation and other relevant applications. RVAC is developing an atlas to assist decision makers in identifying risks to enable planning and mapping a future that will be more resilient to climate change. The centre also works to improve the flow of information from researchers to society to bridge the gap between global climate change science and policy.”

Uncertain and unstable climate are creating new challenges in all walks of lives and the changes will be around for years to come (Flannery 2006). The only survival strategy is to device adaptive methods to cope with the uncertainty (Stern, 2009) while intensifying efforts on reducing emissions in the long run (Barnett et al. 2005). Towards this end, the centre will continue to engage with the community, providing adaptive and mitigating assistants by identifying the communities’ risks and vulnerabilities and develop and apply appropriate adaptive measures. Undoubtedly, through this sustained research community based activities, poverty will be alleviated and the overall goal of strengthening the resilience of the local communities in Limpopo Province will be met.

Furthermore, Ayisi (2012) also asserted that to strengthen “the scientific knowledge regarding the design, application and policy translation of risk and vulnerability assessments; the linkages between the scientists and local communities through collaboration on case studies, pilot projects and action
research; internationalisation of research, delivery of a high level work-ready workforce, relevant new-
knowledge generation for the region and further a-field, increased student and publication outputs, 
staff development, increased career choices and more diversified employability of UL graduates; 
achievement of aims set by DST for regional RVAC centres; better Regional Planning and Resource 
Management.”

Against the backdrop of the roles and responsibilities, Ayisi (2012) developed the knowledge and 
research team which include but not limited to “adapting the way we live: Preparing for rapid change 
and extreme events, Water security for South Africa, Food and fiber security for South Africa, Human 
health, Planning for sustainable urban development in South Africa; Reducing human footprint, Waste 
minimisation methods and technologies, Conserving biodiversity and ecosystem services, e.g. clean 
drinking water, Institutional integration to manage ecosystem and ecosystems services, Innovation for 
sustainability; Resilience and capability, Dynamics of transition at different scales – mechanisms of 
innovation and learning, Options for greening the development state, Understanding a changing 
planet; Observation, monitoring and adaptive management, Dynamics of oceans around southern 
Africa, Dynamics of the internal earth systems, Linking the land, air and sea, Improving model 
predictions at different scales. Coastal zones.” Currently, different researchers are researching and 
collaborating with the centre to find solutions to the global climate change in the areas of water 
pollution, statistics and operations research, legal aspects of global change and socio-economic 
impacts, riverine and terrestrial systems and so on.

The center is addressing the problems of global climate change by playing leading roles in global 
climate change research and sustainable development. The outcomes of the research activities are 
filling knowledge gaps and are sources with which decision makers are making informed policy 
decisions to combat challenges of global climate changes (Paterson 2010).

Challenges and the need for improvement
The initiative by the DST under the auspices of SARVA is noble and achievable, however inadequate 
researchers with skills, expertise and capacity to take on the research responsibility is making it less 
than optimally effective and functional. More importantly, the few researchers with capacity have huge 
workloads in the areas of teaching and learning. Combining this with research and supervision could 
be, at times, counterproductive. Sourcing for and retaining postgraduate students are presenting 
unbearable challenges. Even with the bursary incentives, a lot of students do not want to pursue 
postgraduate studies. The reason for this is that majority of the students are indigents from rural 
background. To most of them, receiving undergraduate degrees for purposes of seeking job 
opportunities are paramount in view of the fact that they are from poor backgrounds.

With regard to the 10 year duration of the programme, it presents a picture of uncertainty because of 
the question: what happens next after the 10 years elapses? The initiator needs to come clear and 
address this uncertainty. It will be a good research investment if it can be sustained beyond 10 years.
This is important considering that the issues surrounding global climate change have come to stay. The climate calamities predictions made in the different scientific reports transcend 10 years. Hence, the reasons for the centre to continue to function and as a matter of fact, improve and strengthen its activities beyond the 10 year plan.

Conclusion

Conducting research activities where the findings and outcomes are deployed to solve human problems is part of the focus of all meaningful governments and the international community. They provide solutions to the plights of human sufferings. Currently, some of the communities surrounding the centres have started benefiting from the efforts of the researches, particularly in the areas of sustainable agriculture and poverty reduction. However, optimal impact of the centres to the communities and South Africa at large is a gradual and long term process. It is hoped that the centres will become a sustainable ventures beyond the 10 year plan stipulated.

References


Ayisi KK 2012. Innovations and Technologies for Responding to Global Climate Change: The Role of the Risk and Vulnerability Assessment Center (RVAC), South Africa. From http://www.iowastatedaily.com/calendar/lectures/event_e0ea53a8-2c0c-11e2-a9ff-001a4bdf8787a.html. (Retrieved on February 18, 2014).


Gelbspan R 2005. *Boiling Point: How Politicians, Big Oil and Coal, Journalists, and Activists Have Fueled the Climate Crisis-And What We Can Do to Avert Disaster.* basic Books, New York, USA.


Hansen J 2009. *Storms of my grandchildren: the truth about the coming climate catastrophe and our last chance to save humanity.* Bloomsbury, New York, USA.


Rust JM, Rust T 2013. Climate change and livestock production: A review with emphasis on Africa. 43(3): 256-267.


Transforming the Mining Industry in South Africa: Issues, Challenges and Prospects

Kola O. Odeku and Olufunmilayo F. Odeku

Abstract South Africa is endowed with valuable mineral resources in water, on the ground and beneath the earth. This attracts a lot of people to the exploration and exploitation of these resources. The government, since the advent of the democratic dispensation in 1994, controls the mineral resources and has put in place regulatory framework for prospecting them. It is against the backdrop of ensuring sustainable mineral prospecting activities that this paper looks at legislative interventions that have been put in place, in time and space. The paper also looks at various competing rights on mineral resources and the roles of all stakeholders and role players.

Keywords: multinationals, bourgeoisies, mining, exploitation, segregation, economic emancipation

Introduction
South Africa is endowed with abundant natural mineral resources spread all over the country's geographical landscape (Durning 1990). Prior to the country's attainment of full democracy in 1994, the apartheid white regimes were in control of all mineral resources and they used them maximally to their benefits. From 1948 until 1990, the South African political and legal systems were based on apartheid and a philosophy of racially separate socio-economic development underwritten and enforced by white minority apartheid regimes (Saul and Bond 2014). The Black majority South Africans were excluded from all aspects of socio-economics goods and developments including

1 Kola O. Odeku and Olufunmilayo F. Odeku, Faculty of Management and Law, School of Law, University of Limpopo, South Africa, E-mail: kooacademics@gmail.com
participating and benefiting optimally from all types of mineral resources, instead they were given jobs as mine workers to work in underground mines for meagre wages (Appolis 1996). South Africa became a full-fledged constitutional democracy in 1994 and as part of Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) of the elected African National Congress (ANC) (Osaghae 2003), transformative initiatives began and the agenda was shrewdly pursued by all the elected members cutting through socio-economic, political, judicial, industrial and resources landscapes.

While South Africa has undergone a major political transformation, the same cannot be said of transformation in the mining industry (Hamann 2004). This is because while the Black majority dominate the rank and file, the real management sectors are still dominated by white minority (Andreasson 2006). This presupposes that even though apartheid had been dismantled in South Africa, white racial domination, particularly in the mining industry is yet to be dismantled and rooted out (Lowenberg and Kaempfer 1998). Therefore, the issues surrounding lack of transformation in the mining industry are sources of constant conflicts, political debates, accusations and counter-accusations and suspicions amongst others (Hamann et al. 2008). The recent Marikina massacre of 34 Lonmin mine workers by the police is an example of issue of lack of transformation and suppression of the poor miners in the mining industry. The “poor, black working class miners were shot down like animals, killed for profit. South Africa remains possibly the most unequal society in the world – the black majority still faces a life of poverty and toil, if they are lucky enough to even find work; while the still largely white elite, enjoy a life more familiar to the suburbs of Atlanta or Los Angeles, than a country in which over the half the country’s citizens live below the poverty line, without access to basic services”(Fogel 2012).

Transformation process needs patience and endurance, however, it seems the transformation curve is either too slow or there is no political will to fast track and delivers transformational goods to the people (Luecke 2003). These are challenges affecting radical transformation of the mining industry in South Africa. While we have the knowledge of the ensuing problems regarding the issues of mining transformation and the challenges inherent in delivering, continuous conversations and debates by all the stake players and role players will definitely crystallise and acceptable solutions and prospects will be attained in time and space. Hence, this article examines the ensuing issues, analyses the challenges and offers solutions on the way forward.

**Conceptual clarifications**

The word transformation is commonly used, especially among the black majority in South Africa when they perceive that what the constitution promised them are not being provided or fulfilled by the government (Møller and Dickow 2002). It is interesting to note that virtually every black South African is cautious of the word transformation and they are not hesitant to invoke and chant it during poor or lack of socio-economic goods and services delivery protests (Bond 2006). The ruling party African national Congress (ANC) and one of the newly elected opposition party-the Economic Freedom Fighters (EFF) has adopted the word as their main slogan during 2014 general elections and in the
parliament of South Africa. The EFF added the words ‘radical economic’ ‘in our live time’ thereby making it a full slogan ‘radical economic transformation in our live time.’ The plausible explanation for the intensification of the call for radical transformation is that in spite of the democratic dividends, the poor black majority in South Africa are poorer after two decades of democratisation while a few minority that have been gainfully employed as government officials continue to prosper through corruption in high places (Alexander 2013). In the industrial sector, whites still dominate both the economic and the industry (Marais 2001). The multinationals white monopolist capitalists with a few of the adopted black cronies are in charge of virtually all lucrative businesses in South Africa (Freund 2006). Mining is one of the main economic and foreign earning sectors in South Africa but it is being controlled by the multinationals (Chabane and Roberts 2006). The black majority are merely hired to work deep underground to bring out the resources (Webster and Omar 2003). Majority of them are casual workers who earn meagre salaries just to feed themselves without any benefits. The sector has therefore been susceptible to incessant strikes because of the poor working conditions and low wage. The call for transformation in this sector has become a daily routine but it seems that the few black elites and their supporters in government are slow or refusing full implementation of transformation in the sector.

Transformation is described as a “marked change, as in appearance or character, usually for the better.” Within an organisation, it is “a process of profound and radical change that orients an organization in a new direction and takes it to an entirely different level of effectiveness. Unlike ‘turnaround’ (which implies incremental progress on the same plane) transformation implies a basic change of character and little or no resemblance with the past configuration or structure” (Carrington 2010). The essence is to jettison how things are done in the past, and turn a new page through transformational curve which means alternative way of doing things (Adams 2005).

Transformation as a process means changes to the structure or improvement by changing the complexion of the organisation in terms of the employees and management in order to give the organisation a new life and improve the smooth operation of the organisation (Cascio 2003). This transformational process has been heavily criticised by well-meaning South Africans as very slow and failing to deliver promises contained in the 1996 constitution and other pieces of interventions that have been put in place to deliver and fulfil the transformational constitutional mandates (Stolten 2007). Delivery is apparently lacking in the mining sector with zero transformation. This is causing agitation and suspicions, especially regarding a few blacks who have been entrusted to ensure that the transformational agenda becomes a reality in our life time (Vorster 2004). To this end, there is lack of transformational leadership (Bass and Riggio 2005) in which “the leader identifies the needed change, creates a vision to guide the change through inspiration, and executes the change with the commitment of the members of the group” (April and April 2007). Due to this leadership challenge, transformation in the sector is static and there have been no improvement whether minor or major in the sector except for those few blacks who had been adopted by the White bosses to participate and benefit. Some of the ANC party members are also deployed to some of these industries but they are unable to do the right things (Burns 2003). The overall result of this is that the inequality gap continues
to widen (Seekings and Nattrass 2002). This is creating conflicts and vicious violence protests (Deegan 2014). The gap elasticity has been stretched to the point that it has broken. Killings and murders of all sorts of people including rival workers in different trade unions is the order of the day (Higson-Smith 2002). Constant conflicts are being witnessed on a daily basis in communities where the mines are located (Frankel 2013). The government is failing to provide ample leadership because some of them have compromised their positions (Watkins and Bazerman 2003). The majority poor black South Africans continue to suffer as a result of lack of leadership to provide ample and sustainable transformation in the sector (Mashigo 2010).

Literature review

As far back as 1914, Sol Plaatjie the first Secretary of the ANC, described the lives and plights of black miners thus “two hundred thousand subterranean heroes who, by day and by night, for a mere pittance lay down their lives to the familiar `fall of rock` and who, at deep levels, ranging from 1,000 to 3,000 feet in the bowels of the earth, sacrifice their lungs to the rock dust which develops miners’ phthisis’ and pneumonia ”(Fogel 2012). This statement was made a century ago. The sad news is that plights and situations of the poor mining workers have not changed or improved in 2014. Even though the racist legislation of the apartheid laws governing mining and ownerships (Durning 1990) have been permanently uprooted and replaced by a constitution which provides that the minerals wealth of the nation shall be for the benefits of South Africans, the way and manner mining businesses are being conducted have not changed (Saul 2010). The mining sector is still controlled by the white capitalist and the multinationals with the enlistment supports of a few black elites as shareholders (Zahralddin-Aravena 1997).

The ANC and its trade union affiliates and their officials have been accused in different fora of conniving with the multinationals to indirectly introduce apartheid methods of doing business in the mining sector (Rustomjee 2004). The Black elites have abandoned the struggle for economic and mining emancipation because they have been corrupted and toxically contaminated (Helliker and Vale 2009). They wine and dine with the executives of the multinationals and receive benefits for suppressing poor miners. The evidence unfolded at Judge Ian Gordon Farlam Marikana Commission of enquiry over the 2013 shooting and killing of mine workers on the instructions of the police and powers clearly show the level of abuses and violation of human rights to life with impunity. The political involvement in the mining conflicts is also increasing the already high level of violence in the mining community and the country (Oseni 2012).

It is therefore pertinent to point out that South Africa, as a society, is still “stratified, to a greater or lesser degree, along lines of wealth and race making it unique in the degree of its inequality and in the way the government in Pretoria enforces inequality through the law enforcement agents and the political elites” (Durning, 1990).
Commenting on the adverse effect of neoliberal economic policies introduced by the ANC to drive economic redistribution in the hands of the black majority, Schneide (2003) asserts that “although the political environment in South Africa is vastly improved, economic apartheid still exists: the economic divisions along racial lines created by apartheid are still in place today. Despite these divisions, neoliberal economists continue to press for a largely unregulated market system, which is unlikely to improve the lives of most black South Africans” (Schneider 2003).

This inequality is widening on a daily basis and producing poverty in an accelerated rate (Naudé and Coetzee 2004). It is against the backdrop of this entrenched circle of poverty which has permeated the fabric and psychic of the poor South African that made Mzukisi (2008), commented that “poverty in South Africa is now worse than apartheid and, in fact, "a terrible disease…Apartheid was a deep crime against humanity. It left people with deep scars, but I can assure you that poverty is worse than that...People do not eat human rights; they want food on the table."

The reason for this unprecedented poverty is attributed to the economic policies and strategies of the ANC government (Mattes 2002) which supports, to a large extent, “only elite enrichment and the presumed "trickle down benefits" of unchecked capitalism as being the way in which the lot of the poorest of the poor might be improved there” (Mzukisi 2008).

What has happened is that there is no trickle down of some sorts. Few black elites and their political cronies continue to exploit the indigent illiterate poor by giving them hand-outs in forms of socio supports and grants. This is currently being used as a powerful campaign tool during elections. The poor have been threatened that if they do not cast their ballots for the ruling class they will definitely be withdrawn from the socio supports. Being illiterate and uninformed, the poor succumb to this threat and voted massively for the ruling party. This is political apartheid coupled with economic apartheid at play; this is a dilemma for the new free South Africa. There is overall culture of impunity, lack of accountability, patronage, poor service delivery sometimes non-service delivery, corruption and nepotism to mention a few. Despite all these, the ruling party through the President Jacob Zuma had arrogantly said that the ANC will “rule till Jesus comes back” (Zuma 2014). Although many people were infuriated by this statement, it is not intended in this article to ventilate argument on whether the statement was right or wrong. What is important is that the ruling party should deliver to the people as promised by ensuring that the wealth of the country is distributed in such a way that will benefit all citizens.

The “so-called white and black capitalist-monopolists”

When the apartheid government was finally liquidated in 1994 and the democratic constitutional government took over the reign of government, the efforts of all the struggle leaders and their supporters who made this possible was applauded. The apartheid government had lost but the question is who won? Paradoxically, “at least for the time being: global capitalism, the West and the IFIs, and local elites of state and private sectors, both white and black?” (Saul and Dubinsky 2009). In
contrast “the mass of southern African populations, both urban and rural and largely black? Not so obviously the winners, I would suggest, and certainly not in any very expansive sense. Has it not been a kind of defeat for them too?” (Saul and Dubinsky 2009) Absolutely, it is a defeat for the poor people and particularly vulnerable overexploited mine workers of South Africa. Democratic dividends are far away from being enjoyed. They have been denied and deprived of virtually all good socio-economic rights, goods and amenities. It is now a vicious circle. Their children have started inheriting poverty from their parents while the parents are alive because persistent strike actions have deprived the parents from paying their children’s school fees. Thus, the children are denied education and food including dignifying shelter. Some of the parents have witnessed the death of their children as a result of starvation due to lack of food. The only thing the country can now show for being self-ruled is the right to vote and be voted for. The country operates elites-blacks and white apartheid economy. The poor are being supressed and abused (Schneider 2003). Pursuant to this assertion, “the fact that a multinational corporation was at the center of the massacre shouldn’t surprise us either. Anglo-American, the largest corporation in South Africa, was one of the principle funders of the slaughter in the Democratic Republic of Congo. But the capuability also extends to President Jacob Zuma and his cronies in NUM, figures such as the chairperson are directly implemented in the murder of the 34 workers both in the deployment of police at the mine and NUM’s attempt to break up the strike”(Fogel 2012).

The new bourgeoisies’ white and black monopolist capitalists are “frustrating and opposing fundamental change in the distribution of land, income and assets in South Africa. Neoliberal policies stem from an ideological attachment to free markets, rather than a substantive analysis of how market forces play out in an unequal society like that in South Africa. By choosing to focus on narrowly defined economic criteria such as GDP growth and allocative efficiency, neoliberal economists marginalize the vast problems created by inequality and poverty and thus overlook the potential benefits of a redistributive strategy. Neoliberal economic policies have been installed in South Africa by the ANC via GEAR and other policy initiatives, but these policies have made little progress in solving South Africa’s economic problems (Schneider 2003).

The ruling party, with their so called alliance are promoting “neo-liberal policymaking that perpetuates, and in some cases exaggerates, socio-economic inequalities inherited from the apartheid era. The African National Congress (ANC) leadership’s alignment with powerful international and domestic market actors produces tensions within the Tripartite Alliance and between government and civil society. Consequently, several characteristics of ‘predatory liberalism’ are evident in contemporary South Africa: neo-liberal restructuring of the economy is combined with an increasing willingness by government to assert its authority, to marginalize and delegitimize those critical of its abandonment of inclusive governance. A new form of oligarch power, combining entrenched economic interests with those of a new ‘black bourgeoisie’ promoted by narrowly implemented Black Economic Empowerment policies, diminishes prospects for broad-based socio-economic transformation. Because the new policy environment is failing to resolve tensions between global market demands for increasing market
liberalization and domestic popular demands for poverty-alleviation and socio-economic transformation, the ANC leadership is forced increasingly to confront 'ultra-leftists' who are challenging its credentials as defender of the National Democratic Revolution which was the cornerstone in the anti-apartheid struggle" (Andreasson 2001).

The study of Hamann et al. (2008) show that instead of the businesses to contribute to a good corporate citizens especially in the mining and finance sector, it has been characterised by “a reliance on interest-based negotiation and an expectation that business contributes to the public benefit as good corporate citizens. But underlying these elements have been more powerful drivers related to power-based bargaining, whereby international investors have emerged as key, albeit ill-defined, stakeholders in South Africa's post-apartheid transition. The role of corporate citizenship has been limited, despite efforts by business to portray the outcomes and agreements in terms of business voluntarism and enlightened self-interest... the role of the state in defining and enforcing a social role for big business. It raises concerns that the BEE programme charters prejudice more fundamental socio-economic transformation in the interests of the established corporations, and it calls for more research on how BEE is being implemented.” The Black Economic Empowerment (BEE) had been adjudged as one of the programmes of economic exploitation instead of emancipation. It is for the connected few in the party hierarchy. Those who merit to win lucrative tenders are being shunned and side-lined and the unmerited BEE members are being patronised in the quest of fostering corruption and non-delivery of socio economic rights as mandated by the constitution.

**A well-informed emerging mine worker**

Intervention of the NGOs and other radical Trade Unions in South Africa are breaking the barriers of vulnerability and permanent modern day slavery (Andreasson 2005). This is creating a climate of empowerment and enlightenment. Suppressed mine workers are now being emancipated through exposure to what their rights are, and how to claim their entitlements (Dubow 2012). With regard to employer and employee relationship, they are being sensitised of their rights, including the rights to strike and the right to better conditions of service (Hamann et al. 2009). Workers would have gained more in terms of asset ownership, profit sharing and so on, but the bosses in the mining multinational companies are supressing all these through collaboration with a few black cohorts (Longaker and Merritt 2006). This is the reason why the mining industry is volatile (Hausmann et al. 2008). The bosses are not comfortable with the situation of educating and enlightening the workers of their inherent labour and fundamental rights (Sarno 2008). This is the reason why they continue to patronise politicians and government officials to continue to suppress and perpetrate abuses and violation of the workers’ rights (Oshinebo 2009).

**Conclusion**

Transformation is not a term or word that should be merely written down in white and black or be spoken at every opportunity when the ruling elites are canvassing for votes during campaigns but a term that should be made to perform what it means. Transformational processes and curves are self-
explanatory. They are expected to bring about a radical change. As of today, it cannot be said that there is any meaningful transformation in the South African mining sector except that very few elites, both blacks and whites, are the major beneficiaries while the black majority poor continue to be in perpetual chronic and abject poverty. A possible way out of the problem is through persistent efforts of all well-meaning South Africans to continuously have conversations around the issues. Gradually, the conversations will, at some stage start to yield the desired results and transformation will start happening in an accelerated rate in the mining industry.

References


Appolis KUC 1996. From fragmentation to wholeness: the Black South African family under siege. University Press of America, Maryland, USA.


Frankel P2013. Between the Rainbows and the Rain: Marikana, Migration, Mining and the Crisis of Modern South Africa. DPT 2 Print, Bryanston, South Africa.


Children’s Participation in School Sport at Tshwane, South Africa: Analysis of Psychosocial Influences

Eric Pule¹, Tonie Drotsky², Abel Toriola³ and Ntwanano Alliance Kubayi⁴

Abstract: Participation in school sport can benefit children and their schools in many ways, but due to fiscal, infrastructural and professional challenges facing school sport the need to increase the level of participation remains a problem. The aim of this study was to determine the reasons for participating in school sport among primary and secondary school children at public township schools in Tshwane, the capital city of South Africa. A total of 773 school children aged 12-18 years volunteered to participate in the study. Data were collected using questionnaires related to school, particularly questions linked with their level of participation and the importance of school sport and analysed with t-test. The outcome of the study indicated that primary school children were more actively involved in school sport than the secondary school children. On a Likert-type response scale of 1-5 both the groups of children strongly agreed that sport is significantly important to children (p=0.002). Overall, the results showed that children participate in school sports for the following reasons: health improvement, enjoyment; socialisation and opportunity to bond with parents. In view of the importance of sports participation to children’s well-being a partnership of all stakeholders involving school authorities, department of education, parents and communities is necessary to implement well resourced and supervised school sport programmes that will provide ample opportunity for children to be physically active.

Keywords: participation, school sport, children, public schools

¹ Department of Marketing, Logistics and Sport Management, Tshwane University of Technology, Private Bag X680 Pretoria, 0001, South Africa; Email: PuleERJ@tut.ac.za
² Department of Marketing, Logistics and Sport Management, Tshwane University of Technology, Private Bag X680 Pretoria, 0001, South Africa; Email: PuleERJ@tut.ac.za
³ Department of Sport, Rehabilitation and Dental Sciences, Tshwane University of Technology, Private Bag X680 Pretoria, 0001, South Africa
⁴ Department of Sport, Rehabilitation and Dental Sciences, Tshwane University of Technology, Private Bag X680 Pretoria, 0001, South Africa
Introduction

Participation in school sport includes a phase where children are engaged and developed into engaging in more organised school activities, programmes and events (Li, MacIntosh & Bravo, 2011). Sport can be important and beneficial to most children at school, because the school environment is where children spend most of their childhood and adolescent years (Sallies, McKenzie, Beets, Beighle, Erwin & Lee, 2012). According to Strong et al. (2005), participation in sport at public schools is not only important to develop children's sport skills but also pertinent to help children to become disciplined and lead healthy lifestyles. The practicality of the importance and the benefits of sport can assist schools and the government to develop more precise and effective intervention programmes to promote and encourage children to participate in school sport.

Coakley (2009) opined that learners who are engaged in school sport as a group have a better grade point average, a more positive attitude towards schooling, and have more interest in continuing with education after completing high school. At the individual level, physical education and sport contribute to the maintenance and improvement of health, provide a wholesome leisure-time occupation and enable children to overcome the drawbacks of modern living (UNESCO, 1978). At the community level, sport enriches social relations and develops fair play, which is essential not only to sport itself but also to life in society. The importance of Physical Education and sport to children’s growth and development was emphasised by UNESCO in its 1978 Charter when it stated that; “Every education system must assign the requisite place and importance to physical education and sport in order to establish a balance and strengthen links between physical activities and other components of education” (UNESCO, 1978).

Participation in school sport is physically and psychologically beneficial to most children at schools. According to Child Trends Data Bank (2013), the structure of an organised school sport provides well supervised and enjoyable programmes, activities and events for children. Children participating in school sport programmes tend to eat healthier are physically fit, have low stress and depression levels and enjoy more parental support. Beets and Pitetti (2005) state that children’s involvement in school sport can be associated with personality development, good leadership skills, motivation, self-worth, confidence and good body image. Most research conducted on sport participation has reported positive correlations between children’s participation in school sport and academic success (Ward, 2008).

The level of children’s involvement in school sport depends on the role played by schools, the government and the local communities in making sure that sporting activity, programmes and events are alive and organised (Gladden & Sutton, 2011). School sport is organised through educational and club systems to accommodate the diverse needs of children. It is the responsibility of the schools to offer competitive and recreational school sport programmes to fulfil the needs, wants and desires of
the children (Li, Maclntosh & Bravo, 2011). For children to participate in school sport various individual and team activities should be offered at schools to stimulate their interest.

The framework used in this study is based on the achievement goal theory (Duda & Hall, 2001). According to this theory, three factors interact to determine a person’s motivation: achievement goals, perceived ability, and achievement behaviour. To understand someone’s motivation, we must understand what success and failure means to that person. Probably the best way to do that is to examine a person’s achievement goals and how they interact with that individual’s perception of competence, self-worth, or perceived ability (Weinberg & Gould, 2007).

According to Ndlangamandla, Burnett and Roux (2012), many public schools in the world give children the opportunity to participate in school sport freely. The public schools sport programmes are normally subsidised and controlled by the government and national sport federations, for example in South Africa school sport is managed and coordinated through the Department of Basic Education (DoE), Sport and Recreation South Africa (SRSA) and South African Sports Confederation and Olympic Committee (SASCOC). Participation in school sport is not compulsory for all children at public schools, but it is mandatory that schools should afford children the opportunity to participate in group or individual sport, recreational and competitive sport so that they are further given additional opportunities to be involved in sport as spectators or supporters (Martins, Santos, Sarmento & Carreiro da Costa, 2013). In South Africa, a child has the right and the opportunity to spend 12 years attending primary and secondary school levels, and those are opportune times to introduce, promote and market school sport to children.

In the memorandum of understanding (MoU) between Department of Basic Education (DBE) and Department of Sport and Recreation South Africa (SRSA) on an Integrated School Sport Framework (2011) it is clearly stated that school sport programmes are ideal vehicles to entrench the democratic value-system based on the principles enshrined in the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996. The following key objectives designed to increase the level of sport participation in schools were outlined: (1) accelerate the transformation of society by instilling and practicing the principles on non-racialism, non-sexism, equity, redress, access and affirmative action in addressing the past imbalances through quality school sport programmes; (2) foster pride, honour and patriotism in our school-going youth through properly organised, managed and coordinated school sport programmes; (3) use school sport to turn schools into stable, functional and vibrant institutions of learning and centres of community life and (4) ensure and increase access and accessibility of facilities and school sport programmes through a coordinated and optimal utilisation of all human, physical and financial resources available (Department of Sport and Recreation South Africa, 2011).

Therefore, the key objectives in the MoU, is to unite and uplift the culture of sport at schools as well as to attract and promote sport to children. This strategy is supported by Ndlangamandla, Burnett and Roux (2012) in their statement that schools provide a microcosm of broader society and sport is an
important educational practice within such a social context. Against this background, the aim of this study was to determine the reasons for participating in school sport among primary and secondary school children at public township schools in Tshwane, the capital city of South Africa. Such self-perceived views are very important as they can guide the development and promotion of school sports programmes so that more children may be motivated to participate.

**Methodology**

**Sample**
A total of 773 children attending public primary and secondary schools in Tshwane, volunteered to participate in the study. They were aged 12-18 years. From the comprehensive list of schools provided by the Department of Education, 40 primary and secondary schools were randomly selected. The children participated in the study after parental informed consent was obtained.

**Instrument**
A self-administered questionnaire consisted of 15 close ended items scored on a 5-point Likert scale ranging from 1 (Strongly disagree), 2 (Disagree), 3 (Neither agree nor disagree), 4 (Agree) and 5 (Strongly agree) was used to collect data. The instrument had three sections. Sections A and B consisted of questions which sought information on the participants’ demographic profile (age, gender, language, type of school, grade level), while section C elicited reasons regarding the children’s school sport participation.

**Data collection and procedure**
Prior to data collection, permission to conduct the study was granted by the Gauteng Department of Basic Education. Ethical clearance was also received from the Central Research Committee of Tshwane University of Technology, South Africa. Data were collected at 40 public township primary and secondary schools in the City of Tshwane. Supervised data collection was undertaken by trained research assistants who were post-graduate students from the Department of Marketing, Logistics and Sport management at Tshwane University of Technology. To avoid the disruption of school lessons, data were collected after school hours with the permission of school principals. Participants were guided to complete the questionnaire independently and it took the children 30-45 minutes to complete the questionnaire on average.

**Validity and reliability**
Content validity was established by an experienced statistical analyst who reviewed the questionnaire. The questionnaire was initially developed and modified based on the literature review and interviews conducted with children and sport managers. To ensure internal consistency of the instrument, Cronbach’s Alpha was determined. The overall reliability of the scale was 0.779. The reliability of the questionnaire was above the acceptable benchmark of 0.70 as recommended by Bryman and Bell (2011).
Data analysis

The data were analysed and captured using the SPSS, version 21. Statistical methods such as means, standard deviations, percentages, and frequencies were used to analyse the data. Independent t-test was applied to examine differences in the reasons for participating in primary and secondary school children. A probability level of 0.05 or less was used to indicate significance.

Results

This study showed a response rate of 43% (boys) and 57% (girls). Such a moderate response could facilitate the generalisation of the results to the population of learners in the township schools (Babbie & Mouton, 2010).

Table 1 illustrates that the five most likely reasons for participating in primary school sport were that “Participating in school sport brings joy in my life” (M = 4.45), “School sport is important to all children” (M = 4.35), “Participating in school sport improves my health” (M = 4.33), “Parents encourage me to participate in school sport” (M = 3.97), and “I participate in school sport, because I like to compete against other children” (M = 3.80), whereas among the secondary school children the reasons for participating in sport were, “Participating in school sport improves my health” (M = 4.17), “School sport is important to all children” (M = 4.16), “Participating in school sport brings joy in my life” (M = 3.72), “Parents encourage me to participate in school sport” (M = 3.27), and “My teachers encourages me to participate in sport offered at school” (M = 3.26). A scrutiny based on the two groups of children revealed that primary school children enjoy school sport and parents encourage them to participate in school sport more than the secondary school children.

An independent-samples t-test was computed to compare the reasons for participating in school sport among primary and secondary school children. There were significant differences (P < 0.05) in all reasons for participating in school sport. Table 1 illustrates that the five most likely reasons for participating in primary and secondary school sport were “Participating in school sport improves my health” (M = 4.23), “School sport is important to all children” (M = 4.22), “I enjoy group sport” (M = 3.98), “Participating in school sport brings joy in my life” (M = 3.96), and “Parents encourage me to participate in school sport” (M = 3.50); whereas the least likely reasons for participating in primary and secondary school sport were, “Everyone in my family participates in sport” (M = 2.45), “I participate in school sport to lose weight” (M = 2.51), “All my friends participate in school sport” (M = 2.74), “All my siblings participate in sport” (M = 3.02) and “I enjoy individual sport” (M = 3.07).

A Mann-Whitney U test was also used to examine the differences between the responses of the boys and girls. There were significant differences (P > 0.05) in all reasons for participating in school sport, except in the following variables: “I enjoy group sport”, U = 59402.000, z = -4.873, p = 0.00, and “My teachers encourage me to participate in sport offered at school”, U = 67149.00, z = -2.025, p = 0.043. The male students had substantially higher mean scores regarding the following reasons: “I enjoy group
sport”, “I participate in school sport, because I like to compete against other children”, “I participate in school sport to meet new friends”, whereas among the girls the major reasons for participating in sport were, “My teachers encourage me to participate in sport offered at school” and “Parents encourage me to participate in school sport”, and “All my friends participate in school sport”.

Table 1: Reasons for participation in sport according to school

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Primary school</th>
<th>Secondary school</th>
<th>All</th>
<th>t-test</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participating in school sport brings joy in my life</td>
<td>4.45 0.95</td>
<td>3.72 1.29</td>
<td>3.96 1.24</td>
<td>8.08*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participating in school sport improves my health</td>
<td>4.33 1.03</td>
<td>4.17 1.10</td>
<td>4.23 1.08</td>
<td>2.04*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All my friends participate in school sport</td>
<td>3.33 1.42</td>
<td>2.44 1.21</td>
<td>2.74 1.35</td>
<td>9.07*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I participate in school sport to lose weight</td>
<td>3.08 1.49</td>
<td>2.23 1.27</td>
<td>2.51 1.41</td>
<td>8.29*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parents encourage me to participate in school sport</td>
<td>3.97 1.30</td>
<td>3.27 1.45</td>
<td>3.50 1.44</td>
<td>6.54*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I enjoy individual sport</td>
<td>3.40 1.54</td>
<td>2.90 1.57</td>
<td>3.07 1.57</td>
<td>4.26*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I enjoy group sport</td>
<td>4.29 1.12</td>
<td>3.82 1.41</td>
<td>3.98 1.34</td>
<td>4.60*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I participate in school sport, because I like to compete against other children</td>
<td>3.80 1.44</td>
<td>3.17 1.47</td>
<td>3.38 1.49</td>
<td>5.72*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A variety of sport facilities is available at my school, therefore I take part</td>
<td>3.64 1.21</td>
<td>3.02 1.29</td>
<td>3.22 1.30</td>
<td>6.56*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I participate in school sport to meet new friends</td>
<td>3.79 1.37</td>
<td>2.97 1.37</td>
<td>3.24 1.43</td>
<td>7.89*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Everyone in my family participates in sport</td>
<td>2.84 1.36</td>
<td>2.26 1.13</td>
<td>2.45 1.24</td>
<td>6.32*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All my siblings participate in sport</td>
<td>3.53 1.53</td>
<td>2.77 1.35</td>
<td>3.02 1.40</td>
<td>7.37*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teachers encourage me to participate in sport offered at school</td>
<td>3.75 1.35</td>
<td>3.26 1.40</td>
<td>3.42 1.41</td>
<td>4.69*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is compulsory at my school to participate in sport</td>
<td>3.72 1.18</td>
<td>2.76 1.36</td>
<td>3.08 1.38</td>
<td>9.59*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School sport is important to all children</td>
<td>4.35 1.09</td>
<td>4.16 1.13</td>
<td>4.22 1.12</td>
<td>2.31*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2: Reasons for participating in sport according to gender

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Males</th>
<th>Females</th>
<th>Mann-Whitney U</th>
<th>Z-value</th>
<th>P-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participating in school sport brings joy in my life</td>
<td>380.96</td>
<td>391.96</td>
<td>71201.500</td>
<td>0.694</td>
<td>0.488</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participating in school sport improves my health</td>
<td>393.78</td>
<td>381.89</td>
<td>70954.000</td>
<td>-0.809</td>
<td>0.419</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All my friends participate in school sport</td>
<td>380.15</td>
<td>392.16</td>
<td>70931.000</td>
<td>-0.759</td>
<td>0.448</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I participate in school sport to lose weight</td>
<td>388.75</td>
<td>385.68</td>
<td>72625.500</td>
<td>-0.195</td>
<td>0.846</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parents encourage me to participate in school sport</td>
<td>374.08</td>
<td>396.73</td>
<td>68917.000</td>
<td>-1.441</td>
<td>0.150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I enjoy individual sport</td>
<td>391.47</td>
<td>383.63</td>
<td>71722.000</td>
<td>-0.496</td>
<td>0.620</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I enjoy group sport</td>
<td>428.58</td>
<td>355.70</td>
<td>59402.000</td>
<td>-4.873</td>
<td>0.00*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I participate in school sport, because I like to compete against other children</td>
<td>402.87</td>
<td>375.06</td>
<td>67938.500</td>
<td>-1.764</td>
<td>0.078</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A variety of sport facilities is available at my school, therefore I take part</td>
<td>382.72</td>
<td>390.22</td>
<td>71784.000</td>
<td>-1.502</td>
<td>0.635</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I participate in school sport to meet new friends</td>
<td>400.58</td>
<td>376.78</td>
<td>68697.500</td>
<td>-1.300</td>
<td>1.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Everyone in my family participates in sport</td>
<td>398.67</td>
<td>378.27</td>
<td>69322.500</td>
<td>-2.025</td>
<td>1.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All my siblings participate in sport</td>
<td>400.34</td>
<td>376.95</td>
<td>68776.000</td>
<td>-1.473</td>
<td>1.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My teachers encourage me to participate in sport offered at school</td>
<td>368.76</td>
<td>400.73</td>
<td>67149.000</td>
<td>-2.025</td>
<td>0.43*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is compulsory at my school to participate in sport</td>
<td>397.76</td>
<td>378.90</td>
<td>69632.500</td>
<td>-1.189</td>
<td>0.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School sport is important to all children</td>
<td>395.06</td>
<td>380.93</td>
<td>70531.000</td>
<td>-0.976</td>
<td>0.33</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Discussion
This study was undertaken to determine the reasons for participating in school sport among primary and secondary school children at Tshwane. According to Wann (1997), the motives to stop participating in sport are greater than those for continuing participation. Therefore, a child will most likely not begin or will discontinue his or her sport involvement. In this study, primary school students reported that they participate in sport because of enjoyment. The finding is consistent with a study conducted by Allender, Cowburn and Foster (2006), in which, fun and enjoyment were reported as
predictors of physical activity participation. The children further indicated that sport is important in their lives. For example, Previous studies have reported a positive relationship between sport participation and academic success (Ward, 2008) as sport involvement improves physical fitness, concentration and self-esteem, (Ongong’a, 2010), and overall quality of life.

Further, the primary school students indicated that their parents encouraged them to participate in sport. As parents are expected to serve as role models to their children, they can provide emotional or financial support to their children. On a positive note, Brustad (1993) found that higher parental enjoyment was linked to greater perceived competence for children. The author further noted that parents who express greater encouragement are more likely to provide opportunities for children to be physically active and to communicate higher expectancies of their child's ability in physical activity.

By contrast, secondary school students indicated that they participate in sport because it improves their health. This view is supported by Ongong’a, Okwara and Okello (2010), who found that 73% of student-athletes reported that sport participation improves their health. However, the perception that “sport and physical activity improves health” has not only been observed at the secondary school level (Ongong’a, et al., 2010) but also at tertiary levels (Dhurup, 2012). A study conducted by Dhurup (2012), among 280 university students of the Vaal University of Technology in Gauteng Province, South Africa, showed that participation in physical activity improves muscle strength, metabolism, body shape, lung fitness and reduces the risk of disease.

According to Ongong’a et al. (2010), there are many benefits that accrue from sport participation. The authors reported that sport participation develops students’ ability to work for long periods as a result of improved physical fitness. Sport can also teach children about life skills such as discipline, fair play, sportsmanship, hard work, courage, character development, respect, humility as well as improve their self-esteem, self-confidence and boost their morale.

In terms of gender, male students indicated that they participate in sport for competition and affiliation motives. These findings are consistent with those of previous studies (Weinberg & Gould, 2007; Sirard, Pfeiffer & Russell, 2006). Female students indicated that they participated in sport because of support provided by their teachers, parents, and peers. Parental support is viewed as one of the most important factors in motivating female students to participate in sport. Therefore, this study demonstrates that female students are more likely to participate in sport if they are supported by their parents. This finding is consistent with those reported in a study by Wu et al. (2003), in which girls reported significantly more positive social support for physical activity from parents compared with boys. However, In order to promote sport participation among female students, Walter and Du Randt (2011) suggested that women need to be supportive of other women who challenge social norms and customs that are detrimental to their health and well-being.
Conclusion

The study evaluates children’s perception and understanding of the importance of school sport in their lives. Most children seemed to be aware of the importance and the benefits derived from sport, but primary school children were more involved and enjoy school sport more than those in secondary schools. In order to promote school sports in South Africa, schools should be provided with quality sport equipment, facilities, and qualified sport coaches, and qualified managers to coordinate school sport. Wann (1997) argued that socialisation agents such as parents, siblings, peer, schools, media and community should also be used to promote sport participation among children.

References


Stock Theft Crime in a Rural Community in Limpopo, South Africa: Contributory Factors and Recommendations

W. Maluleke, EE Obioha, and JT Mofokeng

Abstract: This study sets out to carefully analyse, and evaluate, the extent of stock theft in a rural community of Giyani Limpopo province, South Africa by taking all contributory factors into account. Data was collected from 64 individuals to explore, and identify, the actual perceptions and experiences of Giyani South African Police Service Stock Theft Unit (Giyani SAPS STU) and local SAPS officers, livestock owners, community members, and other relevant stakeholders involved in understanding contributory factors to stock theft crime. The main findings of the study show that the contributing factors to stock theft in Giyani Policing Area (GPA) are: the slaughtering of stock to sell to butchery owners; the alleged involvement of SAPS and Department of Justice: Giyani Magistrates Courts (DoJ: GMC) officials in stock theft crimes; the negligence of livestock owners; the unmarking of livestock; and, poor reporting when livestock gets stolen. The researcher developed recommendations and formulated possible strategies which involves improved resources, advanced training and better education; and the strengthening of enforcement response and reporting techniques.

Keywords: policing, stock theft, prevention, South Africa.

Acknowledgement: The author would like to thank Professor Emeka E. Obioha, who undertook to act as my Co-supervisor, despite his many academic and professional commitments. Thank you for the valuable suggestions, corrections, guidance, and comments during the study and Doctor Jacob Tsoko Mofokeng, for his priceless encouragement, invaluable assistance, support, and guidance throughout the study. Thank you for your motivation and positive energy to finish this dissertation. Your vast wisdom and knowledge in policing stock theft pushed me to the limit. Another big thank you goes to all the participants who participated in this study, who shared their perceptions, expertise and views.

1 Department of Safety and Security Management, Tshwane University of Technology, Soshanguve South Campus, South Africa. E-mail: madlaya92@gmail.com. Author.
2 Department of Safety and Security Management, Tshwane University of Technology, Soshanguve South Campus, South Africa. E-mail: obiohaee@tut.ac.za. Corresponding author.
3 Department of Safety and Security Management, Tshwane University of Technology, Soshanguve South Campus, South Africa. E-mail: mofokengjt@tut.ac.za.
Introduction

The superlatives of the animal kingdom are diverse, and prolific. The literature indicates that animal livestock contributes significantly to the livelihoods of people living in the rural areas of developing countries (De Haan, et al., 2001). South Africa is no exception; nor is the Giyani Policing Area (henceforth, GPA), Limpopo Province. Among the various difficulties faced by South African livestock farmers, in general, stock theft remains one of the biggest challenges, GPA included. In connection to this views above, Geldenhuys (2006) explains that stock theft is an escalating, unnerving and destructive reality, facing, or affecting, all sectors of the farming community, from the commercial farmer, to the stud breeder, to emerging farmers, who own only a few heads of cattle (Geldenhuys, 2009). It extends also to the rural farmer, who may own one or two heads of cattle. It was, further, stated that stock theft occurs more frequently than other types of crime, and that it is a much more serious threat in South African regions bordering other countries, such as the Eastern Cape, the Free State, KwaZulu-Natal (KZN), and Limpopo.

Stock theft crime trends in South Africa currently indicate that the country is experiencing an increase of 1.5% in stock theft. Overall, the anatomy of serious crime, relating to property-related crime, amounts to 25.7%, as provided by crime statistics overview (Republic of South Africa – RSA, 2011/2012); this includes burglary (residential and non-residential), theft of motor vehicle/cycle, theft out of a motor vehicle, and stock theft. It was further reported that stock theft decreased by 30.7% over a period of 5 years, 2004/2005 – 2008-2009, an average reduction of 6.1% per annum. Between 2009/2010 – 2011/2012, it decreased by 0.8% over a period of 3 years - an average reduction of 0.3% per annum. Overall, there was a 1.5% increase recorded in the 2011/2012 financial year, and collectively, stock theft has decreased by 31.2% from 2004/2005 to 2011/2012 (SAPS, 2012).

Geldenhuys (2012) points out that stock theft is not a new crime – it is probably as old as agriculture, itself. Since the earliest times, stock theft has had far-reaching consequences. For rural communities, livestock are regarded as “living wealth”, and are often their only source of income, and sustenance. Thus, when their livestock are stolen, many households, and subsistence farmers, lose their livelihoods. But these farmers are not the only ones who suffer, on account of stock theft; it also has a serious impact on commercial farmers, and, thus, the red meat industry, as a whole. In support of this statement, the research questions to guide this study are: Has stock theft in the GPA increased in the last few years? What could be the factors contributing to the stock theft increase in the GPA? What type of relationship exists between SAPS and livestock owners in the GPA? Are the SAPS strategies, as employed by the STU in Giyani, effective enough in responding to stock theft? In this regard, the perspectives in line with contributory factors to the stock theft crime phenomenon increase in the GPA where highlighted by the researcher therein.

Data and methods

For the purpose of this study, a qualitative research approach was adopted to collect data, so as to explore, and identify, the actual perceptions and experiences of Giyani SAPS STU and local SAPS
officers, livestock owners, community members, and other relevant stakeholders involved in preventing and combating stock theft in Giyani. This was done through Focus Group Discussions (FGDs), Key Informant Interviews (KII), and observation schedules.

The population sample of the study was based on the selected target groups, taken from GPA, and, Makosha and Xikukwana villages (Ward 14). The FGDs consisted of the following: Giyani SAPS officers as attached to the local police station (8); Prominent livestock farmers (20; 10 from each village); Community members (12; 6 from each village); Community Policing Forums (CPF) managers (4; 2 from each village); and, Leaders of the local Faith-based organisations (4; 2 from each village), amounting to 48 targets.

KIIs were conducted with Sixteen (16) participants from the Giyani SAPS STU officers (7), Department of Agriculture (Veterinary Services; Land and Infrastructure; and, Natural Resource Management managers) (2); Mopani District officials (2; Community Researcher and a Community Liaison Officer); Giyani Municipality officials (2; Occupational Health and Safety Officer; Community Safety and Liaison Officer); and, Giyani Magistrates’ Court personnel (3; Senior Prosecutor, Control Public Prosecutor; Court Interpreter). Overall Sixty-Four (64) study populations were selected. Gender, age, educational background, and socio-economic differentiation did not play a role. All 64 participants were Tsonga-speaking Africans; the participant’s selection was based on: their knowledge of stock theft prevalence in the GPA of Limpopo Province; been a victim of this crime; and, been a member of communities affected by this crime.

A documentary study, which provides an overview of existing publications on the subject of stock theft in the GPA (Limpopo Province) (Researcher’s note: as per references indicates), across Southern Africa, and some parts of the globe, was conducted by the researcher. The views of different authors which relate to the problem that was researched were discussed to place the current research project within a conceptual and theoretical context. Information sources comprised of additional, recent academic books, academic journal articles, legislation, policy documents, national instructions, and information available on the Internet, relating to the study topic. Information obtained through the literature research was collected, and also integrated with the data obtained. The documentary sources were compared with data already gathered by the researcher, and, then, added as new information to the present study, wherever relevant.

Collection of data from stock theft court sessions observation schedules was the last source utilised to gather data on the topic. A total of Three (3) cases were observed in stock theft court sessions by the researcher in the period October to November 2012 in the DoJ: GMC. The researcher attended court cases that were still to be finalised. The information was retrieved as the court proceedings commenced.
The extent of stock theft in the giyani policing area

The researcher started by asking the participants to provide their views on whether they considered stock theft to be more widespread in the last three years, or not? They were asked to elaborate on their responses. This question sought to investigate whether any of their livestock had been stolen in the previous three years (2009-2011). This was to determine whether there had been an increase (or not) in the number of stock thefts in those three annual periods. The investigation included the type of livestock stolen (from cattle, chickens, goats, and donkeys), as these are the most common livestock targeted by the criminal individuals and syndicates, and most community members concentrate on these livestock for their livelihood. The results of this study show that there was a decrease, at the time of conducting the study, in cattle, goats, and donkey theft by order of importance.

Examples of some of the responses (quoted verbatim):

“Yes it was dominant in the last 3 weeks, but currently it is low as the troubling syndicate has been cracked and locked up, some of them are still in the holding cells.” KII (Giyani SAPS STU Commander).

“Yes, the stock thieves recruit one another, and they have the support of the judicial system, knowing they will win the case, despite the seriousness of the said case. Some are government officials with the intention of generating money quick for self-enrichment. In some instances, even the livestock farmers are more involved in committing this crime. Thus, I do not feel that the SAPS did not do enough.” FGD No. 2 (Xikukwana community member).

“Stock theft has been an existing phenomenon in our area over the years; it is local, rampant and becoming transitional crime.” FGD No. 2 (Makosha community member).

The reported incidences above of stock theft in the GPA are confirmed by the participants’ responses below:

Reported incidents of stock theft in Giyani (2010-2012)

Between 2010 and 2012, the following actual, and attempted, incidents took place in the GPA of Limpopo, South Africa, at the time of conducting the study (Researcher’s note: this also reads with paragraph 1.2 of Chapter [One]).

Incident No. 1: On November 27 2012, two community members, aged 40 and 46 years, from Xamfana village, were set to appear at the DoJ: GMC to face charges of murder. This follows an incident, wherein furious residents of Xamfana and Ga-Abel allegedly attacked, and killed, a suspected stock thief who was allegedly caught red-handed on Friday, 23 November 2012.

The Giyani police station spokesperson, Warrant Officer (W/O) Seth Magadzi, said that the suspect, in his 30s, was found lying in the grazing camp with an open wound on the head. “Also one cattle was found killed on the scene, and three others attacked with a sharp object,” Magadzi said. In addition, he
said that the suspect, from Mavele village, outside Tzaneen, was caught by the community in the camp in the act of stealing cattle. “He was then attacked with sticks, and a sharp object. He died on the scene.” Magadzi went on to say that stock theft is rife in the area, and people seem not to report cases of it: “We advise residents to open cases when their stock disappears. They should put hot-iron branding, freeze branding, or tattoo their cattle with a sign, in order to identify them.” He urged local subsistence farmers to join stock forums, in order to deal with this growing scourge.

Xamafana community leader, Steven Manyama, said stock theft was of grave concern in the area as, week-by-week, they recorded a huge number of stock thefts: “We also find carcasses of cattle belonging to residents in the nearby bushes. Last week, three cattle were killed on the same spot. And the other week, nine cows from Ga-Abel, and two from Mpepule village, were killed.” Earlier this year (2012), enraged residents of Giyani attacked, and killed, a 40-year-old man after they caught him allegedly stealing cattle. The deceased’s bakkie, which was allegedly used to transport the cattle, was burnt by the angry villagers.

**Incident No. 2:** On 17/01/2012, a stock thief was found in a pool of blood. “Mopani Herald” reported that: “A suspected stock thief was found dead in a pool of blood next to a burnt bakkie on Tuesday morning between Phalawubeni and Makhuvha villages in Giyani.”

Provincial police spokesperson, Lieutenant Colonel Mohale Ramatseba, said two carcasses of cattle were found next to the burnt bakkie: “Two Pangas and an axe were found at the scene, and will form part of police investigations. The burnt bakkie belonged to a butcher in the Giyani area,” said Ramatseba. No arrests had yet been made, in connection with the murder, and the burning of the bakkie. Ramatseba strongly condemned the killing of the suspected stock thief, and warned community members not to take the law into their own hands, but rather, to report the involvement of any person in criminal activities to the police. The deceased was due to appear at the DoJ: GMC, in connection with a case of stock theft. *(Researcher’s note: Police investigations were continuing on the killing at the time of conducting the research report; however, no arrests were made).*

**Incident No. 3:** On 28/04/2012, angry farmers from various parts of Limpopo marched to Malamulele Magistrates’ Court to oppose the granting of bail to Giyani butchery owner, Joe Ngobeni, who faces charges of stock theft. Ngobeni, who was refused bail twice, appeared at Greater Giyani Magistrates’ Court on three counts of stock theft. Ngobeni was, again, denied bail by Magistrate Daniel Maluleke, and the case was postponed until April 10. He is facing similar charges in Giyani. This incident impelled farmers from Hlanganani, Sekgosese, Malamulele, and Giyani to organise a march to the Magistrates’ offices to hand over a memorandum of demands. Stock farmers committee chairman, Whiskey Mahosi, said: “Many kraals are empty because of stock theft, and grazing lands have become hunting grounds for criminals; so, we have decided to attend to stock theft cases in large numbers.” He said they were law-abiding citizens, and demanded that the Departments of Justice (DoJ: GMC) and Police Giyani SAPS – Giyani SAPS STU to take cases of stock theft seriously: “We
demand no bail be granted to anyone charged with stock theft, and in case of conviction for stock theft, any person owning butchery must have that business de-licensed, because it is being used illegally."

The day previous, the Malamulele station, Commander confirmed Ngobeni's appearance, but declined to comment on the farmers' march, reported (Ntlemo, 2012).

**Incident No. 4:** On 28/02/2012, the police in Giyani arrested five suspects, in connection with a case of stock theft. It is reported that two suspects, aged 31 and 32, were arrested at the Gandlalanani village, outside Giyani, while transporting the carcasses of stolen cattle. The arrest of the two led to the arrest of the third suspect, aged 30, at Babangu village. After questioning the three suspects, a butcher, aged 47, and his 28-year-old assistant, were arrested, while selling the meat of stolen cattle at Mavele village, in Giyani. The five suspects are expected to appear before the DoJ: GMC soon to face charges of stock theft, pending further police investigations.

**Incident No. 5:** Meanwhile, a 62-year-old man, Samson Mathebula, of Nsavulani village, in Giyani, appeared at the Giyani Magistrates' Court, in connection with stock theft. The elderly man allegedly stole cattle in October last year, and has been appearing in the Giyani Magistrates’ Court since then. He is still in custody. Community members are protesting outside Giyani Magistrates’ Court for the suspect not to be granted bail. Police are monitoring the situation. *(Researcher's note: At the time of conducting the research, the case was still in the trial roll), [Ramatseba, 2012].)*

Incident No. 6: In 2010, the community forum of Thomo village took action against a 41-year-old man, after he admitted to selling off cattle he was herding. The man, who had been hired to herd the cattle of seven cattle owners in the village, admitted to driving the cattle into an area where few villagers went, and then selling them to other people. "The man herded the cattle of seven owners on different days, and this is why it was easy for him to drive any cattle he wanted into a desolate area for trade without rousing suspicion," explained one of the man’s former employers, Cedric Maswanganyi. After two of Maswanganyi’s cows, and another owner’s cattle, went missing, the owners decided to search the area, and they found the spot where the animals were slaughtered. "He would have gotten away with it, but we found his shoe prints on the scene," explained another cattle owner, Robert Chavalala. The village’s community forum was alerted, and the man was found, still wearing the shoes whose prints were found on the scene. He was then taken to the scene where he confessed to being part of the conspiracy. After several lashes from the community forum, the man named an accomplice, whom he claimed was a middleman between himself and the buyers. The men were handed over to the police, and charged with stock theft. The Giyani police station spokesperson, Thomas Makhubele, said the accused later appeared in DoJ: GMC and the case was postponed to 9 May 2010, pending further investigation (Chauke, 2010).
In order to further determine the widespread extent of stock theft in the GPA, Limpopo Province, the stock theft court session observation schedules were also used as one of the data collection methods. The researcher was attempting to ascertain the fairness of the Justice System (DoJ: GMC) toward stock theft victims. This process is described in this section.

During this period, the researcher was able to attend three stock theft court sessions, two at the Giyani Magistrates’ Court, and one at the Xikukwana Traditional Authority/Court (XTA/C). The first court case at the DoJ: GMC involved Raider Mathebula (46) – said to be “one of the kingpins most feared in the stock theft ‘business”’. To show their grave concerns, during the court session, members of MCLF from various areas in the Mopani and Vhembe districts came in numbers, chanting their wish not to see him released, and together with the other five co-accused,” reported Chauke (2013). The other five co-accused (Jan Shiviti, 32, Bennett Phosa, 32, Aubrey Manyike, 31, Joshua Mhlongo, 49, and, Dzingai Moyo, 30) were cited in the case, “State v J. Shiviti and five others – RG77/2012 on the court roll.” Among the 5 co-accused, one of them was a butchery owner from N’wamitwa village who was out on R20,000 as a first offender; one of his associates was also out on free bail. The other four were still in custody, by the research report time; the case in question was postponed to 22 and 23 April 2013 for further hearing to allow the state to call more witnesses. Chauke (2013) further stated that this case was characterised by the battle between the State and the lawyers of the accused, with the need for more witnesses to be called by the State. The case has been in-and-out of court, since July 2012, when the suspects were arrested.

Farmers around both Mopani and Vhembe districts have been following it closely to ensure its success. Speaking after the postponement, the secretary of the MCLF, Mr. Famanda Hlavangwani, said the forum was pulling all strings to make sure that the suspects stayed in jail for a long time: “All we want is to see these men put away, so we can have a little chance to grow our herds again, and nothing else,” he said. The forum represents farmers from the Malamulele, Hlanganani, Sekhukhune, and Giyani areas. The suspects remained in custody.

The charges against them were:

- Stealing of stock and produce in February 2012, belonging to the under-mentioned individuals:
  - Two cows of John Nkuna (72 years of age).
  - One bull of Samuel Risenga Chauke (66 years of age).
  - Five cows of Mkhacani Thomas Mashibye (48 years age).
  - Six cows of Ben Magezi Maswanganyi (85 years of age) (Mr. Maswanganyi lost 17 cattle during the incident, but 4 were found at the crime scene, while the other 2 were not found).
  - Contravening the Meat Safety Act (Act 40 of 2000). This Act serves “to provide for measures to promote meat safety and the safety of animal products; to establish and maintain essential standards in respect of abattoirs; to regulate the importation and exportation of meat; to establish meat safety schemes; and to provide for matters connected therewith.” (SAPS, 2000: 230).

- However, all the accused pleaded not guilty to the charge in question. They were all represented by lawyers. The Magistrate said the following:
It was revealed by the prosecution that, if they were be found guilty, the competent verdicts awaiting them were as follows:

- As governed by the Firearms Control Act (Act 60 of 2000), the objective of this Act is “to establish a comprehensive and effective system of firearms control.” This is now the only arms- and ammunition-related Act for the national territory of the RSA. Section 103 provides for the declaration by court of persons unfit to possess firearms, with exceptions (Intec College Study Guide, 2003: 74; Department of Criminal Justice).
- Receiving of stolen property, knowing it has been stolen.
- Possession of goods without being able to give a satisfactory account of such possession (in terms of S36, Act 62 of 1995), and;
- Acquiring or receiving stolen property without having reasonable cause to believe that the person disposing of the property is the owner, or duly authorised by the owner (in terms of S37, Act 62 of 1995) – S260 (Joubert, 2009: 279).

The second case involved Akani Boswel Nkuna (RG 79/2011). This case was over a dispute of ownership of 2 cattle. Of his 11 cattle stolen in 2011, the complainant in question only managed to recover 2 cattle in dispute, before the court adjourned. The accused person over-branded the 2 cattle in dispute. The offender defaced the original brand by applying certain techniques to apply his own mark. This case was scheduled for 13 May 2013 to hear further State evidence.

In terms of section 165 (1) of the Constitution, the judicial authority of the Republic of South Africa vests authority in the courts established by the Constitution, and any other law. Section 165(2) of the Constitution requires the judiciary to be independent and impartial, and subject only to the Constitution, and the law. In terms of section 34 of the Constitution, every person shall have the right to have justifiable disputes settled by a court of law, or, where appropriate, another independent, impartial forum. It is, therefore, the constitutional right of a person to seek relief from the courts (Fouché, 2007: 15-16). However, what the law provides is totally the opposite in DoJ: GMC. The accused in question are portrayed by upstanding and trustworthy livestock farmers as being guilty of stock theft. (Researcher’s note: The researcher agreed with this assessment during the court proceedings, i.e., that they were, indeed, guilty before the public eye.) It should, however, be emphasised that it is not the community that deliver the verdict. Having said that, declaring someone guilty in the public arena is easy, but, in terms of Section 35 (3) of the Constitution (1996), every accused person has the right to a fair trial, which includes the right to be presumed innocent (until proven guilty), remain silent, and testify during the proceedings. They still believe that their duty is to present themselves, and attend court.

Based on the presentations in court of the legal representatives (of the accused), it was apparent that their duty was to find weaknesses in the evidence presented by the witnesses. Such evidence is, then, deemed inadmissible before the court. Oftentimes, the witnesses and the-said victims fail to provide evidence that could prove their allegations irrefutably. Thus, the witnesses demonstrate their frustration, no solid evidence is rendered, and they end up relying on the investigation
conducted by the Giyani SAPS STU, and the colour of their stock, including injuries/wounds, the horns and spots, basing their conclusion on the fact that “if something belongs to you, it is easy to identify it”. The researcher thinks this is not enough to prove their case before the court, let alone, win a case. What also emerged during the court proceedings was the level of education of the livestock owners as witnesses and victims of this crime. Some, like Ben Magezi Maswanganyi, who lost 17 herds of cattle at that time, had formal education only up to Grade 2. So, the-said witnesses are, sometimes, treated with disdain, partly on account of their level of education.

In cases that involve forensic evidence, it can be conclusively proven that the crime was committed. In such instances, the experts’ findings were submitted as evidence, and the investigators acknowledged the potential importance of such evidence. In addition, the prosecution presented such evidence before the court with more confidence.

Despite their denials, regarding the stock theft, the evidence to be presented by May that year would prove otherwise. One expected that the accused were up for a hefty sentence, as the Magistrate and the Prosecutor were intent on getting a conviction. However, the defence lawyers were equally competent, and appeared prepared to protect the-said ruthless criminals at all costs.

Again, whatever facts are presented before the court, the final decision still lies with the Magistrate. With that said, livestock owners still invest their faith in the Legal Justice System, which has failed them in the past. They are tired of seeing criminals go scot-free, and waiting in vain to get justice. (Cases 1 and 2 were adjourned until April and May 2013). The livestock owners end up physically and emotionally drained, and frustrated that the courts of law are not delivering justice to them.

The views of stakeholder representatives from the GDAFF, Mopani District officials, GGM officials, and DoJ: GMC officials were gathered by the researcher. Eighteen (18) individual interviews were conducted with the identified stakeholders, covering each of the identified topics. The participants were identified through earlier contacts by cell phone, prior to the main meeting, or personal visits to the stakeholders’ respective offices. They were given details of the intended study, and offered an opportunity to contribute their views, either in writing, over the phone, or in person. Other individuals from relevant organisations were contacted, and asked if they would like to participate in the-said interviews, or suggest possible, relevant participants. It was explained to those contacted, or visited, that creative individuals were required for the KII,s, and that individual inputs were being sought, not the views of their particular organisations. A letter was, subsequently, sent to thank those who had provided their views. It was explained to the participants that the researcher was conducting an exploratory-descriptive study on perspectives in stock theft prevention in the GPA, Limpopo. They were asked for their views on the weaknesses of the Giyani SAPS STU and livestock owners’ strategies, in terms of: how they respond to stock theft; what modifications might be introduced to overcome these weaknesses; and, what might be ideal strategic interventions to improve the current investigation on, and detection system of, stock theft crime in the Giyani communities. They were reassured that no individual’s rights would be infringed
upon, and that a summary of the report would be available at the conclusion of the work. Their views are best illustrated in this chapter (Four), and Chapter Five of this study.

**Contributory factors to stock theft escalation in the giyani policing area**

In determining the major contribution to stock theft, this research question (What could be the factors contributing to the stock theft increase in the GPA?) received sufficient coverage from the study. The participants mentioned diverse, probable, causative factors to stock theft in Giyani. They believe that there is still a long way to go before the contributing factors can be positively addressed. The study found that one of the biggest obstacles to combating this problem was that many cases of stock theft perpetrated against the farming communities in Giyani, as well the community, in general, go unreported, due to misconceptions about: SAPS’ operational conduct; the illegitimate practices by butchery owners; the branding of livestock; and, leaving livestock unattended. The police determined that pro-active communication and intervention were essential. In co-operation with livestock farmers, and community structures, such as CPFs, and MCLF, the police need to develop a multi-faceted strategy to mitigate these challenges. It was then advised that livestock owners/farming communities count their livestock on a regular basis, brand-mark them, and ensure they are registered in the stock book, to ensure a proper investigative process, given that they are equally responsible for fighting stock theft crime, together with the Giyani SAPS STU, and the nearest police station, and satellite units. These findings demonstrate that it has become increasingly important for the police, and the livestock owners in the GPA, to further assess factors that contribute to stock theft, so as to determine the root causes of the crime.

Giyani residents of different economic backgrounds, and age groups, are currently experiencing stock theft. The common scenarios are stock stolen, either when grazing, or at night, when everyone is asleep.

The researcher found some of the contributory factors to stock theft in the GPA to include the following:

- In most cases, animals are stolen, not from villages, but from cattle posts, where they are guarded only by shepherds.
- Stock theft crime in Giyani is motivated by greed (illegal self-enrichment) for commercial purposes.
- Lack of proper protection of the kraals in the villages at night time enables stock to be taken from village kraals. Most of the kraals are designed in such a way that stock thieves have easy access to stock enclosures, as they are isolated from the families, built in the outside homes of livestock owners, or the main yard/surroundings. In addition, some kraals are built in the forest, with poor security.
- There is a strong belief that perpetrators are local people who collude with syndicates outside the villages under attack. Sometimes, villages are attacked, and all the stock is driven off.
- Muti is believed to be used by foreigner syndicates, in partnership with the locals, to steal the livestock.
In some cases, what is reported as theft is not theft. Because of customary marriages, relatives are custodians of their in-laws, if they are still young. This includes their possessions, such as stock, which are supposed to be returned to the children when they grow up. This is also the case when parents die, leaving young children behind. These children inherit the parent’s possessions, which are supposed to be looked after, on the children’s behalf, by relatives. However, in most cases, the adults decide to keep the assets for themselves. If the children, on reaching adulthood, try to claim their inheritance, the relatives report the assets as stolen.

Sometimes, people steal cattle to sell the meat, or simply because they dislike the owner, the stock is slaughtered. More information on exactly who the perpetrators, and the victims, are needs to be gathered.

Lack of reporting structures within the community (i.e., the police are not easily accessible to receive, or deal with, stock theft cases); thus, stock theft cases end up not being reported to the police.

The participants’ views, relating to what they considered the contributing factors to stock theft in the GPA were elicted by the researcher. Their perceptions appeared very one-dimensional, since they thought that stock theft was caused by the factors below, in order of prevalence:

- Slaughtering stock to sell to butchery owners: more often than not, offenders steal and slaughter cattle to sell to butchery owners to get fast cash for their survival. The perpetrators steal cattle from any place, and slaughter them. In most cases, butchery owners connive with the perpetrators (organised crime syndicates) to commit this crime;
- They do not register their livestock. The Gyianni SAPS STU does not know the exact number of livestock which the livestock farmers own;
- Delay by victims in reporting stolen stock;
- They do not brand-mark their livestock;
- They employ foreigners - this is in spite of the research conducted by IDASA and Afro-barometer which revealed that approximately 7 out of 10 South Africans do not trust foreigners. However, 36% of the respondents could not provide shelter for foreigners. However, 36% of the respondents would do all they could to stop foreigners starting businesses where they reside;
- Livestock owners do not look after their stock in a proper way. They let their stock crawl, stray, and wander around villages at night;
- Gyianni SAPS STU officers, and Justice Department officials, have, for long, been suspected of involvement in stock theft - meaning, the police are involved in this crime;
- The criminals are heavily-armed; and,
- Shortage of resources for community policing: Clothing; storage units; food for patrols; helicopters; horses; bullet-proof vests; sleeping bag; quad bikes; and, the appropriate vehicles (Gyianni SAPS STU) for conducting their work as quickly as possible.

Other motivating factors, as cited by the participants in this study, were, among others:

- Greed;
- Poverty - poor people resort to stock theft, because they want to get rich quick;
- Unemployment;
- Pride and Jealousy; and,
- Social and cultural ceremonies that required an animal to be slaughtered, especially by Indians and the locals at funerals and parties.

Other reasons given by the participants, in relation to why cattle are stolen in the GPA were:
Some of the suspects arrested for cattle theft have claimed that that was the only way they could put something on the table for themselves, and their families;

The employment of illegal immigrants and unregistered farm workers (Farmers continue to employ illegal workers with low wages, and this creates a challenge when investigating stock theft cases, as some workers are usually difficult to track down. It is a challenge, because, in some cases, farmers employ the same people who steal from them);

Due to the fact that the Greater Giyani Municipality have a high unemployment rate, this has forced local residents to steal;

Farmers must mark their livestock, and make them easy to trace (i.e., marking animals by means of hot-iron branding, freeze branding, tattooing, as well as ear tagging, even if ear tags can more easily be lost). Unmarked, stolen stock is very difficult to trace, and identify. It is also a challenge in court, because positive identification cannot be done beyond a reasonable doubt, if there’s no marking;

Due to the lack of regulation and registration of livestock, there is no proper monitoring of animals coming in from the villages of neighbouring districts;

No official or livestock farmers’ patrols - which promotes free and easy access into the GPA, resulting in the unsafe transportation of animals without valid veterinary permits;

There is no animal pound in Giyani for safe-keeping lost, or stolen, livestock for the rightful owners to identify them/come forward to claim them, and;

There are no specialised stock theft courts in the GPA, Limpopo Province.

Policing stock theft in giyani communities: The challenges

“Do the SAPS have adequate capacity to respond to the challenges implied by stock theft in the GPA? Why do they think so?” This was one of the questions posed to the participants. One participant had this to say:

“I have 25 years as a police officer and 12 years under Giyani SAPS STU as a Warrant Officer, through my years of experience I can tell you that the challenge brought by stock theft is most members of this unit are deployed in rural areas during the day, where stock theft is most problematic, and that is when the stock thieves are not operating. Climate change, such as drought which cause a lack of food and laziness to our rural people also pose a serious challenge, as during this time majority of us do not know the best way to make a living, poverty and hunger as poor people provide a market for cheap stolen stock even when they are not directly involved in theft can be cited as another challenge to this crime.” KII (Giyani SAPS STU Commander).

Staffing remains the major problem at the Giyani police station. The one main police station in Giyani is staffed by463 police officers, who have been assigned to all the units, with few active police reservists. The Giyani SAPS STU is only staffed by Seven (7) personnel; and, again, Giyani boasts Four (4) satellite police stations: Dzumeri; Makhuva; Bendstore; and, Muyexe, consisting of less than 15 officers per satellite (see paragraph 1.5 of chapter One).

The station is faced with serious challenges, such as (in order of importance):

- Lack of resources.
- Lack of manpower.
- Resistance to learning new approaches to policing. Most of the officers are Black African individuals, who have been working at the station for more than 10 years, and are not well-disposed to learning new practices to policing.
Giyani still has to be resourced for the four satellite stations, which fall under its jurisdiction, so as to have officials that directly deal with stock theft cases.

Allocation of resources is another challenge: the Giyani SAPS STU Commander indicated that, at present, the resources available met few of their needs. As the area is predominantly rural, with poor infrastructure, it makes it difficult for the police to get access to the communities, let alone deliver an effective service to the victims. The area is hilly, and the roads are not tarred, and are badly developed. This contributes to the frustration that the police experience with their limited resources. Key stakeholders, who were interviewed, also shared the same sentiments. At present, the police station is experiencing vehicle shortages; STU officers have to share the vehicles. However, the station was provided with cars in the previous financial years, but, because of poor infrastructure, and long distances, most of the cars were damaged during normal police work. Communication by telephone with the police is a significant problem, because there is only one telephone line in the CSC, and the two-way radios from the satellite police stations are insufficient to cater for their needs.

The police response to crime is also viewed by the participants as a serious challenge: it was indicated by a number of officers that it was difficult for them to respond to all calls, or incident reports, because of a lack of resources, and inaccessibility to some of the rural communities, as well as the manpower, thereof. There are a number of contributing factors impeding effective responses to calls, such as shortage of vehicles, and poor communication infrastructure. It was indicated that, in some instances, phones rang for about ten minutes without any police officer answering the calls. Of the reported incidents, the police can usually only get to the crime scene one to three hours after they may have been reported. The poor taking of statements by the police also leaves much to be desired. In addition, the GPA is marked by: poor roads leading to rural areas surrounding the inner city; unmarked animals, as the stock owners do not seem to know the procedure for obtaining the identification branding mark; and, irregular counting of livestock, as the majority of livestock farmers are illiterate and innumerate.

Others added the following:

“I do not think there is enough capacity to respond to the challenges. There are very few police officers within the Giyani SAPS STU, which makes it not capacitated enough to respond to the challenges of the day in so far as stock theft is concerned.” FGD 2 (Xikukwana local Faith-based organisation member).

“No we do not have the capacity to respond to the challenges as Giyani SAPS STU members are inadequate, the Satellite Unit as well does not have officials who are equipped to work stock theft. Another fact is we lack equipment and man power, such as vehicles, horses and bikes. This crime have to be challenged in the forest and the Giyani SAPS STU members are very few to be looking after or patrolling different grazing areas in 91 villages around Giyani. How on earth can 7 officials achieve that? The truth is we all want to work in the office and do office work rather to go to the bush, for example, during rainy season who can chose to work outside, wearing boots in a muddy area while patrolling. They are failing to introduce some sort of incentives to attract new recruits to this service.” FGD No. 1 (Local SAPS Officer)
“We are losing our livestock, and particularly cattle and goats because of the repeated attacks by stock theft syndicates. My biggest concern is that the alleged thieves enjoy impunity and, if they fall into the hands of the police, they are released in no time.”

FGD No. 3 (Xikukwana Village prominent livestock farmer).

“It should be said that the majority of farmers, especially emerging ones, are still reluctant to mark their livestock, because the markings make them easier to trace, if their animals cause accidents on national roads.”

KII (GDAFF official).

**Police corruption**

The high number of SAPS officers and employees still involved in corrupt, and fraudulent, incidents of crime, as well as the seriousness, thereof, is alarming, and unacceptable to the management of the SAPS. Not a day goes by without the media reporting on an incident, or incidents, of SAPS officers, reservists, or employees being arrested for involvement in criminal activities.

Mofokeng (2006: 34, citing Sherman, in Newham, 2002) is of the opinion that the task environment can be viewed as a second classic approach towards understanding and combating police corruption, besides the individual police member. This phenomenon tends to focus heavily on the environment in which police officers operate.

There are persuasive arguments presenting the view that this is the most important factor influencing a police officer’s behaviour. Much of what has been written tends to examine the relationship between the nature of the environment within which police officers work, and the extent to which corruption occurs. Newburn (in Newham, 2002, cited in Mofokeng, 2006: 34) went on to identify a number of ‘constant’ environmental, causal factors that affect the development of corruption. These include: low direct managerial visibility of police actions; low public visibility of many police actions; peer group secrecy; low status in society, due to low pay; and, frequent contacts with criminals with significant resources, who will attempt to influence the discretion of the police officers.

One of the most insightful perspectives on how the ‘task environment’ could lead to corruption comes from Peter Manning and John Redlinger’s (1991) paper, ‘Invitational Edges’ (cited by Mofokeng, 2006: 34). Manning and Redlinger explain how the policing of illegitimate markets, such as drug markets, positions police officers on the ‘invitational edge of corruption’: “The structural constraints of legally suppressed markets expose the agent to an accumulation of attempted influence. Because sellers want effective control over their markets, they must find ways to neutralise enforcement agencies. If they cannot avoid at least arrest and charge, and it is probable that eventually they cannot, and then they must attempt to gain favourable influence with agents,” suggest Manning and Redlinger (1991, in Mofokeng, 2006: 35).

Collusion between police officers and drug syndicates has been recorded in South Africa. In some cases, police officers are paid by syndicates, or drug dealers, to use their policing powers to undermine competition from other syndicates: “They [drug syndicate members] give information to corrupt members of SANAB (South African Narcotics and Alcohol Bureau) at the airport about a
consignment coming in from Brazil or Hong Kong. After the arrest is made, the dealer pays to have the seized illicit consignment released to them,” observes Thulare (1999, in Mofokeng, 2006: 35).

However, the 'task environment' takes on a more insidious form in South Africa. Not only do the police accept bribes for 'turning a blind eye' to illegitimate markets, but many police officers will deliberately exploit their powers over those who work in these markets, according to Mofokeng (2006: 35). In addition, the situation is similar, in the rural areas, where the practice of giving gifts to the police, in exchange for services, is also relatively common. According to Harris (2001: 22, in Mofokeng, 2006: 36), if a farmer was helped to recover livestock stolen in a case of stock theft, he will often hand something over to the investigators, maybe a goat, or half a sheep: “Task environment factors pose particular difficulties for police managers who wish to combat police corruption. In some cases the decriminalisation of certain activities can reduce the extent of police corruption, as was the case in the United States during the early 20th century when the prohibition of alcohol was lifted,” concludes Mofokeng (2006: 36, quoting Sherman, 1983: 374).

There will always be corrupt cops in various police forces around the world. It is an unfortunate thing, because honest and efficient police officers are often lumped together with those who damage the reputation of the whole service. Corruption is a big problem, but there are more committed and good SAPS officers than incompetent and corrupt ones. Having said that, enforcement agencies need to win back the public’s trust by deviating from such practices at all costs. Corruption needs to be eradicated, as a priority. The relevant training to address incorrect behaviour needs also to be assessed. Moves within the SAPS to address these problems include: the SAPS Integrity Framework (drafted in 2007); amendments to the disciplinary system; and, establishing a new unit to investigate police corruption (replacing the Anti-Corruption which was closed in 2007), as South African enforcement agencies seem to have more than their fair share of corruption (see below):

“... When we call them (the SAPS/STU members) they do not respond immediately, if they come, they can only do so after 4 hours. In some instances we go to the police station only to be told they are no vehicles to attend to us. However, the close villages to the inner city are the most problematic, villages such as Makosha (ward 14), Mavalani (ward 20) and Siyandhani.” FGD No. 2 (Makosha community leader).

**Allegations of SAPS and Department of Justice officials’ involvement in stock theft**

During the FGDs, it emerged that the police are alleged to be involved in stock theft in Giyani. As incidents of theft increase, some livestock farmers, officials at the DAFF in Giyani, as well as members of the public, said they knew those who are involved, but were afraid of victimisation. Some threatened to take the law into their own hands to protect their animals, as they did not know who to turn to, citing police involvement as very disturbing. The livestock farmers said they were under siege, and alleged that the police collude with criminals. One emerging farmer said he had lost all his cattle, saying 9 of his cows were stolen in January 1996, and no-one had been arrested. The majority of Giyani residents cite vigilantism as a solution to problems caused by stock theft.
We are intending to take the law into our own hands as the police have failed to help. It should be emphasized that stock theft in the area is a thorny issue in our area. Since the police are not coming closer to the affected area while our animals are stolen, slaughtered and sold.” FGD No. 3 (Makosha prominent livestock farmer).

Another participant added that the business sector and the public seemed not to understand how the Giyani SAPS STU operate, and what they could do about it:

“The police do not always co-operate when contacted to deal with stock theft cases. I admit that there is a disconnection between the law and its enforcement. The laws are partially effective in the sense that not all stock owners are aware of stock theft legislation or any mechanism to support and assist them in this crisis situation especially in the rural areas.” FGD No. 2 (Makosha local Faith-based organisation leader).

It also emerged from the focus group discussions that there were wider societal attitudes, which allow fraud to fester, and be tolerated. There are those who do not view fraud as criminal behaviour, due to the high level of unemployment, and some sectors of the community remain passive to it. Some idolised criminals as the “Robin Hoods” of their communities, distributing resources from the ‘haves’ to the ‘have-nots’. There are also some victims, who became complicit in a scam, but insisted they were not helping to facilitate the crime of fraud. Other victims admitted that it was their fault for falling for a scam, and for taking no action to report it. Indeed, the very word, ‘scam’, implies something slightly less serious than a crime.

This tolerance of the operations of fraud syndicates signals how collaboration was seen as ineffective by the FGDs:

“Livestock owners have more powers than they realise, particularly with the fact that livestock farming form part of their daily living, the majority of rural people still regard livestock as an important symbol of wealth. However, this is dented when the police criminality towards stock theft, it is instantly recognisable prevention of stock theft in Giyani remain a problem and a major problem is the Giyani SAPS STU is under staffed, they have inadequate equipment, the livestock farmers they do not take proper care of their stock, for example, brand making. The mentioned challenges serve as a catalyst for stock theft growth and they also form an inextricable part of stock theft prevalent in our area (GPA).” KII (DoJ: GMC official).

“So even before the debate about the police involvement to stock theft in Giyani, if they are involved at higher skill and this involvement is not carefully and accounted for, they will obviously be found guilty in the court of public opinion. The fact is it does seem clear that laws have indeed been broken by some of the SAPS members.” FGD No. 2 (Xikukwana local Faith-based organisation member).

Increased case workload, and the performance of the Giyani SAPS STU

During the FGDs, it emerged that the increased workload, due to a diversity of challenges, such as: staff shortages; a lack of skills; low morale; and, inadequate training, hamper the performance of the STU in adequately responding to incidents of stock theft within the GPA.

Participants were of the view that a variety of capacity challenges hampered the performance of the Giyani SAPS STU, and the coding of their responses showed that the following were being experienced as challenges in this unit:
Huge workload;
Poor investigation of stock theft cases;
Recruitment, skills development, and advanced training;
Lack of resources;
Giyani SAPS STU members are not professionally trained and dedicated; and,
The Giyani SAPS STU act in isolation (i.e., without other stakeholders) in approaching stock theft:

“...Giyani SAPS STU is understaffed and its members feel as if their workloads are too heavy and their time is spread too thinly. The truth is few are educated in within that unit, and then their skills are questioned. The unit is not recruiting young or retains the experienced ex-officials on the service to improve the quality of their investigation on continuous basis.” KII (GDAFF official).

“...more resources need to be introduced within the unit; mentorship programmes by the commander should also be introduced at all costs. They should change the format they are currently using by introducing benefits, recruiting suitable candidates to lessen the pressure (workload) and pay them better.” KII (Giyani SAPS STU Officer).

“We all know that the risks are high while conducting this job and the reward are minimal, this leads to bribery and bungling of serious stock theft cases. Therefore, top notch investigators need to be lured and retained in the service by proving better working conditions and salaries; investigators need to take control and accountability for what happens with their investigations.” FGD No. 1 (Local SAPS Officer).

This views of participants revealed that there was a serious skills-and-experience deficit within the STU to enable it to adequately respond to fraud syndicates. From these views, it seems as if some of the detectives are simply not adequately-trained to perform certain functions, such as profiling of Modus Operandi (MO). The implications for the SAPS are that it is vital for the management to facilitate, and support, continuous in-service training, so as to alleviate the skills shortage.According to Mofokeng (2010: 15, citing Van Vuuren, 1997; Schnonteich, 2001; 2002; & Minnaar, 2008), the huge workload carried by detectives make any proper and thorough investigation impossible. In support of this view, Minnaar (2008, in Mofokeng, 2010: 115) explains that a “heavy caseload tends to mean that detectives take shortcuts or simply mark docket as ‘undetected’, or ‘witness/es cannot be traced / found’, or ‘insufficient evidence available’ – all in an effort to reduce their caseloads.

Levels of communication and co-operation
The views, regarding the levels of communication and co-operation between the communities and the police, were sought, with the participants asked to elaborate on their responses. The majority of experiences detailed by respondents were viewed by the researcher as disturbing.

Judging by their responses, it seemed that communities were taking responsibility for their own protection, and becoming involved in CPFs, and a livestock forum in their communities aimed at searching for stolen animal, protecting the community, arresting thieves, and handing them over to the police, and/or recovering stolen animals. This, also, assists with police/community communication, as well as the arrangement of meetings to discuss stock theft problems, and the way forward. They also help the police to deal with stock theft. In addition, the police do not seem to be providing the required service against stock theft in the GPA:
“The level in question is very low because the SAPS they get low income, without the proper tracing of certain information they receive bribes while knowing the truth and in some instances they are afraid of their lives as their names protection is temporary. They normal think of what can happen to them after conducting a major arrest.” **FGD No. 1 (Local SAPS Officer).**

Another concerned local SAPS officer stated that:

“The Giyani SAPS STU give us the power to arrest thieves; give us equipments, such as guns, torches, as well as the means of communicating with the police, such as cellphones, engage with us in the newly formed livestock forum (i.e., MCLF) and offer training to our CPFs.” **FGD No. 1 (Local SAPS Officer).**

Furthermore, the following account attests to the claims above:

“A police officer who followed a suspicious Bakkie to the bush, only to receive from police station level asking him about his whereabouts and is he intending to do, he was reminded that by the time he checked out he stated that he was going home, only meaning he is off duty and he must go straight home and stop interfering into other people’s business, the misusing of state vehicle was also cited as the reason he must go home and stop following the Bakkie in question.” **KII (DoJ: GMC official).**

The second account is worth quoting more fully:

“A concerned community member reported a stock theft case at Giyani police station post witnessing cows being slaughtered in his neighbourhood. He managed to go back to the community to alert others, he was advised to call the CSC for help first and he did likewise but in vain. They then decided to go to the scene, while approaching the scene in question gun shots were heard only to scare them, with that they called the local police station to notify them that the thieves are heavily armed too. They were asked this question: Is there anyone among you who owns cattle? Their answer was no; that is when they were told to go to sleep, and leave the thieves to commence with their illegal operations.” **KII (DoJ: GMC official).**

**Inadequate collaboration and partnership amongst stakeholders**

When asked if the collaboration between the relevant stakeholders; namely: the Giyani SAPS, Giyani SAPS STU, Crime Prevention and Crime Intelligence, as well as various community structures, was adequate, in terms of combating stock theft in the GPA, the participants in all of the focus groups identified a wide range of problems which contribute to the problem of inadequate collaboration, and partnership. The most striking theme that emerged from most of the views expressed was that the key stakeholders in the response to this crime are acting in isolation. The major issues have been those of: enhancement of successful partnership between the-said parties; effective communication channels; engagement; the duration of investigations, and criminal proceedings, as well as the collaboration between the local SAPS and the general public.

It was clear, from their perceptions, that this challenge was crippling the performance of the Giyani SAPS STU; thus, negatively influencing how the public view the performance of the SAPS, in general. One focus group indicated that one of the reasons for a perceived lack of collaboration is that delimitations in the field of investigation and prosecution turned out to be very “unstable”, or, rather, specialisation, or better collaboration, between key stakeholders was not made an official prerequisite. For example, the police believe that they are capable of preventing stock theft, and do not want to involve the public in their efforts; thus, the community is also never informed of the crime situation, leading to a situation of the community structures not being involved in combating stock theft, and the
police being criticised for their inability to prevent the crime under investigation. To drive the point home, one participant had this to say:

“… due to the lack of collaboration between the SAPS and community structures, the police, in this case the STU find it difficult to determine policing priorities and plans relating to the solving of stock theft in Giyani. CPFs do not engage with the STU as it was supposed to be, their relationship is ineffective, no partner is satisfied in this regard, who on earth will be satisfied if the other partner does not co-operate to achieve the desired goals while in a relationship? Through effective collaboration collective responsibility, regarding stock theft, will amount to every person acting as a member of the SAPS, the member of the community, or the livestock, just to name the three.” KII (GGM official).

The literature review indicates that, to cement a true collaboration, all stakeholders must engage in true collaboration to identify, prioritise, and address problems facing a community. Research indicates that co-operation between the police, and some public authorities, is strictly regulated by the law. This is particularly true of co-operation with judicial bodies, and somewhat true of co-operation with attorneys-in-law, and communities. Co-operation with other public authorities, such as social centres, and non-governmental organisations, is not regulated strictly by law. Considering the fact that the police are, fundamentally, perceived as a force-based body, with the main task of pursuing perpetrators of crime, this seems somewhat understandable. Sadly, we can say that co-operation with local communities and social centres is more-or-less left to internal guidelines given to by management of the police, and is affected by the level of affection that these managers have for these two types of organisation (Gorenak, 2006: 416-424). From the analysis presented herein, it seems as if the co-ordination between relevant stakeholders is, indeed, not that adequate to wage war on stock theft in the GPA. It is the view of this researcher that the nature of the intelligence functions requires that the SAPS enter into partnerships with all relevant role-players, to complement their stretched human resources. While the SAPS have considerable opportunities for gathering and collecting information and intelligence, there are also large stores of data held by other public and private interests - all of which have a potential value for policing purposes. Working in partnership with others increases the number of potential sources of information. Indeed, there may be situations, in which a key stakeholder is the only possible source of a particular item of information. It would seem as if SAPS officers often feel more comfortable when they exchange information through personal, informal networks. It is often the case that informal contact is faster, and more efficient. However, there are inherent dangers in obtaining information without the safeguards, and checks-and-balances in the formal procedure, not least of which is the question of the admissibility of the information in court. An effective and properly functioning mechanism for exchanging information (especially within Giyani, and the neighbouring places) gives less cause for an investigator to “call a friend”, and allows that officer to act with confidence on the basis of information received. However, it is not always easy to establish partnerships with other role-players, as highlighted above. Sometimes, this is because there are legal constraints restricting the sharing of data (especially personal data), or because of concerns about one’s identity being disclosed by corrupt police officials.
For the purpose of ensuring the maximum sharing of intelligence information between role-players, critical information should be shared through collaboration, typically, firstly, within SAPS, as well as with a range of other organisations from the business sector, the general public, private security companies, to Non-Government Organisations (NGOs). These various relationships have different dynamics related to needs, responsibilities, and limitations on access to information. As such, the parameters of each formal partnership should be articulated in a formal partnership agreement.

STRATEGIES AND RECOMMENDATIONS
From the data analysed, it became clear that stock theft is high in the GPA, and the current preventative measures against stock theft in the area under study, and elsewhere, are slow to give dividends; thus, there is a long way to go to eradicate it completely. This suggests that the strategies implemented so far have not been successful. These inefficiencies should be corrected, and some other strategies that could be employed include:

**Improved resources, advanced training, and better education**

It is of the utmost importance that Giyani SAPS STU personnel be consistently exposed to relevant and advanced training that will develop their knowledge of investigations, and analytical skills. Both the local SAPS, at police station level, and satellite units, as well as the-said unit, to a certain extent, should be encouraged to share, and co-ordinate, their intelligence-gathering and analysis capabilities better, and establish a unified strategic view of the stock theft syndicates threat. In instances where there is a shortage of personnel at an STU, officers attached to the local police station, and its detectives service, who have successfully completed the course, must continue to support the STUs in their investigations – this arrangement will afford investigators at the local level an opportunity to become familiar with all aspects relating to the investigation of stock theft. STUs will, however, assist, where necessary. This would also ensure that the principle of “integrated approach” is maintained. Satellite police stations at identified areas should be established, and Giyani SAPS STU officers should investigate stock theft cases thoroughly, and arrest suspects. Experienced investigators should work closely with the novice ones, to bring them before the court, and they should be given more vehicles, and more training. Public educational awareness campaigns, and school programmes, should be introduced, as well. Furthermore, in an effort to take justice to the people, specialised stock theft courts should be set up in the GPA to add to the sole Magistrates’ Court in the area.

**Strengthening the enforcement response and reporting techniques**

The Giyani SAPS STU need to rise to the challenge of constraints on police resources, by developing innovative, partnership solutions with all relevant stakeholders. The Giyani SAPS STU should seek to
collate, and disseminate, good practices on the prevention, and disruption, of stock theft syndicates across the policing area. The policing area is too vast: 91 villages, in total, with only 7 officials to cater for them. Considering that most livestock are stolen at night, during the day on grazing land, and in the rainy/winter season by individuals and syndicates, who operate across Giyani as master minds, there exists the need to enable resources and personnel to meet the challenges of a rural area, such as: poor infrastructure, and lack of access to certain communities. The Giyani SAPS STU should be equipped with helicopters, horses, vehicles, quad bikes, and livestock owners and herd-boys should receive cellphones, for the former to do their work as quickly as possible, and for the later to report stock theft crimes quickly. This would be aimed at improving response times and efficiency, and reduce reporting costs on livestock farmers, community members, and other relevant parties. Thus, effective reporting mechanisms, and physical reporting at police stations and satellite units, should be encouraged.

**Collaboration between key stakeholders**

When asked whether the collaboration between key stakeholders, namely the Giyani SAPS STU, the Crime Prevention Unit members as attached to local police station, and community structures is adequate in the response to stock theft prevention across the surrounding communities in Giyani, the groups answered in the affirmative, with only some exceptions.

One of the Xikukwana Village rural FGDs had this to say:

“The SAPS and the livestock farmers had extensive discussions on how we are going to manage, combat and prevent stock theft in GPA.” **FGD No. 2 (Xikukwana community member).**

This statement led to the following positive responses by other members of the FGD:

“As a rural community, we have done very well in protecting and managing many stock thefts in our communities. We have created a high standard for ourself, and we want to maintain that, we have discussed the way forward. We have livestock to protect at all costs.” **FGD No. 2 (Xikukwana CPF leader).**

“No, we only rely on CPF for further assistance as the Giyani SAPS STU is very far to reach.” **FGD No. 3 (Xikukwana prominent livestock farmer).**

However, the Makosha village rural FGD said otherwise:

“Some of the SAPS and STU members they normal take bribes. Having said that; the biggest challenge is bribes, even if there is a problem, they will not tell the other legitimate colleagues as they are looking for the benefit, for example, buying of meat with cheap prices. Unfortunately, this crime happens during the night, rainy seasons and windy days in the absence of community members and in
some instances if a person can buy a cow illegal, they can provide such information but it is limited and does not help the much.” FGD No. 2 (Makosha community member).

This comment led to further discussions on the matter by other focus group members, who cautiously shared support for the view that the said collaboration did not exist:

“No, I have not seen a change thus far.” FGD No. 2 (Makosha community leader).

“In principle they (STU) seem to be working, but we are not receiving the required help from them.” FGD No. 3 (Makosha village prominent livestock farmer).

In a positive conclusion, the KII with the Giyani SAPS STU Commander yielded the following comment:

“I personal had a very productive operational meeting with the leadership of MCLF. We really wanted to reinforce the commitment between us and the livestock farmers on curbing stock theft across our communities. SAPS remain a very important stakeholder to the livestock farmers. We have adopted a zero tolerance towards stock theft.” KII (Giyani SAPS STU Commander).

CONCLUSION

Overall, the purpose of this study was to gather data on, and determine, perceptions on stock theft prevention in the GPA, Limpopo Province; thus, identifying the challenges that face the Giyani SAPS STU while highlighting the contributive factors thereof, given its inadequate approach in dealing with stock theft in the surrounding areas. Livestock remains an absolute credit to Giyani families, villages across the policing areas, and the municipality, at large. However, the capacity of the police, livestock farmers, and community members, to respond to stock theft crime, was also put under severe scrutiny. Given the limitations of the research, the study was not aimed at developing a new model on stock theft prevention methods, but, instead, amongst others: it sought to provide an overview of recent trends in factors contributing to stock theft crime within the GPA. We should also note that though the study reveals contributing factors in this regard in the GPA, there are still some challenges owing to the unidentified contributing factors to be addressed, such as: inadequate resources (i.e., personnel; sophisticated equipment – horses, helicopters, etc.); negligence by livestock owners; and, the backlog of cases caused by poor investigation. The handling of stock theft cases remains a challenge.

References


